

14 February 2020

Subject: SSAC2020-06: SSAC Public Comment on the Initial Report of the New gTLD

Auction Proceeds Cross-Community Working Group

Background

This Public Comment provides consensus comments from the ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC) on the Initial Report of the New gTLD Auction Proceeds Cross-Community Working Group (CCWG).¹

Per its role,² the SSAC focuses on matters relating to the security and integrity of the Internet's naming and address allocation systems. This includes operational matters (e.g., pertaining to the correct and reliable operation of the root zone publication system), administrative matters (e.g., pertaining to address allocation and Internet number assignment), and registration matters (e.g., pertaining to registry and registrar services). The SSAC engages in threat assessment and risk analysis of the Internet naming and address allocation services to assess where the principal threats to stability and security lie and advises the ICANN community accordingly. The SSAC has no authority to regulate, enforce, or adjudicate.

Context

SSAC has a dual role in making these comments as both an Advisory Committee (AC) that has actively participated in the New gTLD Auction Proceeds CCWG and as the AC chartered to advise the ICANN Board, ICANN Organization, and ICANN Community on matters of Security and Stability. The outcome and ultimate success of the New gTLD Auction Proceeds we believe will impact the ability for the ICANN Organization to support and promote its core commitment to preserve and enhance the administration of the Internet identifiers (not just the DNS but also IP addresses) and the operational stability, reliability, security, global interoperability, resilience, and openness of the DNS in a fiscally responsible and accountable manner at a speed that is responsive to the needs of the global Internet community.

General Comments on the Report

The SSAC recognizes the considerable efforts of the New gTLD Auction Proceeds CCWG to provide guidance for a framework to disburse the funds generated from new TLD auctions. The SSAC does not object to any of the 12 recommendation in the report but feels that it is

SSAC2020-06

¹ See https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/proposed-new-gtld-auction-proceeds-final-23dec19-en.pdf

² See ICANN Bylaws Section 12.2 (b)

unfortunate that they were not able to be more specific, especially in regard to the exact mechanism to be employed. Nevertheless, the SSAC supports the finalization of this report following the Public Comment period so that the work of the CCWG can be concluded.

The SSAC has made comments in recent correspondence and consultations with the ICANN Board that have delved into process issues that have negatively impacted community-wide reviews and cross-community working groups. The SSAC notes that, based on observations of this CCWG provided periodically by the group along with inputs from our designated representatives who participated on it, the length of time taken for the CCWG to conduct its work is regrettable and many processes were not optimal and should not be repeated. This falls into the pattern of other volunteer work groups gathered from across the ICANN community that are driving issues like volunteer burn-out, ICANN Org overload, and recommendations that are not crisp and actionable. The SSAC will look to incorporate further details and examples of the issues identified in this particular CCWG in future comments on ICANN cross-community efforts of all types that are currently being discussed within the ICANN community.

Recommendation 1: The SSAC recommends that, following the completion and submission of the CCWG's report, the next step in the process be to have an outside expert with a demonstrated track-record in designing funding programs review the report, comment on its finding and recommendations, and use it as a basis to inform the Board on the design of a grant making process for the auction proceeds that implements grant making best practices. This step should be undertaken before the Board formally considers the CCWG's Final Report as its advice would assist the Board in its consideration of the CCWG recommendations.

The SSAC wishes to thank the New gTLD Auction Proceeds CCWG for the opportunity to comment on their report.

Rod Rasmussen SSAC Chair

SSAC2020-06