

RSSAC Meeting Minutes

3 December 2019 | 15:00-16:30 UTC

Attendance

Cogent	Paul Vixie
DISA	Kevin Wright, Ryan Stephenson
ICANN	
ISC	Fred Baker, Jeff Osborn
NASA	Keith Bluestein, Tom Miglin
Netnod	Lars-Johan Liman
RIPE NCC	Kaveh Ranjbar
UMD	Karl Reuss
USC ISI	Wes Hardaker
US ARL	Howard Kash, Ken Renard
Verisign	Brad Verd, Matt Weinberg
WIDE	Hiro Hotta

Liaison to the Board	Kaveh Ranjbar
Liaison to the CSC	Lars-Johan Liman
Liaison to the RZERC	Brad Verd
Liaison from the SSAC	Russ Mundy
Liaison from the IAB	Daniel Migault
Liaison from the IANA Functions Operator	Naela Sarras
Liaison from the Root Zone Maintainer	Duane Wessels

Staff Andrew McConachie, Carlos Reyes, Danielle Rutherford, Ozan Sahin, and Steve Sheng

Action Items from this Meeting:

- Staff to publish the minutes from 6 November 2019 teleconference.
- Staff to send published minutes from 6 November 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.
- Staff to send out notifications to new RSSAC Caucus members.
- Andrew McConachie to get the RSSAC Statement on Threat Mitigation for the Root Server System published after the conclusion of ICANN Board review period.
- Andrew McConachie to send a note to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list in order to solicit comments on the Proposal for Future Root Zone KSK Rollovers public comment proceeding.
- RSS Metrics WP Leadership to unlock the metrics document to enable comments and replies on the document.

- Staff to send out a doodle poll to see availability of RSSAC Caucus members for two calls in January in order to update RSSAC002 and RSSAC023.
- Brad Verd to send an email to NIST endorsing the SSAC comment on Post Quantum Cryptography Algorithms on behalf of the RSSAC. Andrew McConachie to inform RSSAC Co-Chairs upon the submission of the SSAC comment to NIST.

Call to Order

Fred Baker called the meeting to order at 15:00 UTC.

Roll Call

Fred Baker conducted a roll call. Quorum was present to conduct the meeting and to take formal action, if necessary.

Agenda Review

Fred Baker reviewed the agenda. Steve Sheng wanted to add an agenda item regarding staffing changes.

Administration

Approval of Minutes

The RSSAC approved the draft minutes from the 6 November 2019 teleconference. Motion by Wes Hardaker and second by Ryan Stephenson.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to publish the minutes from 6 November 2019 teleconference.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send published minutes from 6 November 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.

RSSAC Caucus Membership Committee Update - Recommendation of Candidates

Matt Weinberg provided background on the application processes and Membership Committee recommendations of the following two candidates;

- Ali Hussain
- Joey Salazar

The recommendation from the Membership Committee was to accept both two applicants. There were no objections or abstentions to accept Joey Salazar's application. Motion by Jeff Osborn and second by Lars-Johan Liman. There were no objections or abstentions to accept Ali Hussain's application. Motion by Ryan Stephenson and second by Wes Hardaker.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send out notifications to new RSSAC Caucus members.

Vice Chair Election

Fred Baker noted that no nominations were received during the nomination period. As per RSSAC Operational Procedures Fred asked whether there were any nominations to be made during the teleconference. Paul Vixie wanted to nominate Fred Baker. Fred replied that according to the RSSAC Operational Procedures a Chair could not serve as the Vice Chair at the same time.

Ryan Stephenson noted that technically Brad Verd could serve as the Vice Chair as he had never held a title for that position. Fred Baker explained that there would be two ways to look at the situation; one was that RSSAC had created a new position with the transition from two Co-Chairs model to Chair/Vice Chair model, and the other one was that the new Vice Chair position was a continuation of the Co-Chair role for which Brad Verd had been serving for two terms.

Fred Baker brought up that Lars-Johan Liman had suggested that Brad Verd's term as the Co-Chair would become Vice Chair and extended for a year. Fred added that his own suggestion was to accept Brad as Vice-Chair for two years in order to avoid a situation where the Chair and the Vice-Chair would be elected at the same time without having an offset.

Steve Sheng noted that staff would recommend against creating a one-year term for the Vice Chair role. Kaveh Ranjbar indicated his agreement with Steve Sheng. Brad Verd noted that he would accept the nomination and be happy to serve as the RSSAC Vice-Chair. Lars-Johan Liman discussed that the concerns raised for one-year term were fair and he was happy to go with the two-year term suggestion. Ryan Stephenson agreed with Lars-Johan Liman.

Daniel Migault suggested updating RSSAC000 in order to clarify the relevant part of the document.

The RSSAC elected Brad Verd as the Vice Chair for a two-year term starting by 1 January 2020. Motion by Lars-Johan Liman and second by Ryan Stephenson.

RSSAC Statement on Threat Mitigation for the Root Server System

Andrew McConachie discussed that the document had been stable for over a week and asked if there were any final comments about the document. RSSAC approved the RSSAC Statement on Threat Mitigation for the Root Server System. Motion by Wes Hardaker. Second by Lars-Johan Liman.

ACTION ITEM: Andrew McConachie to get this document published after the conclusion of ICANN Board review period.

Public Comment - Proposal for Future Root Zone KSK Rollovers

Andrew McConachie pointed out the public comment proceeding and wanted to know if the RSSAC was interested in providing input for it.

Lars Johan-Liman recommended the RSSAC, preferably, or the RSOs to respond to this public comment proceeding. Russ Mundy encouraged the RSSAC to provide input and reported that SSAC would provide a response before the 31 January 2020 deadline. Naella Sarras encouraged RSSAC to provide its input highlighting that a group response would carry more weight than individual responses.

Fred Baker suggested reading the proposal and sharing feedback on the RSSAC Caucus mailing list in order to formulate a group response. Fred also invited Russ Mundy to check with the SSAC Chair and Vice Chair to see if there were any sensitivities of having these exchanges on an open public mailing list. Kaveh Ranjbar pointed out the alternative option of having a closed work party in order to develop the response to this public comment proceeding.

ACTION ITEM: Andrew McConachie to send a note to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list in order to solicit comments on the public comment proceeding.

Work Items

RSS Metrics Work Party Update

Duane Wessels reported that the work party's work had advanced through face to face meetings at ICANN66 and IETF 106. Duane noted the outstanding issues on the document which had stabilized and been locked for edits for a while. Duane pointed out the next work party teleconference on 17 January 2019 and encouraged members to share comments on the mailing list. Fred Baker suggested unlocking the document so that work party members could see the comments and reply to them. Duane Wessels agreed with the suggestion.

ACTION ITEM: RSS Metrics WP Leadership to unlock the document to enable comments and replies on the document.

Modern Resolver Behavior Work Party Update

Fred Baker reported that this work party would close upon the submission of a report by Paul Hoffman.

RSSAC002, RSSAC023, RSSAC026 Updates

Andrew McConachie noted that the group made it about halfway through RSSAC002v4 at ICANN66. Andrew added that staff would send out a doodle poll to determine call time to continue updating RSSAC002v4.

Andrew acknowledged the substantial input from Root Server Operators (RSOs) to update their relevant sections in RSSAC023v2. Andrew added that there would be a separate call in January to update this document. Ryan Stephenson and Jeff Osborn reported that updates from their respective RSOs would be submitted shortly.

Andrew explained that RSSAC026v2 was in a holding pattern until the metrics work was done.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send out a doodle poll to see availability of RSSAC Caucus members for two calls in January in order to update RSSAC002 and RSSAC023.

Brad Verd encouraged RSO representatives to share their updates to RSSAC023 for their individual identifiers with staff if they had any.

Reports

Co-Chairs

Fred Baker and Brad Verd had no update.

ICANN Board

Kaveh Ranjbar reported that the groups contributing representatives to the RSS Governance Working Group (GWG) started their selection processes.

CSC

Lars-Johan Liman reported that there had been some work underway to establish a metric for label generation for IDN tables which were handled by the IANA. Lars-Johan Liman added that this was a substantial change which required approvals from the ccNSO and the GNSO. Liman explained that these approvals were received and they were at the final phase of this work.

RZERC

Brad Verd reported that the group had its first meeting in a while in Montreal during which the challenges of appointing representatives and their terms were raised. Brad explained that support staff was in the process of reviewing these terms and start dates to come up with suggestions to address those challenges.

SSAC

Russ Mundy reported that SSAC was working on submitting comments regarding Future Root Zone KSK Rollover proposal and the Post Quantum Cryptography Algorithms (PQC). Russ wanted to know if there was an interest in RSSAC to join SSAC on the PQC comment. Brad Verd suggested RSSAC to endorse the SSAC comment. Fred Baker agreed with Brad Verd. Duane Wessels noted that he read through the SSAC document carefully and he thought the document was good to go.

Brad Verd then suggested that the Co-Chairs, if the RSSAC was ok with it, could send an email to the mailing list and endorse the SSAC document on PQC comment. Fred Baker invited

RSSAC members to read through the document and share their comments by the following day so that Brad Verd could send the endorsement e-mail. RSSAC approved this approach. Motion by Fred Baker and second by Jeff Osborn.

ACTION ITEM: Brad Verd to send an email to NIST endorsing the SSAC comment on Post Quantum Cryptography Algorithms on behalf of the RSSAC. Andrew McConachie to inform RSSAC Co-Chairs upon the submission of the SSAC comment to NIST.

IAB

Daniel Migault reported that the IAB was in the process of selecting its representatives to the RSS Governance Working Group (GWG).

IANA Functions Operator

Naela Sarras reported that FY21 IANA Budget public comment proceeding had closed the previous week with several comments. Naela continued that staff would prepare a public comment report and IANA Budget would move onto PTI Board approval as the next steps in January 2020. Naela added that IANA was working on the implementation of the Label Generation Rules metrics as had been mentioned earlier by Lars-Johan Liman. Naela lastly noted that IANA staff would be operational during the holiday period and IANA would send out notifications on operation hours in the holiday period and how to contact IANA during this period.

Root Zone Maintainer

Duane Wessels had no update from a Root Zone Maintainer perspective. On the other hand Duane reported that there had been progress on having RSOs share their contact information with IANA.

Any Other Business

Steve Sheng noted that his team had begun a transition process where Carlos Reyes would step away from day to day operation of the RSSAC and Ozan Sahin would fulfill that role. Steve noted that Carlos would be the primary staff support for the GWG work starting soon. Steve thanked Carlos for his service for the RSSAC. Fred Baker joined Steve in thanking Carlos for his service and welcomed Ozan Sahin and Danielle Rutherford.

Adjournment

The RSSAC concluded the meeting without objections.