

## Root Server System Governance Working Group

Teleconference 61 | Thursday, 10 August 2023 | 22:00 UTC

### ATTENDANCE

#### **RSS GWG**

Luis Diego Espinoza	ccTLD registries
Wes Hardaker	RSOs
Hans Petter Holen	RSOs
Hiro Hotta	RSOs
Lars-Johan Liman	RSOs
Jeff Osborn	RSOs
Kurt Pritz	gTLD registries
Ashwin Rangan	RSOs
Jim Reid	IAB
Karl Reuss	RSOs
Brad Verd	RSOs
Paul Vixie	RSOs
Duane Wessels	Liaison from the RZM

#### **Excused**

Kim Davies	Liaison from the IANA
Peter Koch	ccTLD registries
Ken Renard	RSOs

#### **Absent**

John Augenstein	RSOs
Edmon Chung	Liaison from the ICANN Board (Alternate)
Geoff Huston	IAB
Christian Kaufmann	Liaison from the ICANN Board
Barbara Schleckser	RSOs
Suzanne Woolf	SSAC
Hanyu Yang	gTLD registries

#### **Observers**

Robert Carolina	RSOs
David Conrad	RSOs
Joseph Hayes	RSOs
Erum Welling	RSOs

#### **ICANN staff support**

Carlos Reyes

## MINUTES

### **Call to Order**

Brad Verd called the teleconference to order at 22:03 UTC and reviewed the proposed agenda. There were no objections to the agenda.

### **Administration**

Carlos Reyes introduced Joseph Hayes who is replacing John Augenstein from DISA.

Carlos Reyes reviewed the draft minutes of teleconferences 59 and 60. There were no objections to publishing the draft minutes.

ACTION ITEM: Carlos Reyes to publish the approved minutes on the workspace.

### **Designation and Removal of RSOs**

Brad Verd noted that candidate principle 2.100 about the purpose of funds received from an RSO designation required more discussion. Jim Reid stated that funds to the RSOs for any purpose will already have conditions. Wes Hardaker provided the example of the IETF where funders do not expect engaging in IETF work. Robert Carolina cautioned against relying on the principle to solve all problems. Candidate principle 2.100 is intended to be a guardrail on spending funds from RSO designations. There will also be a forthcoming discussion about who is a stakeholder of the RSS. Jeff Osborn provided the context that ISC opposes auctions. Lars-Johan Liman suggested this situation would only apply to application fees and advised to not give the candidate principle more weight than that. Brad Verd asked Jim Reid if his concerns had been addressed, and Jim Reid asked if the candidate principle was necessary. Robert Carolina explained that candidate principle 2.100 is about a narrow issue of preventing perverse incentives. Jim Reid appreciated the clarification and asked for more detail in the interpretation notes.

Candidate principle 2.210 about voluntary resignation of an RSO received unanimous support. Brad Verd noted the comment from Jim Reid about each RSO having a resignation plan and the comment from Kurt Pritz about a framework for how to address the rare event of a mass resignation. Ken Renard commented that any resignation should not negatively impact the security, stability, and resilience of the RSS.

### **Separation and Balance of Powers**

Brad Verd read candidate principle 1.10 about financial self-determination. Robert Carolina explained that this candidate principle had been discussed and clarified with ICANN. Ashwin Rangan agreed. Duane Wessels asked how candidate principle 1.10 does or does not conflict with candidate principle 3.80, but the matter had been overcome by previous discussions. Comments from Wes Hardaker had also been addressed.

Brad Verd reviewed candidate principle 1.20, which received unanimous support. Ashwin Rangan noted the proposed edits were for specificity. Paul Vixie asked about potential ambiguity in the text, and Brad Verd explained that the concern had been previously addressed. Robert Carolina suggested further changes to the edits from ICANN.

Brad Verd noted that the candidate principle 1.30 about the distinction between prescriptive and executive authority received unanimous support. Kurt Pritz noted that the processes should be separate, but there could be overlap in the people serving in these roles.

Brad Verd read candidate principle 1.40 about RSS policy as collaboration between RSOs and non-RSO stakeholders. Brad Verd also read Geoff Huston's comment about lack of definitional clarity and proposed ensuring alignment between the candidate principle and interpretation notes, which addressed the comment from Peter Koch as well. Kurt Pritz asked for a better term than "strong voice".

ACTION ITEM: Brad Verd and Carlos Reyes to find all instances of "strong voice" and propose a new term.

Brad Verd noted that candidate principle 1.50 about not having one controlling entity over RSS policy development had one objection.

Brad Verd read candidate principle 1.60 about accountability. John Augenstein asked who would perform the review. Wes Hardaker noted that there are already accountability mechanisms within ICANN. Kurt Pritz highlighted the challenges with existing ICANN reviews. Lars-Johan Liman agreed that who performs the review is an issue for the future.

Brad Verd noted the unanimous support for candidate principle 1.70 about transparency.

Brad Verd read candidate principle 1.80 about flexibility. Kurt Pritz stated that RSS governance should not deviate from the principles. Brad Verd explained that the candidate principle intends to allow for change. Lars-Johan Liman asked about the limitation of changes due to technical necessity because there could be other drivers for change. Robert Carolina noted that the principles exist to aid the development of governance documents. The principles will become a document of historical interest. Jim Reid suggested further edits, and it must remain possible to change the RSS. Robert Carolina disagreed because that expands the purpose of the candidate principle, which is focused on RSS governance.

### **Any Other Business**

The GWG reviewed the schedule of upcoming teleconferences. Jim Reid asked about the ICANN78 schedule. Lars-Johan Liman asked about future workshops. Brad Verd explained that the GWG would decide about another workshop in between ICANN78 and ICANN79. There were no additional agenda items.

### **Adjournment**

Brad Verd adjourned the teleconference at 23:01 UTC.