ATTENDANCE

RSS GWG
Fred Baker RSOs
Wes Hardaker RSOs
Hiro Hotta RSOs
Geoff Huston IAB
Peter Koch ccTLD Registries
Kurt Pritz gTLD Registries
Ashwin Rangan RSOs
Ken Renard RSOs
Karl Reuss RSOs
Tripti Sinha Liaison from the ICANN Board
Ryan Stephenson RSOs
Brad Verd RSOs
Paul Vixie RSOs
Duane Wessels Liaison from the RZM
Suzanne Woolf SSAC

Excused
Jim Reid IAB
Kim Davies Liaison from the IANA
Lars-Johan Liman RSOs

Absent
Luis Diego Espinoza ccTLD Registries
Akinori Maemura Alternate Liaison from the ICANN Board
Kaveh Ranjbar RSOs
Barbara Schleckser RSOs
Hanyu Yang gTLD Registries

Observers
John Augensteins RSOs
Robert Carolina RSOs
Erum Welling RSOs
Paul Hoffman ICANN org
David Olive ICANN org
Wendy Profit ICANN org
Carlos Reyes ICANN org

MINUTES

Call to Order
Brad Verd called the teleconference to order at 22:03 UTC and reviewed the proposed agenda. There were no objections to the agenda.
Administration
Carlos Reyes reviewed the draft minutes for teleconference 47 on 11 August 2022. There were no objections to publishing the draft minutes.

**ACTION ITEM:** Carlos Reyes to publish the approved minutes on the workspace.

Carlos Reyes reviewed the schedule for the planned GWG sessions during ICANN75 and provided an update on planning for a GWG workshop in late November/early December 2022.

Defining RSS Capture
Carlos Reyes reviewed the proposed definition of root server system (RSS) capture:

RSS capture is a situation where a single entity or a group of entities intentionally exert undue, external influence and control over the decision-making processes or service (e.g., data content modification) of a critical mass of RSOs to the disadvantage of the RSS and against the principles of RSS governance.

Carlos Reyes also provided a summary of the discussions of the small team, which consisted of Luis Diego Espinoza, Hiro Hotta, Peter Koch, Lars-Johan Liman, and Paul Vixie. Peter Koch noted that the small team discussed the concept of intent and the risks associated with different scenarios such as organizational capture without operational impact. Brad Verd asked about the content modification example. Paul Vixie mentioned that another long-standing concern has been different understandings of public interest. Brad Verd stated the importance of root server operator (RSO) independence and shared acquisitions as another example.

Geoff Huston asked if the proposed definition has been applied to the current situation, particularly with regard to the influence of national interests. Wes Hardaker noted that the Internet Architecture Board has a statement on the need for a global, unified namespace. Peter Koch said the small team discussed the chain of command issues with three United States (US)-based RSOs and the regulatory pressure from the European Union.

Fred Baker cited the US Securities Act of 1933 definition of control. Robert Carolina asked why “to the disadvantage of the RSS and against the principles of RSS governance” and the concept of intent were included in the definition. Furthermore, Robert Carolina cautioned that including intent is a risk because capture should be avoided regardless of intent. Suzanne Woolf agreed that it makes sense to refine the issue of intent. Robert Carolina stated that having multiple legitimate interests is better than centralized control. Geoff Huston suggested that the scope of the discussion should also consider political independence. Paul Vixie agreed that this topic should be considered.

Brad Verd asked why the number of RSOs necessary to maintain RSS operations is out of scope. Peter Koch explained that the small team did not want to define a threshold for capture. Paul Vixie advised the GWG to proceed carefully because the world will want to understand what happens in the event of capture and who has the responsibility to respond.

Hiro Hotta led the GWG through three hypothetical scenarios. Wes Hardaker asked about the risk of financial capture from one source. Robert Carolina distinguished capture by a single source of funding from capture by a controlling organization. Ashwin Rangan stated that diversity in financial, political, and technical domains serves as a counterweight to capture. Brad Verd stated that governance implies some level of capture is acceptable. The GWG should define those checks and balances.
Any Other Business
There were no additional agenda items. The next teleconference will be Thursday, 8 September 2022 at 22:00 UTC.

Adjournment
Brad Verd adjourned the teleconference at 22:57 UTC.