

## Root Server System Governance Working Group

Teleconference #12 | 6 August 2020 | 22:00 UTC

### ATTENDANCE

#### RSS GWG

|                     |  |
|---------------------|--|
| Luis Diego Espinoza | ccTLD Registries Representative        |
| Ted Hardie          | IAB Representative                     |
| Hiro Hotta          | RSO Representative                     |
| Geoff Huston        | IAB Representative                     |
| Lito Ibarra         | Alternate Liaison from the ICANN Board |
| Lars-Johan Liman    | RSO Representative                     |
| Kurt Pritz          | gTLD Registries Representative         |
| Tripti Sinha        | Liaison from the ICANN Board           |
| Brad Verd           | RSO Representative                     |
| Duane Wessels       | Liaison from the Root Zone Maintainer  |

#### ICANN org

Paul Hoffman  
Becky Nash  
Carlos Reyes  
Mary Wong

#### Apologies

Naela Sarras                      Liaison from the IANA

#### Absences

|               |                                 |
|---------------|---------------------------------|
| Joe Abley     | SSAC Representative             |
| Peter Janssen | ccTLD Registries Representative |
| Hanyu Yang    | gTLD Registries Representative  |

### MINUTES

#### Call to Order

Ted Hardie called the teleconference to order at 22:04 UTC and reviewed the proposed agenda. There were no objections to the agenda.

## **Administration**

Carlos Reyes reviewed the draft minutes of teleconference #11 on 23 July 2020. There were no objections to publishing the minutes.

ACTION ITEM: Carlos Reyes to publish the approved minutes on the RSS GWG workspace.

## **Checkpoint Discussion**

Ted Hardie opened the discussion with a review of rough consensus items and areas that still need work.

- Kurt Pritz noted the use of “altruism” was misplaced. Ted Hardie clarified that the intent is to distinguish between the financial model of the current model and the financial model of NewOrg.
- Ted Hardie agreed with a comment from Brad Verd: None of the work undertaken will change how the root zone is updated, maintained, or distributed to the root servers by IANA. Duane Wessels asked to add the root zone maintainer as well.
- Kurt Pritz expressed concern about the feasibility of NewOrg to hold contracts/MoUs. Ted Hardie noted that there are significant details for the RSS GWG to consider and then seek legal advice and community review.
- Kurt Pritz also had a comment about the composition of the Strategy, Architecture, and Policy Function. Ted Hardie noted that there is agreement that the SAPF should be a community-based group with more definition to come in future discussion. Kurt Pritz clarified that his intent is to manage the expectations of the ICANN community about which stakeholders will be represented in the SAPF.

ACTION ITEM: RSS GWG to define the community composition of SAPF.

- Brad Verd highlighted that NewOrg as a contract holder deviates from the model of Public Technical Identifiers (PTI), which does not hold any contracts.
- Ted Hardie reviewed the comment from Brad Verd about referring to a “cure” period rather than “remediation” period as part of the Performance Monitoring and Measurements Function.
- Brad Verd asked the RSS GWG to consider revisiting the different proposals (a Root Server System Supporting Organization, a direct contract with PTI, or NewOrg) to develop a hybrid model. Ted Hardie responded that there was very little support in the RSS GWG for having PTI take on the role of contracting with Root Server Operators. Ted Hardie polled the RSS GWG. Kurt Pritz stated that the preference is the NewOrg model because it provides the most flexibility. Luis Diego Espinoza suggested incorporating some elements of the Supporting Organization proposal.

ACTION ITEM: RSS GWG to focus on bringing the best characteristics of the Supporting Organization and contract-with-PTI models into the NewOrg proposal.

Kurt Pritz recalled the intervention from Xavier Calvez about the NewOrg model, noting that it could result in less autonomy for the Root Server Operators. Ted Hardie stated that Finance Function should not influence the technical set up of root service or turn into favoritism for a particular Root Server Operator(s). Paul Hoffman noted that NewOrg and SAPF will establish two areas where autonomy is relevant: when a Root Server Operator is designated and when a Root Server Operator accepts funding.

ACTION ITEM: RSS GWG to consider different types of autonomy in its discussions.

Mary Wong noted that ICANN org is ready to engage with the RSS GWG on its proposal at the appropriate time.

Kurt Pritz stated that NewOrg would benefit from a relationship with ICANN to facilitate the flow of funds, noting that there implications and consequences for the Root Server Operators that receive funding. Geoff Huston and Ted Hardie agreed that it seems obvious that if Party A enables Party B, then Party A should be financially recompensed. Kurt Pritz stated that TLD registries fund their own operations, regardless of their relationship with ICANN. Ted Hardie clarified that an enterprise is responsible for funding DNS services to ensure its zone is available. This has not been the case for the root. Paul Hoffman questioned the logic of the example.

Geoff Huston suggested the principle of following the money: When someone pays for a gTLD they pay ICANN not the IANA. Whoever aggregates the money to determine what is and is not in the zone has a logical role in funding root service. This is consistent across the industry. Kurt Pritz stated that a model where registrants fund the Root Server System is emerging, but it may not be in the best interest of domain names. Ted Hardie asked what alternative models could exist if it is not based on queries or registrants. Kurt Pritz stated that the current model is the third approach. Luis Diego Espinoza suggested that all beneficiaries of the Internet as a system and the DNS as a system could support funding.

### **Any Other Business**

There were no additional agenda items.

### **Adjournment**

Ted Hardie adjourned the teleconference at 23:04 UTC.