RSSAC Meeting Minutes
6 August 2019 | 14:00-15:30 UTC

Attendance

Cogent	
DISA	Ryan Stephenson
ICANN	Matt Larson, Terry Manderson
ISC	Fred Baker, Jeff Osborn
NASA	Tom Miglin
Netnod	Lars-Johan Liman
RIPE NCC	Kaveh Ranjbar
UMD	Karl Reuss
USC ISI	Wes Hardaker
US ARL	Howard Kash
Verisign	Brad Verd, Matt Weinberg
WIDE	Hiro Hotta

Liaison to the Board	Kaveh Ranjbar
Liaison to the CSC	Lars-Johan Liman
Liaison to the RZERC	Brad Verd
Liaison from the SSAC	Russ Mundy
Liaison from the IAB	
Liaison from the IANA Functions Operator	Naela Sarras
Liaison from the Root Zone Maintainer	Duane Wessels

Staff   Kim Carlson, Andrew McConachie, Carlos Reyes, Ozan Sahin, and Steve Sheng

Action Items from this Meeting:
- Staff to publish the minutes from 26 June 2019 teleconference.
- Staff to send published minutes from 26 June 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.
- Matt Weinberg to draft a note to be sent to inactive RSSAC Caucus members for the RSSAC's review.
- Steve Sheng to share the IETF Supported Travelers Funding Guidelines on the RSSAC mailing list.
- Upon the release of edits to ICANN Bylaws by the Legal, Carlos Reyes to come back to the RSSAC for sign-off.
- Ozan Sahin to reach out to Paul Hoffman to schedule the next work party meeting.

Call to Order
Fred Baker called the meeting to order at 14:00 UTC.

Roll Call
Fred Baker conducted a roll call. Quorum was present to conduct the meeting and to take formal action, if necessary.

Agenda Review
Fred Baker reviewed the agenda and there was no objection or requested additions.

Administration

Approval of Minutes
The RSSAC approved the draft minutes from the 26 June 2019 teleconference.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to publish the minutes from 26 June 2019 teleconference.
ACTION ITEM: Staff to send published minutes from 26 June 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.

RSSAC Caucus Membership Committee Update
Matt Weinberg provided background on the application processes and Membership Committee recommendations of the following two candidates;
- Michael Casadevall
- Katsutoshi Ishisoko

The recommendation from Membership Committee was to accept both two applicants. There were no objections or abstentions to accept these applications. Motion by Brad Verd and second by Lars-Johan Liman to accept both candidates.

Matt Weinberg also presented the results of a review of how engaged the RSSAC Caucus members have been since 2014. Matt explained that the review looked at whether the RSSAC Caucus members participated in any of the RSSAC Caucus meetings & work party meetings or contributed to any of the RSSAC publications. He concluded that approximately one third of the RSSAC Caucus members have not done anything in these areas. Matt committed to draft a note to be reviewed by the RSSAC and then sent to inactive RSSAC Caucus members.

ACTION ITEM: Matt Weinberg to draft a note to be sent to inactive RSSAC Caucus members for the RSSAC's review.

RSSAC Caucus IETF Supported Travelers Funding Guidelines
Steve Sheng provided a background on the current selection process for the RSSAC Caucus IETF supported travelers to attend even numbered IETF meetings. He explained that staff had drafted guidelines for this process to address the criticism received on the current process, as requested by the RSSAC Administrative Team. Steve introduced the suggestion to have three priority levels, the requirement to complete a request form, and submission of a trip report, as outlined in the draft guidelines.

Wes Hardaker indicated his concerns about subjective vs objective measurements in the selection process. Russ Mundy, joining by phone only, asked for clarification on whether the draft guidelines suggested that work party co-chairs could nominate funded travelers. Steve Sheng committed to circulate the draft guidelines on the RSSAC mailing list, receive comments for a week, and give another week for this document to be stable followed by a potential vote via the mailing list.

ACTION ITEM: Steve Sheng to share the IETF Supported Travelers Funding Guidelines on the RSSAC mailing list.

ICANN Bylaws Article 12 Edits

Carlos Reyes provided a background on the topic and reminded attendees of the ICANN Nominating Committee (NomCom) Review 2 – Recommendation 9 which gave the RSSAC Liaison to the NomCom voting privileges and, in turn, required edits to Article 12 of the ICANN Bylaws.

Carlos reported back to the RSSAC on his meetings with the ICANN Legal on this matter. He explained that there was no action to take for the RSSAC at that point. Carlos committed to report back to the RSSAC once the ICANN Legal put together a package of the edits to the ICANN Bylaws.

ACTION ITEM: Upon the release of edits to ICANN Bylaws by the Legal, Carlos Reyes to come back to the RSSAC for sign-off .

Carlos also flagged that the adoption of the Chair & Vice Chair model in the RSSAC Operational Procedures had triggered another bylaw change which initiated a public comment proceeding. Carlos noted that this public comment proceeding was closed the previous week and received two supportive comments. Carlos added the expectation was that the ICANN Board would accept the changes in their upcoming workshop.

Lars-Johan Liman asked whether SSAC had a discussion on the voting privileges of the SSAC Liaison to the NomCom and had any pushback. Russ Mundy responded saying his recollection was that the SSAC would take a position consistent with the NomCom2 Review Recommendation 9.

Ryan Stephenson asked whether the NomCom appointed directors to the ICANN Board and the Public Technical Identifiers (PTI) or just the PTI. Carlos Reyes confirmed that NomCom appointed directors to the ICANN Board as well as to the PTI. Fred Baker wanted to know the expectation on when RSSAC would need to take an action. Carlos responded that the timeline was driven by the NomCom Organizational review and to the extent possible staff would make sure that timeline aligned with the deadlines for voting items within the RSSAC.

Fred Baker asked RSSAC members if there were any comments about the redline version created at ICANN65 in Marrakech. There were no comments. Brad Verd wanted to know why RSSAC could not vote on this redline version during the teleconference. Carlos Reyes responded that he did not think RSSAC should vote on it until it has been vetted by ICANN Legal.

Lars-Johan Liman added that "ICANN Bylaws Article 12 Edits" was not marked as a voting item on the agenda.

RPKI Impact

Terry Manderson presented a slide deck on the potential impacts of the Resource Public Key Infrastructure (RPKI) to the Root Server System. Terry identified some scenarios where one or more RSO's routing announcements might be dropped by transit providers and others.

Lars-Johan Liman asked what would happen if two RIRs announced conflicting ROAs. Terry responded that he was not sure but if there was one announcement that was valid it should win the race.

Terry Manderson listed some questions and opened it up for discussion. Wes Hardaker commented that RPKI was designed to prevent a form of attack which RSOs have traditionally not worried about much, hostile takeover of the routing space. Wes added that the up and down sides of the RPKI system and it's validation would affect every net block, not just RSOs.

Russ Mundy suggested that a fairly thorough risk-benefit analysis should be conducted with respect to the issues Terry identified.

The RSSAC then discussed whether it would make sense to file an internet draft with IETF sidrops describing the problem and proposing a solution, upon Fred Baker's suggestion.

Brad Verd thanked Terry Manderson for the presentation. Brad suggested that the conversation would continue through sidrops mailing list and be brought back to the RSSAC if members thought RSSAC should be commenting on something.

October 2019 Workshop Planning Update

Ozan Sahin provided background information on the selection of the workshop location. Ozan reminded the RSSAC members to complete a google form by Friday, 9 August if they were interested in receiving travel support to attend the October 2019 workshop.

Brad Verd added that the workshop would take place at Verisign facilities this time.

Work Items

RSS Metrics Work Party Update

Duane Wessels gave a summary of the RSS Metrics work party meeting that took place in Montreal at IETF 105. Duane reported that the work party agreed to focus on service level aspects only. Duane added that the work party also agreed to not have supported metrics. Duane noted that the work party would have standing bi-weekly calls every other Thursday moving forward.

Modern Resolver Behavior Work Party Update

Fred Baker explained that this work party was largely a conversation between Paul Hoffman and himself as there had been no contributions from anybody else. Fred added that Paul got stuck since he did not have IPv6 in the lab he was working.

Fred Baker asked Ozan Sahin to work with Paul in order to schedule the next work party meeting for any time before 27 August 2019.

ACTION ITEM: Ozan Sahin to reach out to Paul Hoffman to schedule the next work party meeting.

Reports

Co-Chairs

Fred Baker and Brad Verd had no update.

ICANN Board

Kaveh Ranjbar had no update other than pointing out the ICANN Board workshop in September.

CSC

Lars-Johan Liman reported that CSC did not have any meetings in July. Liman added that the CSC Chair Byron Holland decided to step down from his role at the end of his term and the CSC was looking for a new Chair.

RZERC

Brad Verd had no update.

SSAC

Russ Mundy noted that there would be comments provided in response to the "Evolution of the RSS Governance" public comment proceeding.

IANA Functions Operator

Naela Sarras pointed out that Kim Davies was holding a webinar with community members on the budget consultation for the Public Technical Identifiers (PTI) on 13 August.

Root Zone Maintainer

Duane Wessels had no update.

Any Other Business

Fred Baker reminded the RSSAC that the next RSSAC monthly teleconference would take place on 3 September and run by Brad Verd.

Adjournment

The RSSAC concluded the meeting without objections.