

UA EAI WG Meeting

08 February 2022

Attendees

Seda Akbulut
Abdalmonem Galila
Ejikeme Egbuogu
Jim DeLaHunt
Mark Datysgeld
Mark Svancarek
Nitin Walia

Meeting Recording:

<https://icann.zoom.us/rec/share/psLTNZtZnpTSWjIQKn7zT7mQFwztXu3uDeGg5BWXSeKXowuZC9R9ADjpzi0o7b3D.xeVuucuumrXMrbdQ>

Agenda

- 1) Welcome and roll-call
- 2) Reviewing the [Self-Certification Guide](#)
- 3) AOB

Meeting Notes

Mark started the meeting by stating the agenda and mentioning the meaning of the self-certification guide. He gave a short definition of it that it's a self-certification guide for providers developers, who are developing libraries, people who sell products, people who provide online services.

Discussion started with classification of MDA.15 as gold or platinum. Jim explained that it has 2 categories as follows:

- a) Software with globally inclusive mailboxes with difficult administrative rights
- b) Software with globally inclusive mailboxes with simple administrative rights

Jim said that the first one is gold and the 2nd one is platinum. So, we should mention Gold/Platinum in the table for this. This has been addressed in the MDA.17 discussion by Nitin.

For MDA.16 Jim had a confusion about “select command.” So, he shared that he would look it up and share its classification.

For MDA.17, Mark mentioned that it will also be Gold/Platinum. Nitin commented that this new terminology of “Gold/Platinum” can confuse the hierarchy of the document. As previously it was decided that “Gold or higher” covers platinum. Mark and Nitin discussed how this confusion can be cleared. So, they decided to add Gold one with * in square brackets. “*” can be explained at the top of the MDA table as “Must be available to be enabled by an admin for GOLD or higher; Must be enabled by default or by any novice user in a simple UI for Platinum”.

Through MDA.15 to MDA.23 the level is split into two sections for Gold and Platinum. With an explanation for “*”. (This was undone afterwards.)

MDA.21 was about creation of the mailboxes. Mark suggested voting on its classification. Jim and Abdalmonem voted for Gold/Platinum and Nitin voted for Platinum. So, Jim and Nitin discussed who can create new mailboxes on the gold rated IMAP server. Question was is it restricted to only admin.

Jim provided the link to IMAP Specification:

<https://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc9051.html>

IMAP Specification, 6.3.2 “SELECT Command”. “The SELECT command selects a mailbox so that messages in the mailbox can be accessed.”

After checking the IMAP specs, Jim shared that MDA.21 to MDA.23 should be platinum. IMAP spec appears to agree with MDA.21 being platinum as “CREATE command” talks about using IMAP to create mailboxes, but does not conflict with mailboxes being created via a difficult admin interface. IMAP server would be rated gold and MDA.21 would not apply to that product, because it does not support the create command.

For MDA.24 Abdalmonem shared that it should be silver or higher, Mark agreed with him on this. MDA.25 to MDA.29 resembled MDA.24 and everyone agreed those to be silver or higher as well.

Mark Datysgeld asked about the difference between the IMAP and POP. Mark Svancarek shared that we should think of them as mostly analogous that for a capability that exists in an IMAP likely a similar capability exists in POP and they should be graded along the same scale. Jim also gave a fair difference by stating

the mail server example of IMAP and POP. It concluded that IMAP functionality works on the server and POP works on the local environment. Jim and Mark then discussed the testing framework difference between the two. For the tester we'd have to run a suite of IMAP commands tests, and then they would also have to run an additional suite of POP tests, and if the software only supported one or the other, they wouldn't have to run both.

For MDA.30. It was decided that it is silver.

For MDA.21: Jim provided information that IMAP spec appears to agree with MDA.21 being platinum: "6.3.4. "CREATE command" talks about using IMAP to create mailboxes, but it does not conflict with mailboxes being created via a difficult admin interface. <https://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc9051.html#name-create-command>

Jim shared bad news about IMAP definition of mailbox. In IMAP spec terms, "mailbox" means a user-created folder to sort messages within the messages of a single email address. Email clients may use the word "folder" for what the IMAP spec calls "Mailbox". This is different than the group handled. Our table uses the term "mailbox" in the IMAP sense in MDA.15 through MDA.23.

We replaced "Mailbox" with "Folder (IMAP "mailbox")" in MDA.15 through MDA.23.

MDA.21 is changed from Platinum to Gold. So, that discussion started on how folders get created on the local system and on IMAP server If the mailbox is created as Unicode. It was decided that these need to be looked up again this, in addition to the following statement:

** Also explain "IMAP mailbox" is defined differently than used elsewhere. In IMAP spec terms, "mailbox" means a user-created folder to sort messages within the messages of a single email address. Email clients may use the word "folder" for what the IMAP spec calls "Mailbox".

For MDA.30 to MDA.32 it was decided that these are silver.

MDA.33 and MDA.34: We deleted these as they say not recommended to implement. It was decided that there is no harm in deleting these.

MDA.33	POP LANG capability is advertised	Not recommended to implement	If the software supports POP, then when a client requests a listing of server capabilities with the CAPA command, the listing returned by the server responds
--------	-----------------------------------	------------------------------	---

29

			should include LANG. These add no practical value, and there is no need to implement.
MDA.34	POP LANG command is accepted	Not recommended to implement	If the software supports POP, it should accept the LANG command and activate the requested language in the session. Because the set of supported differs between applications, this test case should use a language that is known to be supported by the software so that an -OK response can be expected (since an -ERR response may indicate that the language was not supported, but may also indicate that the command was not understood).These add no practical value, and there is no need to implement.

Renumbering was done here. MDA.35 became MDA.33.

For the new MDA.33 Jim shared that STLS command is not compatible with UTF-8 according to specs. So, it should be silver or higher.

Jim provided another useful reference, RFC 2683 “IMAP4 Implementation Recommendations”, September 1999. <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2683>

Spec of UTF-8 in POP3 “Post Office Protocol Version 3 (POP3) Support for UTF-8” <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc6856/>

MDA.34’s description is confusing and long. This has been revised to make it easy to understand for the reader. We will complete this part next week.

Abdalmonem suggested making MDA.33 as “Must be Silver”, instead of “Must be silver or higher”. This has been also added as a suggestion inside the document to be discussed next week. As for gold and platinum it should accept the secure connection with UTF-8 command. So it should be only silver.

Nitin explained to him the meaning of the term “silver or higher. Even if you are claiming yourself as platinum then also you need to qualify silver and gold conditions.

Next meeting: 15 February 2022 UTC 1530 -1630

Action items

No.	Action Item	Owner
1	Review Abdalmonem's suggestion on MDA.33	All
2	Complete MDA.34 and continue from here onwards	All
3	Connect "***" to MDA.15 through MDA.23. ** Also explain "IMAP mailbox" is defined differently than used elsewhere. In IMAP spec terms, "mailbox" means a user-created folder to sort messages within the messages of a single email address. Email clients may use the word "folder" for what the IMAP spec calls "Mailbox".	All