

---

YESIM NAZLAR:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the APRALO monthly call taking place on Thursday, the 4th of July 2019, at 0600 UTC. On our call today on the English channel we have Satish Babu, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Maureen Hilyard, Prateek Pathak, Ali AlMeshal, Amrita Choudhury, Shreedeeep Rayamajhi, Lianna Galstyan, Namrata Khetrpal, Tom Dale, Amir Qayyum, Jahangir Hossain, Kaili Kan, Aisyah Shakirah Suhaidi, Nadira Al-Araj, Hanan Khatib, Winthrop Yu, and Yeseul Kim.

We have received apologies from Holly Raiche and Justine Chew. From Staff we have Silvia Vivanco and myself, Yeşim Nazlar, and I will be doing call management for today's call. Just a kind reminder, please remember to state your name for transcription purposes. And now I would like to leave floor back to you, Satish. Thank you very much.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks very much Yesim. This is Satish for the record. Welcome to everybody on this call today. This is a June/July call of APRALO. We have a bunch of items in today's call, so let's get started. The membership pipeline, currently we are waiting for some feedback on three individual member candidates. That should be sorted out shortly and we will be admitting them before the next meeting. Yesim, can you scroll down slightly, I'm having difficulties with my computer for the agenda. So, we will now move on to Agenda Item 3, which is the At-Large Review Implementation. We go over to Maureen.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

MAUREEN HILYARD: Are we looking at the At-Large Review Implementation? What are we looking at? Sorry.

SATISH BABU: That's right, you're looking at the ARIWG.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Cheryl Langdon-Orr for the record, I'm stalking Maureen. Sorry, Satish, I'll just jump in and save Maureen while she's getting herself organized.

SATISH BABU: Go ahead Cheryl.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you very much. As those of you who were at the last meeting or available to listen to the brief update that was given on the At-Large Review Implementation Working Group during the Marrakech meeting, you will be aware that just before the Marrakech well in time for our deadline, the ARIWG, the working group presented to the Organizational Effectiveness Committee the first of its six monthly interim reports recognizing that the full time course can run over a couple years, our own milestone planning goes out for 24+ months, but this was the first of our six month reports that went in.

In that report and perhaps Staff could put a link to that document in our chat for reference's sake, we're pleased to say that we were able to report progress, almost complete, if not totally complete on a couple

---

items, some significant, by significant Maureen mentioned by 80% or higher levels of completion on more than a third, and about another a little less than a third, so around a quarter of the particular recommendations, implementation is kicking up in the 25% to 40% mark. The only one that is particularly lagging behind in 10-15% mark which is of course absolutely reasonable and perfectly understandable, is the one relating to metrics, because of course the metrics need to come out of the other implementations. So, that's one that follows.

I'm pleased to report that significant progress has been reported. We have had in addition to that report that I believe the ARIWG working group will be aware of as of today's date, where apparently the Organizational Effectiveness Committee needed a little glossary, and Jean Baptiste out of MSSI put together a little glossary which will become Appendix #2. It has about 16 or perhaps 20 terms, very complicated things like ALAC, ARIWG, cross community working group. We will be convening another meeting of the Review Implementation working group probably within the next 10 days I think, if not, somewhere around the 14-day mark. And other than that, I think that's it. Thank you, Satish.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you Cheryl. I do not have anything else to add, except that we can certainly thank Cheryl for the magnificent work that she actually did on this particular report. She was the mastermind behind it. I think too that it really did show that working together, we did a great job. So thank you very much for anyone who actually contributed to this. It

---

really does make us look good, and Cheryl did a really good job to make us look good. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Great, thanks Maureen, and thanks very much Cheryl for the work on this report. I think it is perfectly on schedule and on track. So, congratulations to both Maureen and Cheryl for having completed this work. We will now move on to Agenda Item 4, which is the ALAC Policy Update. I think Holly is on leave for the call, so we have Maureen and Kaili. Over to you Maureen for the policy update.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you. With regard to what we've been doing recently, of course, Marita did a fantastic job on the Evolving ICANN's Multistakeholder Model; Marita and Greg Shatan, actually. So, that has gone through, and it's really good. I had people take note of the summary because they give a really good introduction to what the statement is all about, and if you want to read the full one, it's on the policy page. But it's really good that you actually read up on them and find out more about what is ALAC's thinking around a particular issue. And especially this particular one, the multistakeholder model, which of course Brian Cote during Marrakech and in Kobe where he started, he's been working on that and using the information that has come from the various constituencies to get feedback from the constituencies to develop the new model that they're working on.

Okay, so there are a few comments that we're going to have to make decisions on and statements about. There is a CCWG meeting weekly if

---

anybody wants to join in. We're still working on the streamlining organizational reviews which Jonathan and Olivier are down as the pen holders, but I'm not quite sure if they're doing it, they'll probably end up having to do it. And of course the governance of the root server system. The root server is of course a very important part of our system, so therefore it's governance, which Bastiaan has taken responsibility for, and he's been on me for a while too, so I hope we can find some time to work on that.

For these particular comments, if you have a look on the policy page and you want to learn more about what it is that they're actually asking for comments about, do check through the policy page and do find out more and if it's of interest, it's really good if you do that background reading and then you might be able to make a comment on it. Okay, that's my dish, Cheryl may want to add something to this.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:

Cheryl Langdon-Orr for the record. Very briefly, just regarding the Evolving the Governance of the Root Server System, some of you will remember, I believe it was two ICANN meetings back, the document was published, looking at how the root server system is going to be reinventing itself away from the very autonomous mechanism that was loosely tied to ICANN, to a far more traditionally designed and very well designed, in my biases, model that was enshrined and entrenched with ICANN far more similarly to other parts of the ICANN infrastructure.

This is very important and should have great interest to some of you, in as much as it takes away a number of risks, it allows for a predictability

and a longevity in how in the future the root server system is likely to be collaboratively and cooperatively managed and allow for forward looking planning which is kind of important for the stability of the system we're all committed to. It is not a difficult read, and so I would just suggest that if you click on the link and you read the document, if may be that if nothing else we simply make a supportive comment. But one of the few things that was a little bit unstructured and ad hoc in our system is being tidied up. Don't be put off by the boring name, it's actually a good read. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks Cheryl and thanks Maureen for the policy update. Are there any questions? I'd just like to remind everyone that the CPWG meeting is weekly and anyone who wants to learn more can join the call. We now move on to Agenda Item 5, the APRALO update. First is the update on the elections that were just held during May and June. It's over to Silvia for this agenda item.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Hello Satish, hello everyone, thank you very much. So, the positions that were open for renewal this time were the ALAC member and it was Maureen Hilyard who was eligible for reappointment, and she won by acclamation. We also had the APRALO Vice Chair, Lianna, who was also eligible for reappointment and she won by election after a vote. Then the selection of the ALAC delegate to the NomCom for a one year term, the person recommended by APRALO was Amrita Choudhury, and she was recommended by acclamation as well. So, we congratulate all of

---

---

you and we are looking forward to working with you. The positions are going to be renewed at the end of the annual general meeting in the Fall in Montreal. That's all, thank you. Satish over to you.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks Silvia. Congratulations to Maureen and Lianna who have been elected. So the leadership team is somewhat changed slightly with the induction of the Amrita. At the same time I'd like to place on the record, although the NomCom is further down the list, I'd like to place on record Nadira's excellent work as the NomCom on behalf of all of us. So, thank you Nadira, thank you for all the contributions and we hope to see you even more active in the policy areas as we go forward.

The next is a quick update on the Marrakech meeting, ICANN65. The formal post meeting report will be published shortly by ICANN, at which point we will circulate it. But otherwise, very quickly, the ICANN65 meeting was actually a very interesting meeting, it was a policy forum. APRALO had all other ALAC members and from the leadership team. Unfortunately, both Ali and Lianna could not participate, but there were several fellows from the region, and we had good participation in several sessions. Particularly important for us was the APRALO hot topics, which had a fairly significant presence during the meeting, including a kickoff with ALAC. The APRALO leadership development was another interesting session. ATLAS III was also covered. Plus the regular ALAC sessions.

Some of the new areas included the emerging identified technologies, DNS/STP and DNS/TLS, both of which had, it was kind of a hot topic for

the meeting. Then we had some talk about the next round of GTLDs, no formal announcements, but ICANN did have a session where they explained how they were preparing for this in case the community decides to go ahead. There were lots of discussions on EPDP Phase II, the joint ALAC/NCUC session which has been happening for the last several meetings.

We had a briefing on the ICANN [inaudible] community which I found personally very interesting because I had no clue it is so complex. We had the policy workshops, geo names, ICANN policy development, cybersecurity, et cetera. We also had sessions on At-Large implementation outreach and engagement and also planning for ICANN66, which of course is a big for thing for us because of ATLAS III. So that is roughly a very quick update on what happened at ICANN65. The more formal report will circulate shortly after we get it from ICANN. Does anybody want to add on, anyone who attended want to add on anything to this?

MAUREEN HILYARD:

If I might must mention, the ICANN65 blog site that NARALO has put together, and it's a great little select compilation of reports that various members from At-Large have brought on these sessions that took place during ICANN65. So, if you want to have a look at it, do so. [Icannatlarge. blog.](#)

SATISH BABU:

Right, thanks Maureen for mentioning that. That's actually a very interesting experiment wherein volunteers were roped in to report on

---



each session and in the end the whole thing was compiled as a document. Now this is very handy for referring back to it, like for example we might have ICANN in our own community and this kind of thing becomes very handy for looking back on what really happened there. Eduardo and Glenn had jointly proposed this whole thing. So I suggest that all of you take a look, maybe Staff can circulate the link or put it into chat here so everyone can see it.

Next item on the agenda is introducing our new APRALO Individual Member Representative. As you are aware, we had elections and the initial candidate who was elected had stepped down, citing personal reasons, so we had gone to the next person who had the next highest vote, and this is Hanan Khatib who is on the call, and I would like to request Hanan Khatib to speak to us for a couple minutes on where she is from and what her background is, and what plans she has for the individual membership of APRALO. Over to you, Hanan.

HANAN KHATIB:

Hello everybody, this is Hanan Khatib for the record. I'm really happy to be selected as an individual member and I hope that I will serve this position very well. For my plans, I'm planning to create a small database for all the individuals. So I would like to know where can I get all the names and emails and contact information. So I will create a small database for all the members and collect what topics they would like to discuss or they would like to make their voices known to the management of the ICANN. And of course we will have a mailing list for us and we will put some of the management on the list also to know and to monitor what we are discussing. This is for the beginning what

---

---

I'm thinking of. I hope that everything will be okay, this is what I can say.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks Hanan for joining us today. For the list of individual members, Staff will be able to help you, please contact Silvia or any other Staff members. Right now we have Silvia and Yesim on the call, you can start with them. Good luck with the database, we all look forward to seeing this, if you need more information. I know that Agenda Item #8 we have another individual member who is actually proposing policy intervention. So I'm sure individual members can be very active. And we are there to support anything else that you might have questions or doubts on, any of the leadership team members would be happy to help you out. So, looking forward to working with you. All the best in your work.

HANAN KHATIB:

Okay, thank you very much, thank you all. And I might need your assistance or some of the management members, so we will be in contact.

SATISH BABU:

Thank you. Does anybody want to make any other point for Hanan? Alright, we now move on to Agenda Item 6. It is an update on ATLAS III. Over to you, Maureen.

---

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you Satish. Okay, so, ATLAS III, it was really quite an interesting time for ATLAS III in Marrakech. One of the very first days of which involved the selection committee meeting at 6:30 in the morning, it was our first opportunity to get together and make sort of like the final decisions on the final traveler's list and we were really happy to be able to succeed. Who we select we're going to put online and so that everybody could find out whether they had been selected or not, you know, not long after, the first few days, we just need to do a fair amount of checking. And when we went to put the list online, we found that the page wasn't GDPR compliant and it had to go to ICANN Legal and they had to put the right words on that page to make the list legitimate.

So what's happening at the moment is that everyone who is on the list has been informed and they now have to give their permission to have their name published on that list. It's quite interesting because we've got several pages with people's names on them and I'm now quite sure how they manage those sorts of lists. So for ATLAS III at least, we're going to be GDPR compliant and if you have been accepted to be a traveler for ATLAS III, would you please make sure that you let them know that you agree, that you're going to come for a start, and that you agree to have your name listed, made public, it would be very nice if you could do that. I think one of the important things about the At-Large Summit, now that the travelers have been identified, is that there is going to be a certain degree of preparation that will be done up until Montreal.

I don't think it's going to be as onerous as perhaps the preparation that you had to do before you could actually apply. That was really

important, though, because we needed to have a benchmark. And so as we move into Montreal, there's going to be a little bit more preparation that needs to be done by people who have actually been selected as a traveler. There are going to be people who will be wanting to join the ATLAS program, as well, who are already sponsored travelers, so they don't need ATLAS III funding, they're already being sponsored by ICANN or some other person, and they want to be part of the ATLAS III program. Anyone who joins the ATLAS III program is going to need to sign a contract. Not only is there work to be done up until Montreal, there's going to be a considerable amount of work around developing understanding and skills related to being part of the development discussions.

And then following ATLAS III, there is going to be some other work involved, as well. These haven't been finalized yet but you will be notified about those. But it's just that the extra people who aren't ATLAS III travelers who want to join in, may also have to participate. The program is going to be quite intensive, and they don't want to have to stop and start, explaining to people what it is that we're going to be doing. If you want to be part of the ATLAS III program you actually have to join beforehand. So the people will be notified more about this, it's just that we're just trying to make sure that when the ATLAS III is in action in Montreal that everyone is totally engaged in the activities and not having to worry about the prep stuff.

So that is about as much as I know at the moment. Congratulations to those from APRALO who made the list. I have a feeling that all those who applied made it, so that's good. Do take note of the fact that as others mentioned in the chat, getting a visa, Montreal is just a little bit

---

---

down the track, so if you need to get a visa, it's really important to start now. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks Maureen. Yeah, visa could be a problem especially for some of the countries, so the letter is very important. Are there any other questions from anyone? The floor is now open.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:

Cheryl Langdon-Orr for the record. Not a question, but a comment. I know there is a number of the travelers on this call. I think what's important to recognize is that the sponsored travelers for this very peculiar version of an ATLAS which is very much stepping up to leadership training and development linked absolutely with the implementation requirements and some of the recommendations out of the At-Large Review process that we've just emerged from and are now implementing.

I think it's important that people manage their expectations properly and understand why they will be asked, if not required, to agree to making certain commitments, and that is of course to do the preparatory work to ensure that when they meet and gather in Montreal that they are well prepared and able to get engaged fully and effectively in the program that's being developed by the groups and volunteers that are working on that, but also that they're committing to continue work and to have performance in work as leaders, as people stepping up to leadership within their regions in the At-Large structures, et cetera, or just in policy development throughout ICANN, that they are

going to step up and perform and not just suddenly disappear until the next time travel opportunities are offered. Dare I say that's a criticism I could make of a significant number of previously funded travelers to the last few ATLAS's. So, that's not going to happen this time.

And it is important to understand that will be a challenge for some people, to realize that they are being expected to make undertakings, to meet that undertaking, and to recognize that their performance and their development are of various skill sets, who then are carefully being observed, not in any way to be any sort of barriers to improvement, but quite the opposite. To identify the particular skill sets, experiences, techniques and talents that are amongst that group so that then with coaching and support, and perhaps even mentoring at some point, they can be developed into top class leaders. Just wanted to put that quite clearly to APRALO, because I expect moaning and groaning and bleating from some members of other RALOs, and I sincerely hope that our RALO as the intelligence, integrity, and maturity to see the wisdom in that way forward. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks Cheryl. I think that is a very important aspect that we have to keep in our minds, that there is a set of expectations from the travelers both during and after the ATLAS III meeting. And people who can fulfill those expectations should really be traveling, even if they are selected. I just wanted to ask Maureen if there is any help desk for ATLAS III that people email if there is any query. What is the recommended way to ask questions.

MAUREEN HILYARD: That is a very good question, Satish, and I'm not quite sure whether we actually have a help desk set up, but it's a good idea, and I will discuss that with Staff, and we'll get back to you.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Maureen. So we will now move on to the next item on the agenda which is #7, Regional Updates. Actually I don't need six minutes, I just need one minute. This is regarding two events that are taking place in our region this month. The first will be APSIG 2019 which is happening next week in Bangkok. Some of our community members are attending this program. The other is a very important program for our registry, this is the APriGF 2019 which is to be held 16-19 July in Vladivostok Russia and several of us from APRALO are participating this, including Maureen, Lianna, and myself. This is a very broad event, and given the fact that it's in Russia for the first time, we expect that it will be very interesting for us. We have another linkage with APriGF because we are seeking to co-locate our general body with the regional meeting sometime in the future, and this was the recommendation from the At-Large Review. And currently we are discussing with ICANN Staff as to when they can make a location for APRALO.

We now move to Agenda Item #8, which is the Member of the Month, and Lianna will be the speaker today, over to you Lianna. Lianna are you muted?

---

YESIM NAZLAR: Satish this is Yesim, I'm just checking with our operator if Lianna is on the phone bridge now. Lianna is not muted. Lianna? Are you able to hear us? Okay, we'll need to redial back to her because she is still showing as connected on the bridge. We will redial back to her.

SATISH BABU: Yes, meanwhile I'll get to agenda item, so we have an individual member of APRALO, Yeseul Kim, who is from South Korea. She had approached us with a request that one of the policy hot topics that APRALO had identified which is the Extraterritorial Jurisdictional Issues, given the fact that many countries in the region are coming up with similar laws which have extraterritorial implications, so we had planned it as a regional hot topic in our survey. So, Yeseul Kim has come to us with a proposal if we can set up a working group, she has some skills in this area and so we are having her present here today briefly, so, over to you Yeseul.

YESEUL KIM: I was really glad to meet everyone during the Marrakech meeting and while I was attending Marrakech meeting I just happened to see that URALO has done a lot of work on that topic. They have pages of documents on extraterritorial issues and I also worked very briefly in an internet company in Korea, and I also worked on this issue, and I also actually have written some articles and I have been reading a lot of literature, journal articles on this issue, so I just thought that maybe there are some people or companies which have been probably impacted and extraterritorial issues.



---

So I was suggesting that maybe APRALO can actually create one work area on this issue, and not only about extraterritorial issues, but also content issues probably can be included here because you might already know, Facebook just recently announced that they will create their own content adjudicator to go through what's acceptable online and what's not acceptable on their platform. So I thought that might be a topic, I'm suggesting how other people share or are thinking about this. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Thanks very much, Yeseul. Are there are any comments? I have a comment but I will listen to anyone else who has got comments?

YESEUL KIM:

Content is definitely out of ICANN's remit, but ICANN has been doing some outreach.

SATISH BABU:

Alright, so content apart, I think content is a broad interest to us, but not in the remit of ICANN. I believe the privacy data protection experienced as it concerns the DNS, is of course important to us. So, what I would suggest is that if you can prepare a one page note, we can have Staff send it out, asking for volunteers the join this group without that you can start the initial discussions. Now when we are considering a group we would like to know something about the likely outcomes, the duration that you want the outcomes in, and so on, but that's something we can discuss. But a note would be helpful informing

---

people who may be interested. Very brief, perhaps two or three paragraphs should be enough, but if you can work on that it will be easier for us to then approach our community requesting them to participate. Is it okay?

YESEUL KIM: Yeah, okay, and I think Cheryl has something to say about this.

SATISH BABU: Yeah, Cheryl please go ahead.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Okay, thank you, I was just typing into chat, Cheryl Langdon-Orr for the record. I just wanted to make sure that of course whatever work may go ahead in this area, that we make sure that it is well aware and taking into account the significant body of work that was done on jurisdiction under the cross community working group on ICANN Accountability Workstream II because of course that is the only ICANN wide set of agreements on any of these topics. Did it go as far as everyone wanted? No, it did not, but that's simply a product of a multistakeholder consensus building process. As long as we remember the mandate and mission of ICANN in all of this and that we do not ignore the recent bodies of work, that's all I wanted to make sure. Thanks.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Cheryl. That's a good foundation to build on, Yeseul.

YESEUL KIM: Yeah, okay, I have a question, so does that actually mean that I have to go through all the work which had been done by CCWG and ICANN Accountability, or I can just like decide not being so demur [inaudible] create a working group within ICANN, so it would be very helpful.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Put the one page note together and see what happens with the development of a working group and remember this would only be a RALO based working group or work party and the mandate for that its terms of reference, it would be very wise to make sure it had the appropriate reference material as its foundation. If people choose not go through it, then that really is their choice.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Cheryl and thanks Yeseul. We now move on to the NomCom Update from Nadira, Nadira please go ahead.

NADIRA ALARAJ: Thank you Satish. I thank the ALAC community and APRALO for giving me the trust to take this role for two terms. It was a very enriching experience and learning, and I wish my successor to also go through, and I'm sure she will be excelling as well. From my last update we were divided and the [inaudible] team continued the process of referee checks for the short listed candidates and we had written our report that disseminated to the NomCom members and at the Marrakech meeting we interviewed both candidates for both the ICANN Board and

---

the PTI board. We used to have the closest, we started the candidates for the other position and do the deliberation on every single candidate going back to the referee checks, and other deliberations.

The decision wasn't easy because the last candidate were all up to the standards, and I know lots of people might be disappointed from our decision, but we are working to the best of the best and I hope the community will be satisfied with the NomCom decision. This year we tried also to report and inform every single stage what the candidates when through, if they went through the second stage or not, and also what we did the same as last year, each position we have an alternative candidate and even the alternative candidate, selecting them wasn't easy, as well.

Now we are in the period where the NomCom, we are doing 360 evaluation for each other, including the leadership. Our Chair promised this year to be announced publicly. Last year it wasn't announced. It is good to have this to see how we perform as member as well. And I'm happy to be back to the community because it's time consuming between my daily duties, and the volunteer with other organizations, so I'm happy now to be back with ALAC on policy comments, and I will not be disappearing for sure. Thank you.

SATISH BABU:

Thank you, Nadira, once again. We are aware that the NomCom stint of two terms must have been quite a load for you, as it would be for anyone. We are very happy that you have held the tradition of APRALO very high with your excellent contributions, and we would like to thank

---

you on behalf of all of us for your contributions, and we hope to see you furthermore in all our activities coming up. We are at the end of the agenda right now, and we still have a few minutes left in case anyone wants to make any other question or comment on any aspect.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY: Satish, Amrita here, I had two comments to make.

SATISH BABU: Yes please, go ahead.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY: So, just a request. We know that few of the [inaudible] had done some activities in June. If you could just send these reports over to me, a short summary and pictures, it would help us to showcase that in the APRALO newsletter, the Indian Fellowship or the India School of Internet Governance, so we would request if you could share the word across the community and whoever is interested can apply for the fellowship. We do not give travel funds for people from overseas, but we manage their stays and take care of their registration, et cetera. So, we would encourage you to look at the fellowship page and perhaps have some community members to participate in NSIG 2019. Thank you.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Amrita, are there any other questions or comments?

YESEUL KIM: I also have comment.

SATISH BABU: Please identify yourself and go ahead.

YESEUL KIM: Actually there are some fellowship opportunities if anyone would like to attend regional RII meetings or ICANN meetings, if you would like to know about this, I can send pictures, and information to you.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Yeseul. This is Satish for the record. Are there any other questions? Not hearing any questions, I would like to thank everybody who has done this call, for your presence and for your participation. And it's over to Yesim to close the call.

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you very much, Satish. This meeting is now ended. Thank you all for joining today's call. Have a wonderful rest of your day. Bye bye.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**