CLAUDIA RUIZ:	Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the AFRALO monthly teleconference call on Thursday, the 6th of June, 2019, at 18:30 UTC.

On the call today, on the French channel, we have Aïcha Abbad, Gabdibé Gab-Hingonne, Michel Tchonang, Aziz Hilali, and Raihanath Gbadamassi.

On the English channel, we have Mohamed El Bashir, Tijani Ben Jemaa, Vernatius Okwu Ezeama, Patricia Akello, Pastor Peters Omoragbon, Abdulkarim Ayopo Oloyede, Remmy Nweke, Beran Dondeh, Ines Hfaiedh, Sarata Omane, Haroun Mahamat Cheri, Sarah Kiden, Euclides Teles Tomas Chauque, Nomsa Muswai, Dave Kissondoyal, Isaac Maposa, Ejikeme Egbuogu, Yaovi Atohoun, Adam Doungous, Adri Loubser, and Bolutife Adisa.

Before we begin, I would like to remind everyone to please state their name before speaking – oh, I'm sorry. And we have received apologies from Omar Shuran, León Sanchez, and Gabriel Bombambo Boseko.

From staff, we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, and myself, Claudia Ruiz, on call management.

Our interpreters for today are Isabella and Jacques.

Before we begin, I would like to remind everyone to please state their name before speaking for the transcription and also so that the interpreters can identify you on the other language channels. Thank you very much. With this, I had it over to you, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much. Welcome, everyone, to the monthly AFRALO call. Eid Mubarak to all the colleagues who are celebrating the end of Ramadan. This is our last teleconference before ICANN 65.

Starting with the review of action items from the previous call, most of the actions items – actually, there were three action items. The three of them that're related to the last AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting statement. Basically, I think there are three issues because [inaudible]. I think we had one pending action item, which is to have a conference call with Neustar. I think previously the team indicated that there was no need for a conference call because our position is clear, and also Neustar's response to our statement was also clear. So there was no need for that call. So we don't have any pending action items from the last meeting.

Regarding the current open policy comment periods, there are a few. If you're already on Adobe Connect, you can see a table that includes the current open policy issues that require comment. I'll just quickly go through them. There is an IDN comment required for the label generation rules for the new version, Version 3, for that. I think that was already finished/completed by the 4th. The At-Large work status is evolving ICANN's multi-stakeholder model. That's due by the 13th. Abdulkarim [in] AFRALO is part of a team that is drafting that response. We have potential ALAC feedback on the EPDP. Hadia Elminiawi is our representative there, and she's also a penholder in drafting that response. There's a study on technical use of root zone label generation rules. That doesn't have an end date. There's the process proposal for streamlining organizational reviews and evolving the governance of the

root server system. That's due in August. So it's good that we already have two AFRALO members involved in drafting the At-Large response to the policy comment periods.

Without further ado, we can go to the report agenda item. We, as usual, will start with our colleagues from the ALAC. I guess we have [Seun] and Tijani. We don't have Hadia. She will be joining us. So, Tijani, I can give you the floor first and then [Seun] to update us about the ALAC activities. Please go, Tijani.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Tijani. If you were speaking, you were on mute.

Hello, Tijani. You sound very far away.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Do you hear me now?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Yeah.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can hear. Please go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. Thank you very much. Thank you, all. Good morning, good afternoon, everyone. Eid Mubarak for those who are celebrating.

As for ALAC activities, ALAC is working on several things. First of all, we have decided to place Mohamed on the CSC by Holly Raiche. So this will be the replacement. This is the first thing.

Second thing: for ATLAS III, the application came, so we arrived to the deadline. Normally now the selection committee is doing their work so that we will have the 60 persons that will participate in ATLAS III.

Also, for ATLAS III, the Programme Committee is working to have the program. I asked during the last teleconference about an overview of this program, but they told me they don't know yet. I insisted on them saying what will be the general content. They said it will be more an onboarding program, more of training people to be leaders in the future. I opposed this, saying that this is not a summit. They agreed that the name is doesn't match with what will happen but it [inaudible]. So this is for ATLAS III.

Also, ALAC is working on the review. We have an implementation, as you know, working group. They are preparing a first report of the implementation now.

The other thing we are working on is discussion on ICANN 65. The program is now forming step by step, and AFRALO – perhaps we'll speak about that separately later – will have a special program because we will have students present there, and we have a special program for them.

ICANN 65. What else? There is election for the RALOs. There is only LACRALO that didn't do their election. All the others did. We have all the results now. They are published and you know them. What else? Now

we are working on the FY20 additional budget request. I think that we should be very active in that so that we prepare our [needs] if we want to have some additional budget. But I will tell you that this comes more and more difficult to have more money. This year, for example, we almost didn't have anything. At-Large in general almost didn't have anything. So there is a new policy to be very careful about the budget. But now it is [open] now. We can prepare and we can make our request about the additional budget.

That's it, I think. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. [Seun], please go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Hello. Can you hear me?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, loud and clear. Go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Mohamed, it looks like Seun just dropped. The operator is trying to get him back.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. Do we have Hadia?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: No, she has not joined yet.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. Let's [inaudible] [and Dev]—

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Actually, sorry.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: He's back?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: It looks like is back, yes. One moment.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Oh, looks like he dropped again. Apologies.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: No worries.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: We're going to dial out to him again. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. No worries. Let's proceed to the next agenda item, and then, when Seun's back, we'll give him a chance. This is about activities. Please give us an update about your local activities, any events, any incidents. I have an update from my side, but I'll give everyone the chance first to provide their updates.

I don't see a hand yet, so I can start from Sudan by saying that I'm sure you all followed up with the [tragic] incidents that're happening now: the current Internet blackouts for the last three days. Basically, my organization and every Internet [operators] currently in Sudan and other [inaudible]. Also [friends] from Africa and elsewhere are trying to shed light on what happens and also are putting pressure on their government to install the Internet. So basically, mobile Internet services have been blocked for the last three days on the major operators in Sudan. This clearly seems to prevent the people from being connected to the Internet and sharing their stories about [inaudible] has happened from the military attempting – actually, attacking civilian protests who are demanding change.

We had submitted statements to the ITU Secretary General, to the ITU Deputy Secretary General, to the African Telecommunications Union [inaudible] Commission, to the service providers. International organizations have also been working on this area. [Access now in our society]. Thankfully, the society issued a statement as well. ICANN will be contacted as well, but as you know, this is not something in their

remit, but we already will be sharing that statement with them just to raise the bar and provide awareness of the issues.

I can say it's very sad this is happening. People are blocked from the Internet. So, if there's anything that you can do in terms of just spreading the word, that would be appreciated.

I'm not sure if there's anybody else who'd like to provide an update on what's happening in their local Internet community or their activities in their ALS.

Sarah, please.

SARAH KIDEN: Hi, everyone. From the Internet Society Uganda Chapter, we promised you that we would have a YouthComm event, organized with the GSE team in Africa. That's going to be happening next week on Thursday and Friday. I think you are aware that, starting Saturday, I think, we have the Africa Internet Summit happening in Kampala, Uganda. We have a lot of activities during this summit. We will be at the booth. We will support a lot of ICANN and ISOC activities. We will have the YouthComm event, and we will also encourage some of our young participants who attend the ICANN Day and other ICANN events [to attend].

That is from our chapter. I think I'll give a full update once we're done with the event. But Yaovi is on the call, so if Yaovi would like to say something about the event we're organizing together, [inaudible]. Thank you.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Sure. Can I say something now or later?

SARAH KIDEN: Yes, Yaovi, now is the time.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, please go ahead.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Okay. Thank you so much for giving us the opportunity. We also want to thank the ALS in Uganda for this activity we are doing together. During two days, we are having a workshop on the youth community. This is something we started preparing some time ago, and we are glad that this [inaudible].

The second bit of information is that, on June 15th, on June 16th, Sunday, we have two main events. On Saturday, we have an ICANN workshop for registries and registrars and registrants. That is on Saturday. On Sunday, we have what we call ICANN Day. I'll be posting in the chatroom, and staff will share those notes in the chatroom [and] the link for a blog that we shared. In that blog, you have the information about these two events. So please register. For Sunday, for those will not be in Kampala, there is a way to attend remotely. We'll also share this information.

So thank you very much for giving us this opportunity.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you. Tijani, please?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. First of all, regarding the [IES], I am so happy that, again, AFRALO will be present and will be heavily present, thanks to the fact that we have at least two members who are from the country. So they are always present there. Plus [Caleb] and myself, who will join later, because, as you know, CROP doesn't permit more than three night. So we are obliged to come late because we want to be in the policy discussion and not during the training because, unfortunately, ICANN is organized ICANN Day during the period of training. And this is not interesting for us, for AFRALO, to go, to spend money, and to go just to see the training going. So that's why we are arriving late. I told that to Pierre when we were in Kobe. I told him, "Please organize ICANN Day during the period where the policy discussion happens." Unfortunately, it is always the same. No problem.

Now I come to my activity. I just came from Berlin, where the Internet Jurisdiction Network organized their third global conference. I am a member of one of the groups, a member of one of the sub-groups or so. It was a very intensive discussion. I think that it was a very good opportunity to bring the applicant perspective. There was also Mary Uduma there present.

The other thing, which is very important, that is next week is there will be RightsCon, a big conference organized by international networks. There is a lot of people coming. For example, ICANN [inaudible] come, and they will have a booth. I will be a speaker in one of the sessions. So

this is also another activity that you will have next week here before Kampala.

From there, I'll go to Kampala to participate in the policy discussion of AFRINIC and the Africa Internet Summit. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. [Kilay], can you provide us an update regarding the Internet Governance School? Please go ahead.

[KILAY BOBOONDELAY]:   Hello, everyone. We'll be having, in Nigeria, the Nigerian School of Internet Governance between the period of July 8th through the 10th. There'll be a closing ceremony where we'll have the main Nigerian Internet Governance Forum. Participants from the school are also going to participate in the Nigerian IGF forum, where they would also learn some of the multi-stakeholder processes that we're going to have.

After that, we are going to have a youth session. I think a member of those coordinating the youth session of the Nigerian Internet Governance Forum is also on this call.

That being said, we [inaudible] that we got some …

SILVIA VIVANCO: Claudia, I think we lost [him] [inaudible]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: I think we lost him yeah.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: I still see him connected. He's not muted. One moment. In the meantime, I see that Michel has his hand up.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Go ahead, Michel.

MICHEL TCHONANG: Hello, everyone. Regarding the activities of my ALS—

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello? Sorry. Apologies.

MICHEL TCHONANG: [inaudible] to let you know and invite you to come to a symposium—

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello? Sorry. Michel and Jacques, you guys are both speaking French on the English channel. Are you trying to speak in French? I will mute you in Zoom.

MICHEL TCHONANG: Okay.

CLAUDIA RUIZ:	One moment. Let me mute you in Zoom, and then you can speak French on your dial-out.
MICHEL TCHONANG:	Hello, everyone. I would like to take this opportunity to let you know about the activities of our ALS, CAPDA. We're going to organize, from the 9th of 12th of July in Yaounde, Cameroon, a symposium on new technologies, challenges, and opportunities. If you are available, we will be glad to welcome you in Yaounde, Cameroon, so that together we can define what we can do to help populations to have access to the Internet. Thank you very much.
MOHAMED EL BASHIR:	Thank you, Michel. I will just read an update for Remmy. He's saying that the Nigerian Digital Sense Forum on Internet Governance for Development was supposed to be held today, June 6th, but it's going to be moved to June 20th. That's the update from his side.
	I don't see any other raised hands. If that's the case, we can move on with our agenda items. Thank you, everyone, for their updates. Next is the items for discussions, starting with a letter that we received from Cherine Chalaby, the current Chair of the ICANN Board. Because it's related also to our statement, I think, Tijani, maybe you're the best one to talk about that.
	Tijani, go ahead.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Tijani. If you are speaking, you are on mute.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: I can provide an update while – oh, Tijani, you are ready?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, I am ready now.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Please.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. Thank you very much. We received the feedback from the Board thanking us for addressing this issue. It was about one of the companies [inaudible] that proposed a way forward for the new gTLDs. They even gave dates and a real program with dates, which we saw is more or less influencing the Board to make it start this new gTLD phase, while we think that we are not yet ready because all the studies, all the data that we need before starting, are not yet there.

The Board appreciated our work and they said that the ATRT has already gave their feedback. They say that we already have some data. But they didn't take any position that's normal. They acknowledged our statement. They respect. They gave the information that the ATRT gave their final findings. Thank you, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani, for the update. The next item is an update regarding the Marrakech meeting. Aziz is taking the lead because he's already a Moroccan. He will be taking the lead in [inaudible] actually. So thank you, Aziz, for being kind and generous [host] for ICANN for the second, I guess, or third time in Marrakech. Aziz, if you can update us about activities on preparations and also AFRALO's plans for activities in Marrakech, please go ahead.

INTERPRETER: I'm not hearing Aziz on the French line.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Is he online?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Yes, we did have—sorry.

INTERPRETER: He just came on.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Mohamed, for giving me the floor. In terms of ICANN 65 and the meeting that will occur in Marrakech, what I can tell you, first of all, is that we are working on an agenda for the students. There will be 30

students that will come from the university in Rabat. We have started putting together an intensive agenda for them over two days. They will meet the ICANN leaders. They will meet the CEO, as well as the Chair of the Board, Cherine Chalaby. They will also meet other members of the NextGen and newcomer programs, and they will also be involved in different sessions of the ICANN meeting.

There will also be some side meeting for them. There will be a regional meeting from Africa representatives, GAC representatives. This will occur on June 23rd, and it will be a side meeting. It will involve official representatives of the country of Morocco.

I have been working to deliver visas. This is something that requires a lot of work. The idea is to make sure that all Africans get their visa when they get to the airport. It requires a lot of official documents and so forth. If you do require more detail, the agenda for the students, don't hesitate to ask. I can answer your questions.

We will also have the AfrICANN and AFRALO meeting. We will have the meeting for the AFRALO event. That will be on Monday night.

So that's what I wanted to say for now, but if you have questions, do not hesitate. I can answer them. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Aziz. That's helpful. We're looking forward to being in Marrakech and also attending those activities.

Regarding the joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting, which we do regularly ICANN meetings, as usual we select an issue and then we have a team

drafting a statement that will be reviewed during the meeting, after debate about it.

Abdulkarim is going to have us an update about the statement and where we are on the [inaudible] part of the team [jointly] drafting the statement. Please go ahead.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. I will try and share my screen so that we can see what we have with the statement. Give me one second while I try doing that.

Hello?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go ahead.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Okay. I hope you can see this statement now. What we did was to have a draft statement. Members of the team made comments. We have tried to harmonize all the comments. We can actually also see the statement, this draft, on the Google Doc. I'm sure probably Sarah can share the Google Doc.

I will just probably scroll through so that, if we have any comments, we can also make the comment on the Google Doc. Or do I need to read through?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:	No, but you can provide us just a summary of the topic and maybe the statement objectives as well.

| ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: | Okay. The topic we're talking about is the evolving ICANN multi-stakeholder model. We're trying to, as much as possible, contribute to the multi-stakeholder model of ICANN. What we do was to [inaudible] some of the challenges we face as Africans in contributing to the multi-stakeholder model and what we think a multi-stakeholder model should look like. |

We also tried as much as possible to highlight some of the things and some of the areas we think ICANN can do better in terms of the multi-stakeholder model. We highlighted issues that has to do with trust, cultural considerations, [regular] challenges [inaudible]. That was where we mentioned issues that has to do with our regions and that has to be taken into consideration, especially the multi-stakeholder structure.

We also gave some recommendations on how we think the multi-stakeholder structure should look like and how we think ICANN can improve on the multi-stakeholder structure. [inaudible] kind of suggestion we gave. You can actually look at the statement. Sarah will share the Google Doc. We're going to have a clean one where we can make comments before the meeting.

This is what we have. Thank you so much.

EN

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Abdulkarim. For any updates or any comments on the statement, you can reach out to Abdulkarim, Tijani, or Sarah, leading this work.

Then we have an update about the elections. Just to give you information about the elections, we had our regular elections. [Euclides] indicated that [inaudible] to step down. So the Chair position and the Vice-Chair and NomCom representative decide. ALAC/AFRALO [inaudible] for election, and we have the nomination period. Then we have the election concluding on the 30th. Then the election results were published. Congratulations to everyone who have been elected to serve our community. I hope we all work together as a united community so we can serve the end users and represent them very well in ICANN.

There was miscommunication regarding the result of the AFRALO NomCom appointee. It seems previously that the communication included this position and it included the text that indicated that the person is eligible for reappointment as information. But because AFRALO doesn't elect a person for this position, basically the five regional RALOs have a seat that is filled by the nominating committee. Basically, the nominating committee, through its process, selects someone to be sitting on the ALAC, representing that region. There's one seat per RALO.

In our case, there was a mistake that happened on the on the announcement – that Hadia was selected by [inaudible] – which is a confusion that was created. Actually, Seun was the only person selected by the [inaudible] because there was no contest. And there is not competing candidates for this position.

Immediately, I reached out to staff and a correction has been issued following up that e-mail immediately. Unfortunately, this raised confusion. I hope it could be cleared. I also talked to Hadia about the confusion that occurred. Basically, there should not be any effects with her process with NomCom because NomCom is a completely different process outside [inaudible] of everyone. So I apologize personally because I'm overseeing the activities or the announcement that's published by staff. I should be more, maybe, thorough in my review of that text, and that [one] slip.

But I don't see any other issue on the elections. I think it was a very healthy exercise, and I think, for the first time, we almost reached at minimum 70% to 80% in every position that has been up for election, which is really good. So most of us, the majority [inaudible], participated in this.

So I open this item for discussion. If you have any questions, I'm happy to take it.

Seun, I think you have a raise hand. Please go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yeah. Thank you very much. Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to thank all the AFRALO members for participating in the elections, both the voters and all the nominees, for conducting another successful selection and election of the leadership.

I will say that I want to also mention the ALAC AFRALO nominees to NomCom. I think it would be good to clarify because I think there was a

little confusion about how this is being done. Normally, there's a recommendation. It's actually the ALAC that actually finalizes our selection to NomCom. That recommendation is to come from the RALOs. While ALAC has a choice of rejecting a RALO recommendation, it is very, very rare that they do so.

I've been getting some comments from some people feeling that that process is not democratic. Well, if for some reason we feel that we need to improve or change the process, then we should also try to be involved in the review of the [group] at the ALAC level. At the moment, there is really no [Council] alum. Normally, the recommendation from the RALO are usually [inaudible] the ALAC.

I just thought I should also add the clarification, of course, in addition to what Mohamed has already said. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Seun. I think you raised a very important point. Yes, regarding specifically the position on the NomCom, the ALAC endorsed a vote on the result of the elections [for] recommendation of the candidates from the RALO. When I was in ALAC, I do[n't] recall a very rare situation where the ALAC rejected the regional recommendation. I don't see a reason to worry about that, but I will be very disappointed if ALAC rejected a regional recommendation without any clear justification of that.

PASTOR PETERS: Pastor Peters.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, Pastor Peters? Go ahead, please.

PASTOR PETERS: Are we discussing the issue of election now [inaudible] from ALAC and they would discuss issues related to elections? When do we get to that agenda item?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, we are in the election agenda item. Go ahead, please.

PASTOR PETERS: Okay. I had a [serious] comment. I have a [serious] comment [on] your comments. First, I just want to say that I don't think [inaudible] who expressed concerns about the procedural [inaudible] adopted or that is being used within ICANN by ALAC to select or choose a NomCom member, even after the [original] elections. You said that there was no cause for alarm because there [aren't] so many records of ALAC refusing or [rejecting] RALO recommendations. I know that. I don't think we are actually worried about [inaudible]. I think what we are [inaudible] try to bring out [inaudible] with the principles behind that process, whereby you ask for elections and then you're also regarding certain offices or positions [inaudible] by ALAC members themselves. So we are concerned about [inaudible]. It fits the tenets of the [inaudible] in itself, that is what we're talking about. Yes, [inaudible]. Those are issues that should be decided within ALAC, or ALAC can decide on that matter. I feel [inaudible] yes [inaudible] the RALO as AFRALO has the power to

engage in their own activities, but they will still have people [inaudible] but it will get them involved in the activities of AFRALO. Why? Because I said all activities of ICANN are open to any member of ICANN, whether you belong to [LACRALO] you belong to [inaudible]. There is no secrets [inaudible] that have to do with any [inaudible].

So, in a nutshell, my concern and [inaudible] has to do with the principles behind that practice, whereby, after each of our elections for NomCom representatives, then ALAC [inaudible] internal mechanism to select or reject or accept any of the [inaudible] election for any group, it should be open and it should in line with what is [inaudible] as democratic. I think that that is where our concerns lie.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Pastor Peters. Definitely a [well-understood] point. Just as a follow-up question, Seun and Tijani, because you're both in ALAC, how can we – okay, this is the current procedure in ALAC now. Is [inaudible] in the bylaws or operating procedures? How could these concerns be raised to ALAC in terms of how, in the case of RALO selections – I think I might remember the [inaudible]. I usually use the word "endorse," but it's a vote. What is ALAC's internal review on this issue? Maybe you can give us insight, Seun or Tijani.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you – oh, okay. All right, Tijani.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: You can go, Seun, and then a follow-up with Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay.

SEUN OJEDEJI: I think Tijani can perhaps [raise it better] than myself, but I will try, and then to Tijani. We had [inaudible] myself. I think the challenge with the [inaudible]. I think [inaudible]. This rule is actually from the ICANN bylaw itself. Apart from that, the rule [inaudible] for ALAC also are from [inaudible] about how that section of ICANN bylaw is implemented.

What normally happens is that there's a recommendation from the RALOs. Basically, ALAC just considers the recommendation and then ratifies. Like I said in the earlier statement, of course ALAC [inaudible] the possibility of rejecting the candidates. [inaudible]. I think that maybe, at least from my experience in ALAC – Tijani may confirm – there was such an incident like that. But I was not on the AFRALO side anyway. The fact is that, most of the time in most of these scenarios, they are normally ratified. ALAC just does the ratification just to also fulfill the requirements of the bylaws.

Changing the bylaws? You know that is not going to be a short order. It's going to be a very tall one. So I'm not sure how that can be done. I think we should perhaps raise these concerns. I believe there's going to be a bylaw review in the future. ALAC could actually put it on [inaudible]. Personally, I don't think it's a very, very serious issue that we may need to be concerned about, especially considering that every decision process on ALAC is also [inaudible]. ALAC [inaudible] perhaps give justification [inaudible] eject any candidates [inaudible] concern.

Tijani may add. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, Tijani, please go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much. The bylaw says that ALAC appoints five delegates to the NomCom, one per region, after consultation with the bylaws. So, normally, ICANN doesn't appoint someone if they didn't consult with the region.

I will give you a history. I will give you an example. Last year, EURALO proposed that Wolfgang go on the NomCom as a delegate. ALAC refused him. Most criticism of Wolfgang is that he's much more SUC than ALAC.

So this is the case. Before there was another case also in LACRALO, but it was for other reasons. LACRALO has a lot of perhaps conflict between their [inaudible], and I don't want to enter inside this. So one time in LACRALO it happened also.

So the bylaw says that the ALAC appoints. So it is ALAC who appoints, but the bylaw says also there's a consultation with the RALO. That's it. Thank you.

PASTOR PETERS: Pastor Peters, please.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Please go ahead.

PASTOR PETERS: Thank you, Mr. Tijani. The two instances given by Tijani [would] have to support our position for a review of the bylaws. Number one, I have the ICANN bylaws open before me here. First, I would appreciate if Tijani, maybe or now or later on, forwards me to the sections of the bylaws that he just referenced – d[inaudible] bylaws – for every one of us to go and study. If we need to do [inaudible], we'll do it.

Two: the position by Seun on considering or trying to see how we could change the bylaws. We may not be able to change the bylaws today, but [inaudible] start the process if we feel the practice for us defeats the principles of democracy.

So I cannot see why we have elections. Now they are calling that elections [as what] they call consultation. I get the language. I actually want to see the [permissions] of the sections being referred [inaudible] look at the wordings. If there [is] an election by each region, I refer to that consultation, which is subject to government approval or by ALAC. That has to be looked into. That [inaudible].

Now, going to the example given by Tijani, one could see that, yes, the person that was elected by EURALO or LACRALO – I don't want to delve into whatever [inaudible] we think NARALO – LACRALO or NARALO. But they thought [inaudible] like [inaudible] in AFRALO now. Tomorrow for one of them the other. One [inaudible]. The person elected from AFRALO cannot be endorsed. So that is it. So we cannot [inaudible]

Following up with the question by the Chair, Cherine Chalaby, yes, work can be done to look into changing the bylaws. [inaudible] can be changed if we have reasonable concerns. We have good reasons. [inaudible] ICANN should look into some bylaws that defeat the principles of democracy. ICANN is duty-bound to [inaudible]. So we can set a process. [inaudible] the norm [inaudible] not change. So [inaudible] dynamic is strange. Strange is an inevitable process. If we are to begin this process looking at setting rules that are [inaudible] by ICANN, I don't think we should [inaudible] from it. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Pastor Peters. I'm not sure if we have any – Remmy, you have a raised hand. Please go ahead.

REMMY NWEKE: Thank you, Mr. Chair, for this. I wish to [inaudible] the one election. [inaudible] election. Following up on the discussion, we wish to also support the position of Pastor Peters. We don't need to wait [inaudible] to AFRALO [inaudible] right steps. [inaudible]. Normally, we have [inaudible]. [inaudible] a review on our own [inaudible] AFRALO on what we think of the ALAC [inaudible] and maybe make a position to the leadership and you can take it from there. Thank you, who raised it, especially Pastor Peters for [inaudible]. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:	Thank you, Remmy. To take this a step ahead, if we can form a small group that could write something that could be shared with ALAC, that would be useful to raise the concerns. I suggest Seun, Pastor Peters, and Tijani as a small group of ALAC members and AFRALO members who raised this issue to write something that maybe we can submit to ALAC, so if there's any suggestions that could be taken about how ALAC could take and create the [inaudible] recommendations or the results of the election, if that is fine.

Tijani, you have a raised hand.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:	Thank you very much, Mohamed. I don't see any reason to write anything now. If you want, please read the bylaws so that you'll know what is the rule now. Then, if you have concerns, if there is something to do – because we are not asked to change the bylaws. This is something very heavy now. To have the bylaws changed, you need approval of the Empowered Community. So it is not the Board. The Board cannot do it. Nobody can do it. It's the Empowered Community. That means that all the stakeholders of ICANN plus the Board should do that. So this is something that is not practical, and I don't see why we ask for that now. Please read it before and see what it is. If there is concern, you can provide your concern to ALAC, to any party you decide to provide your comments to. But now I don't think there is something to do. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thanks, Tijani. By the way, I have read the text. The text is talking about the principle, but it doesn't go to the level of procedures – how to appoint and how to go with the process. I think this is the process [inaudible]. I think the concern is on the process. Pastor Peters raised a point about the principles themselves – why would not an elected RALO member be seated immediately. This is what we have now. ALAC is the gatekeeper. I agree that it's very difficult to change bylaws. I have just seen it on the [inaudible] process.

If we looked at the procedures and ensuring that a RALO's elected appointed is [inaudible] for endorsement and who has been interfering with the RALOs selection. That's something that definitely we could work on because that's within their remit. And it's easy to work on. So I'm not sure if that distinction could be helpful.

Seun? I have Maureen as well. Seun, please go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you. I see, Maureen, the ALAC Chair, is on this call. Of course, I believe that she would add more flesh to this. Just to state clearly that, when the bylaw says "consultation," the bylaws give the [inaudible] an expectation of what should happen in terms of the ALAC appointee to the NomCom. [inaudible] the consultation is now for each RALO to define. Some RALOs do election. Some RALOs do selection. For us, the purpose is that the process by which a RALO recommends a candidate or consults with ALAC is determined by the RALO and not determined solely by ALAC. So it's totally independent. The RALOs determines how they're selecting the ones they recommend.

Once they recommend somebody, as been said a couple of times, it's very, very rare for them to reject it. [inaudible] are going to reject it. It is also [inaudible] to be in consultation with the respective RALO. Also, a reasonable agreement is achieved. They have to be rationales for those changes if there's going to be any change of a recommended person.'

So I think that Tijani has also plenty [inaudible] the challenge [inaudible] changing the ICANN bylaw. It's like [inaudible] the accountability process all over because [inaudible] a lot of things. I think that, considering that RALOs have independence, considering that they can actually also transparently engage and do review of what ALAC is doing – ALAC activity [inaudible] meeting – I believe this is as issue that can always be resolved within the At-Large without necessarily going to change the bylaw.

But of course [inaudible], like I said, if there are opportunities to do that, why not? Than you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Seun. Maureen, please?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Mohammed, and thank you, AFRALO, for allowing me to speak here. I think it's really important that we clarify some things. In respect of the NomCom appointee, why this NomCom appointee is sometimes rejected, this is probably the one time where the ALAC actually makes the choice. As has been mentioned before, people make

a choice. The ALAC considers every single applicant that is actually proposed by the RALO.

I think that the reason it is so important is that the NomCom appointee position is probably one of the most important positions that the At-Large community can actually contribute to a decision-making process within ICANN. The NomCom appointee not only must reflect the views and values of the At-Large community but they actually help to select people into positions across the ICANN community as well. So they have to have a very good understanding of not only At-Large but also the ICANN community and the other sections of the ICANN community and what the roles and responsibilities are of the people within those constituencies. So it's the responsibility of the ALAC to choose someone that they feel could adequately represent the views and values not only of our group but also of others.

Just as an example, a couple of years ago, in APRALO, we had five applicants who put their names forward for the position. Of course, they were all colleagues. They were all good people. We didn't think it was fair that we should be making that decision ourselves. So we gave the five names to the ALAC, and they went through, I know, every single one of those candidates. The person that they decided on? Well, we probably would have been happy with whoever they decided on, but we were more than happy with their final selection.

Last year as well, there were two people who were actually recommended, and the ALAC rejected both. As Seun mentioned, there's got to be a strong rationale behind why people are rejected. It does happen. But I think, first of all, you have to understand what the

EN

position entails. It's not just an ordinary appointment to have a representative. People on the NomCom have a lot of work to do. They have to have a lot of understanding of what it is the role is. It's a big responsibility.

It was also mentioned that changing the bylaws – unfortunately, that's too hard to do. You can make a recommendation but I'm not quite sure how it would go.

PASTOR PETERS: Pastor Peters, please.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, Pastor Peters? After that, we can conclude.

PASTOR PETERS: Quickly, what we are trying to do here is we are not going [inaudible] AFRALO is going to change the bylaws or ICANN. I wouldn't want us to allow sentiments to be principles for which we are trying to promote. We are saying the principles behind the procedures or the process [inaudible] the NomCom.

Now, [inaudible], the Chair has suggested [inaudible] members within AFRALO can look into this and [inaudible]. So I don't see why people should [inaudible]. [inaudible] anybody could do is if you were [inaudible] or appointed to this community [inaudible] you don't believe you want to side with that committee. We should not allow any single

individual to [inaudible] interests to override the overall interest of the group of AFRALO.

Now, there have been issues that have been discussed within AFRALO and within ATLAS. Now, [inaudible] an example of the recent ATLAS III selection process. Now, the argument came up [inaudible] regional representative, but then all of us agreed from the committee to the group [inaudible] the entire ICANN group [inaudible] allow ten delegates per region. But then the [inaudible] criteria, which was collectively agreed on and accepted.

So what we are also pursuing here is to see whether the [councilor] of NomCom is [inaudible] to go to a special school or has a special degree to be made a member. If there are criteria to be met [inaudible] and then, if we just are going to elect [inaudible], then we use the criteria to elect the [inaudible]. Once [inaudible] been elected by a region, if the rules on ALAC [inaudible] to accept them. So not for ALAC to [inaudible] as a small committee to not decide what are these elected [inaudible] a particular region qualifies or [omits] the criteria. So that is what we are talking about.

So [inaudible] we can change ICANN bylaw within 24 hours. Now part of the reasons for progress to is to [defy] changes [inaudible] changes to promote the group of any [inaudible]. So we are [inaudible] and we are [inaudible] ICANN looked. If AFRALO was to spearhead this, [inaudible] record. If you take the next ten years to [inaudible], then the process must begin. So that is why I will support the position of the Chair nominated members within AFRALO to look into it. [inaudible] group for comment [inaudible] whatever is adopted as a general statement can

be sent to ICANN. It can be the ICANN [inaudible] on the record. It can also be sent to the ombudsman. They can look at it and define, does this meet the tenets of democracy? If we are saying ICANN is [inaudible], then we should practice it. I wouldn't want to see a [inaudible] or a group within a group or [inaudible] group or one group.

So, Mr. Chair, I will submit that, if you are appointed [inaudible] anybody to look at this [inaudible], I am prepared to be that committee. If [inaudible] Tijani and [inaudible], AFRALO for us to look into this, and then we can do the [inaudible] AFRALO [inaudible]. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Pastor Peters. Just as a conclusion, because I think we need to move ahead, on this point of RALO understanding the requirement, I think the NomCom requirement is very clear. The [inaudible] people we can send to the NomCom are still [inaudible]. I have served in the NomCom for about two times, and I have seen new NomCom members who are joining who are exceedingly doing a great job. NomCom members who were there we elected for a second time also. So I think we don't that to become a barrier for new members to join. I think what exactly is required from a NomCom member is very clear.

To conclude, I think the concern about how we can have a safeguard or at least a process to ensure that – it's not just a recommendation. I think some of our members have strong feelings about this because we do elections for this. As a way forward, I can try to suggest something either in [text or in a group], that [I can] send something to ALAC about

the concerns of AFRALO, and then let's see how ALAC responds to that. No one is, I think, requesting a change of a bylaw.

If we can proceed, because we already spent a long time on this, I will give Fatimata the floor to give us an update about the outreach strategy plan. Please, Fatimata.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Fatimata?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: If Fatimata is not there, [Sarah], could you take the individual membership and the ALS membership so we can conclude that part? [inaudible]

SARAH KIDEN: [inaudible] Just to start with the application that we have received for [inaudible]. I think some of them are actually known to us. The feedback from the regional V.P, who is Pierre, was positive. And [inaudible], who is very active in the community. Look at the website. They organized some events related to the mandate of ICANN.

The second application we received is from the Association [inaudible] Information Society in Chad. It was made by [Saphia Mohamed and Kadija Mookta Asmuch]. So they are based in Chad and it's also a [registered] organization.

In terms of individual member applications, we received one from [inaudible], who is from Ghana. If you have any feedback or comments about these applications, please let us know.

While I have the floor, I'd just like to mention that, if you are aware that AFRALO now accepts individual members in addition to At-Large memberships, for you to become a member of AFRALO, you can either come as an individual member or as a member of an At-Large Structure.

In 2017, we voted to allow individual members, and we agreed that in two years, which is right now, actually, we shall review this individual membership and see how it has worked or not or see how we can change it [inaudible]. [inaudible] receive any. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Sarah. If there is no any other business, I'm just trying to be cautious about your time because we covered all of our agenda items and we actually exceeded the meeting time. So this was a very interesting discussion, especially about the elections part. We'll continue that, definitely. Thank you, everyone. I would like to end the meeting. Have a good night, everyone. Thank you very much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]