

Cross-Community Deliberations Recommendation 10

Implementation Briefing for the Third Accountability &
Transparency Review Team (ATRT3)

Recommendation 10

The Board should improve the effectiveness of cross-community deliberations.

10.1. To enhance GNSO policy development processes and methodologies to better meet community needs and be more suitable for addressing complex problems, ICANN should:

a. In line with ongoing discussions within the GNSO, the Board should develop funded options for professional services to assist GNSO policy development WGs. Such services could include training to enhance work group leaders' and participants' ability to address difficult problems and situations, professional facilitation, mediation, negotiation. The GNSO should develop guidelines for when such options may be invoked,

b. The Board should provide adequate funding for face-to-face meetings to augment e-mail, wiki and teleconferences for GNSO policy development processes. Such face-to-face meeting must also accommodate remote participation, and consideration should also be given to using regional ICANN facilities (regional hubs and engagement centers) to support intersessional meetings. Moreover, the possibility of meetings added on to the start or end of ICANN meetings could also be considered. The GNSO must develop guidelines for when such meetings are required and justified, and who should participate in such meetings.

c. The Board should work with the GNSO and the wider ICANN community to develop methodologies and tools to allow the GNSO policy development processes to utilize volunteer time more effectively, increasing the ability to attract busy community participants into the process and also resulting in quicker policy development.

10.2. The GAC, in conjunction with the GNSO, must develop methodologies to ensure that GAC and government input is provided to ICANN policy development processes and that the GAC has effective opportunities to provide input and guidance on draft policy development outcomes. Such opportunities could be entirely new mechanisms or utilization of those already used by other stakeholders in the ICANN environment. Such interactions should encourage information exchanges and sharing of ideas/opinions, both in face-to-face meetings and intersessionally, and should institutionalize the cross-community deliberations foreseen by the AoC.

10.3. The Board and the GNSO should charter a strategic initiative addressing the need for ensuring more global participation in GNSO policy development processes, as well as other GNSO processes. The focus should be on the viability and methodology of having the opportunity for equitable, substantive and robust participation from and representing:

- a. All ICANN communities with an interest in gTLD policy and in particular, those represented within the GNSO;
- b. Under-represented geographical regions;
- c. Non-English speaking linguistic groups;
- d. Those with non-Western cultural traditions; and
- e. Those with a vital interest in gTLD policy issues but who lack the financial support of industry players.

10.4. To improve the transparency and predictability of the policy development process the Board should clearly state to what degree it believes that it may establish gTLD policy¹²¹ in the event that the GNSO cannot come to closure on a specific issue, in a specified time-frame if applicable, and to the extent that it may do so, the process for establishing such gTLD policies. This statement should also note under what conditions the Board believes it may alter GNSO Policy Recommendations, either before or after formal Board acceptance.

10.5. The Board must facilitate the equitable participation in applicable ICANN activities, of those ICANN stakeholders who lack the financial support of industry players.

Implementation Status

Operationalized in November 2016. Executive summary and archives available at: <https://community.icann.org/display/attr/Rec+%2310>

Deliverables

Deliverable	Responsible	Status
Appointment of GNSO Liaison to the GAC	Council	✓
Identify and document additional recommendations for GAC Early Engagement in GNSO PDP	GAC/GNSO Consultation Group	✓
Implementation of CROPP	ICANN org	✓
Document milestones and goals for the GNSO PDP Improvements	GNSO/ICANN org	✓
Implementation of facilitated PDP F2F WG meetings pilot project	GNSO/ICANN org	✓

Results and Implementation Details

The following paragraphs describe a number of initiatives that address various components of recommendation 10 in relation to improving the effectiveness of cross-community deliberations.

1. This section describes specific initiatives that may be relevant to recommendation 10.1.

GNSO PDP Improvements and PDP 3.0

The GNSO Policy Development Process (PDP) governs the way in which the GNSO develops policy consistent with the role of the GNSO as outlined in the ICANN Bylaws. In recent years, the GNSO Council (Council) and community have engaged in a number of efforts aimed at increasing broadly representative, informed participation in PDPs.

As a result of a GNSO improvements exercise, a revised GNSO PDP was adopted by the GNSO Council in October 2011 and by the ICANN Board in December 2011. Starting in 2013, the Council, in collaboration with the ICANN organization (ICANN org), gathered a number of ideas and suggestions to be explored to improve and streamline the existing policy development process. These ideas and suggestions were translated into 10 PDP improvements (see <http://gns0.icann.org/en/drafts/pdp-improvements-table-16jan14-en.pdf>). Many of these improvements were closely aligned with the recommendations of the ATRT2 in relation to the GNSO PDP. The ICANN org was tasked to explore and implement next steps for each item, including in pilot format. A final status update was provided to the GNSO in June 2016 - see <http://gns0.icann.org/en/drafts/memo-pdp-improvements-09jun16-en.pdf>. This final status update included proposed next steps on how to transform some of the GNSO improvements that have been determined successful into permanent features of the PDP and close out this project until such time as the Council identifies new improvements that are deemed worth exploring and/or revamps some of the improvements that were not then considered suitable for implementation. In June 2016, the GNSO Council [voted](#) to consider the project closed.

The GNSO Council directed the ICANN org to integrate some of the pilot improvements to become permanent features as well as survey the GNSO community about their familiarity with the perceived usefulness of the current newcomer and training tools and materials. The results of the survey as well as a number of recommendations responding to the results of the survey were submitted to the GNSO Council for its consideration (see <https://gns0.icann.org/en/drafts/newcomer-tools-survey-04oct16-en.pdf>). During its meeting at ICANN57, the GNSO Council agreed that the ICANN org should proceed to implement the recommendations relating to improvements for the community wiki and the GNSO course materials available on the ICANN Learn platform. The wiki updates have been completed and work on improved GNSO online courses is currently in progress by the ICANN org.

In January 2018, the GNSO Council identified a number of challenges as well as possible improvements to the GNSO PDP, with the ultimate aim of optimizing increased engagement

and participation while ensuring efficient and effective bottom-up policy development. This "PDP 3.0" effort was a topic of discussion between the Council and the broader community at ICANN meetings throughout 2018. Following the publication in May 2018 of an ICANN org paper intended for community feedback (<https://gnso.icann.org/en/drafts/pdp-discussion-paper-11may18-en.pdf>), and a review of the input received in response, the GNSO Council published a report directing the ICANN org to begin implementation in October 2018 (<https://gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/file/field-file-attach/pdp-increase-effectiveness-efficiency-23oct18-en.pdf>). As of January 2019, the GNSO Council has begun discussions over specific aspects of the proposed implementation plan (<https://gnso.icann.org/en/drafts/pdp-implementation-plan-10dec18-en.pdf>). The Council believes that addressing the challenges that were identified during the PDP 3.0 process will greatly facilitate more informed participation (including by newcomers) in more effective and consensus-driven outcomes of the GNSO policy process (for example, by clarifying the terms of participation in a PDP, providing more specific guidance to working group chairs, and exploring new or additional conflict resolution mechanisms).

Framework of Principles for Cross-Community Working Groups

In 2014, the ccNSO and GNSO jointly chartered a cross-community working group to develop a set of uniform principles to govern the initiation, formation, operation and closure of future cross-community working groups, based on earlier work that had been undertaken within these two supporting organizations. In October and November 2016, the GNSO and ccNSO Councils approved the final framework of principles recommended by the working group (<https://gnso.icann.org/drafts/uniform-framework-principles-recommendations-16sep16-en.pdf>). The principles have since served as a model for several other cross-community efforts, and certain aspects have been used as a starting point for developing new and flexible tools to facilitate greater cross-community participation in GNSO PDPs (for example, in the new work track 5 on geographical names at the top level within the GNSO PDP on New gTLD subsequent procedures).

Facilitated PDP Face-to-Face Working Group Meetings

Beginning in 2014, limited funding was made available as a pilot project to enable GNSO PDP working groups that are at a critical stage of deliberations to conduct one-day face-to-face meetings either at the beginning or the end of an ICANN Public Meeting. At least two working groups made use of the opportunity, in 2014 and 2015. However, based on group members' feedback, this effort has not been continued. Instead, the GNSO Council has sought to apportion blocks of time (where available) for consecutive PDP sessions in order to maximize the effectiveness of working groups at ICANN Public Meetings.

In addition, professional facilitators have been used in a few situations where this was considered necessary by the relevant community leadership team and within the limits of the policy budget. For example, at ICANN59 in Johannesburg in June 2017, a professional

facilitator was used to moderate community discussions over the best way to ensure broad and meaningful participation by all community groups in the GNSO's policy development work regarding geographical names as top-level domains. More recently, as part of the GNSO's temporary specification for gTLD registration data expedited policy development process, professional facilitators have been used to help mediate and facilitate face-to-face meetings of the working group.

ICANN Learn

GNSO support staff have been working with the Public Responsibility Support Department to update and improve the existing content on ICANN Learn that is relevant to the GNSO. This is part of a broader project being undertaken by the Policy Support Department to enlarge and deepen the content on ICANN Learn relating to the policy work of all ICANN's Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees.

2. The following section describes initiatives that address recommendations 10.3 and 10.5.

Community Regional Outreach Pilot Program (CROPP), Community Regional Outreach Program (CROP)

CROPP began as a pilot program that provided a framework in which each of the five Regional At-Large Organizations (RALOs) and all the GNSO Non-Contracted Party House (NCPH) constituencies (i.e. the Business Constituency, the Intellectual Property Constituency, the Internet Service Providers & Connectivity Providers Constituency, the Non-Commercial Users Constituency and the Not-for-Profit Operational Concerns Constituency) were each allocated five regional (three-day) outreach trips. The specific processes and guidelines for how these resources were made available were set forth on the [CROPP FY16 Program Elements](#) page. Eligibility for the CROPP program depended on each participating ICANN structure developing an outreach strategic plan explaining its outreach goals and planned expectations so that any selected CROPP activities could be coordinated with the appropriate ICANN regional engagement teams. GNSO constituencies had the additional option, on a pilot basis, to select either: (a) the five standard CROPP travel authorizations, or (b) to host, co-host, or sponsor a targeted community outreach/engagement event at one point during the fiscal year (with a US \$10,000 target support limit). One community selected and utilized the "event" option in FY16. The CROPP was administered and monitored by the ICANN org Policy staff to assess its effectiveness and to determine if future allocation of resources would be appropriate. As a result of positive feedback, the pilot program was continued in FY17 with minor adjustments.

Following further evaluation, CROPP was moved into the core ICANN annual budget in FY18 as a regularly-funded activity known as the Community Regional Outreach Program (CROP), although the actual amount of funding allocated for the program each year will be determined by the Board on the advice of the ICANN org. For FY19, in addition to a more limited budget compared to FY18, the ICANN org was asked to develop more stringent conditions for the program in order to ensure that the regional outreach plans of each eligible group and its usage

of the allowable trips are aligned directly with current policy development or advisory activities being undertaken by that group and/or the ICANN community. The scope, objectives and applicable guidelines for CROP can be found here:

<https://community.icann.org/display/CROP19>.

The ICANN org continues to administer and monitor the CROP. A full assessment of the program spanning its usage and proposing more robust guidelines and metrics is expected to be prepared in time for the FY20 iteration of the program; however, the overall program objectives are currently expected to remain unchanged. These objectives are:

- Building local/regional awareness and recruitment of new community members.
- More effectively engaging with current members and/or "reactivating" previously engaged ICANN community members.
- Communicating ICANN's mission and objectives to new audiences.

3. The following section describes two initiatives that address recommendation 10.2.

GAC-GNSO Consultation Group (CG) on Early Engagement of the GAC in Policy Development Processes

In March 2014 the GNSO and GAC formed a joint consultation group (CG) to explore mechanisms to facilitate GAC early engagement in GNSO policy development processes - see <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsogcgogeeipdp/3.+Charter>. The CG's deliberations focused on two tracks: (1) a mechanism for day-to-day ongoing cooperation; and (2) a mechanism for GAC early engagement in GNSO PDPs. The CG submitted its final status update and proposed recommendations to the GNSO and GAC in October 2016 (see <https://gnsso.icann.org/en/drafts/gac-status-report-rec-10oct16-en.pdf>). An implementation plan was developed by the ICANN org in 2017, and completion of implementation of all the CG's recommendations was acknowledged during the GAC-GNSO joint meeting at ICANN61 in Puerto Rico in March 2018 (<https://static.ptbl.co/static/attachments/169461/1520977983.pdf?1520977983>). The two most significant recommendations implemented are most likely the introduction of a quick look mechanism for the GAC that provides it with early notice of a GNSO PDP and the development of an appointed liaison from the GNSO to the GAC (see further below).

Improving Communication Flow Between the GAC and the GNSO

As part of the discussions between the GNSO and GAC on how to facilitate early engagement of the GAC in GNSO policy development activities, the GAC-GNSO Consultation Group on GAC early engagement in GNSO policy development activities implemented a two-year pilot program in FY15-16 whereby the GNSO would appoint a yearly liaison to the GAC. Following a review, the GAC-GNSO Consultation Group recommended that this feature be transformed into a permanent role. The GNSO liaison to the GAC is primarily responsible for providing timely updates to, and answering questions from, the GAC on GNSO policy development activities as

a complement to existing notification processes. The liaison also is responsible for providing the GNSO Council with regular updates on those GAC activities that relate to issues of interest to the GNSO. In addition, regular coordination calls are scheduled between the GNSO liaison to the GAC and the GAC secretariat to ensure relevant information is being provided and received. The objective of the liaison mechanism is to facilitate effective early engagement of the GAC as well as generally assist with flow of information between the GAC and the GNSO.

Useful Links

GNSO Improvements – Opportunities for Streamlining & Improvements -

https://gns0.icann.org/sites/default/files/filefield_43483/pdp-improvements-table-16jan14-en.pdf

Memo: GNSO Policy Development Process (PDP) Improvements End Report -

<https://gns0.icann.org/sites/default/files/file/field-file-attach/2016-12/memo-pdp-improvements-09jun16-en.pdf>

GNSO Council motion - June 2016 - <https://gns0.icann.org/en/council/resolutions#201606>

Report on survey of community views on GNSO newcomer tools -

<https://gns0.icann.org/sites/default/files/file/field-file-attach/2016-12/newcomer-tools-survey-04oct16-en.pdf>

CROPP FY16 Program Elements -

[https://community.icann.org/display/croppfy16/Community+Regional+Outreach+Pilot+Program+\(CROPP\)-FY16+Home](https://community.icann.org/display/croppfy16/Community+Regional+Outreach+Pilot+Program+(CROPP)-FY16+Home)

CROPP FY16 - Administrator's Summary Report -

<https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=62391450>

GNSO Council motions - November 2016 -

<https://community.icann.org/display/gnsocouncilmeetings/Motions+7+November+2016>

GAC-GNSO Consultation Group on GAC Early Engagement in GNSO Policy Development Process - <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsogcgojeeipdp/3.+Charter>

GNSO Review Independent Examiner - Final Report - September 2015 -

<https://www.icann.org/zh/system/files/files/gns0-review-final-summary-15sep15-en.pdf>

Board adoption of GNSO Review Independent Examiner - Final Report -

<https://features.icann.org/independent-review-generic-names-supporting-organization-final-report-and-recommendations>

GNSO Council motion - December 2016 -

<https://gns0.icann.org/en/council/resolutions#20161215-3>

GNSO Review Implementation Plan -

<https://community.icann.org/display/GRWG/Background+documents?preview=/61610373/64068111/GNSO%20Review%20Implementation%20Plan%2021%20November%202016.pdf>

Board resolution - February 2017 -

<https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2017-02-03-en#1>.