

Attendance:

Alan Greenberg (Member / ALAC)
Becky Burr (Participant / Board Liaison)
Ching Chiao (ccNSO Appointed Co-Chair / ccNSO)
Elliot Noss (Member / GNSO)
Erika Mann (GNSO Appointed Co-Chair / Individual)
Hadia Elminiawi (Participant / Individual)
Judith Hellerstein (Member / At-Large)
Julf Helsingius (Participant / Individual)
Maureen Hilyard (Member / ALAC)
Nathalie Coupet (Participant / Individual)
Rajaram Gnanajeyaraman (Participant / Individual)
Robert Guerra (Member / SSAC)
Stephen Deerhake (Member / ccNSO)
Zakir Syed (Participant / GNSO NCUC)

Audio only:

Kavouss Arasteh (Member / GAC)
Sebastien Bachollet (Member / ALAC)
Xavier Calvez (staff)

Apologies:

John Levine
Maarten Botterman
Vanda Scartezini
Alberto Soto
Sally Costerton (staff)
Emily Crane Pimentel (staff)
Samantha Eisner (staff)

Staff:

Marika Konings
Joke Braeken
Julia Charvolen
Lauren Allison
Michelle DeSmyter

AC chat:

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear all, welcome to the CCWG New gTLD Auction Proceeds call on Wednesday, 10 April 2019 at 14:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/rxZIBg>

Julf Helsingius:Wow, that's quite an echo!

Ching Chiao:sorry about that, just turned off the speaker on my laptop

Erika Mann:I'm here!

Erika Mann:Always a good idea to test mikes

Erika Mann:Michelle, I will test mine too

Michelle DeSmyter:perfect, ready when you are ;)

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:hello all

Judith Hellerstein:HI All. I forgot to add my member info as I did not get the option this time but I am a Member form ALAC

Marika Konings:Please remember to add your status and affiliation to your name in Adobe Connect. You can do this by going to the drop down menu and click 'edit info'

Maureen Hilyard:Hi all sorry Im late

Judith Hellerstein:@marika I have no drop down menu for adobe

Judith Hellerstein:so could not edit that info

Maureen Hilyard - ALAC member:Judith on the right of Attendees at the top of the list of attendees

Marika Konings:@Judith - I've updated it for you :-)

Julf Helsingius:Don't sem to have a menu choice fr that either

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@marika Thanks. On the adobe add on the desktop this does not exist

Julf Helsingius:Ah, found it (using web app on Opera)

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):I found it. It is on Attendees and not on participants

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):If the small group met, I wasn't involved.

Michelle DeSmyter:We do not have Marilyn on the phone at this time

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):To be clear, I was not active!

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):Mea culpa.

Marika Konings:As a reminder, the small team action item coming out of Kobe was to review the example list as well as guidelines and consider whether additional language should be added to reflect this notion that "Evaluators may need to differentiate between what it is in the regular operational budget and what has been funded on a more exceptional basis, but this will be a determination that needs to be made by the evaluators in line with the legal and fiduciary requirements" which are also referenced in the Board input.

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):Perhaps we need to schedule a short meeting to come to closure.

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Marika - yes the group has to meet to consolidate a statement based on the current discussion

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@alan I agree with you

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):I agree with Alan

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):I agree with Alan in the idea that weshould not be eliminating good projects for arbitrary reason

Hadia Elminiawi:I also agree with Alan

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):But I also agree with Elliott in that if there is money not used in the UA budget we can see why that is so but that should not prevent more outreach on UA to other regions that had no awareness of it

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Elliot I think what you are saying is not unlike what Alan said as well

elliott noss:that did not feel to me like what I said

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@alan we are so not have an indigenous program. We had but it was no longer funded. Nor do we have a program that encourages people with disabilities to come to ICANN

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):@Judith. I don't want to fight for particular projects here. It is the concept.

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):ANYTHING tat is within ICANN's mission iare things we COULD fund if we had sufficient funds.

elliott noss:yep. and they already grabbed \$36m!

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):I think the Board has said the Org itself will NOT apply.

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):A call would be great

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@elliott are you talking about the Board taking funds from Auction Proceeds?

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):Yes a call would be great. Happy to be on the call

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Judith - The Board has already taken funds for the Reserve

elliott noss:no need maybe. let's see. the comment speaks for itself and it seemed a number of people supported and no one opposed

Erika Mann:Okay Elliot!

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Marika.. yes the comment was supported

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@maureen I know but was just seeking to understand Elliotts question

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):Julf and Robert have their hands up..

Julf Helsingius [Member/NCSSG]:old hand

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Marika - yes there was the additional comment made to include applications from other communities as you say - not to be too restrictive

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@erika, I like a broader category since it also captures underserved regions in developed countries such as indigenous in the US and Canada, and in australia and new zealand

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):They would not be covered in an LDC categorization

Ching Chiao:i have some follow-up thoughts on this and will be happy to share later on the list ...

Ching Chiao:in generally I think it's important to leave some guidances here for the implmentation phase

Ching Chiao:it seems that I can't

Ching Chiao:am talking without muting

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:In regards to language - my view is that - efforts should be made to encourage proposals from under represented communities and regions - instead of "support projects from under-represented..

Michelle DeSmyter:Checking on Ching's line

Ching Chiao:yes

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@robert I agree with you

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:@judith - thanks!

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):Is the revised statement written up somewhere? so we can see what needs to be reviewed?

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@erika that is fine

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@erika yes that is exactly my question

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):We tried with our indigenous program and made some great headways but it was lost when the program was no longer funded

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):We found the traditional methods of outreach are no as effective in certain communities where the cultures are different

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):We do need to be thoughtful on the words and guidelines for overhead. But I don't think we can work at the level of detail.

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:We may want to define limitations on on how to promote / encourage development from under represented groups/regions. The "how and how much" , as elliot, mentions is a key issue and agree that we need to at least be able to show an effort that such outreach has been attempted - but not spending all the funds on attempting to reach and meet each specific underrepresented group

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Judith but the Fellowship and Next Gen are working with indigenous communities as a followup - but this statement we are making needs to be more high level

elliot noss (Member/GNSO):to be clearer, I agree it is both desirable and important. I fear making outreach a requirement in the abstract. @alan I will share some language in our small group that may help

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:lessons learned from CIRA, ISOC , ICANN (fellowship/nextgen) would be most helpful

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@maureen but they are workin in the traditional methods and not exclusively with indigenous

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):Outreach needs to be different for each community

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@robert the Global Indigenous Fellowship program within At large ran for 2 years and has some good lessons to be learned

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@robert the GIA was no longer funded as the main ICANN fellowship would conduct outreach to indigenous groups living in developed countries

elliot noss (Member/GNSO):should we just use agree/disagree above

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Erika - agree about ensuring that there are definitions for some of the wording e.g. independent and other words that are asked for in the leadership comments

Robert Guerra [Member/SSAC]:this touches on the last issue discussed - in regards that an independant panel review and select/nominate proposals, but ultimately it needs board approval - as its part of their fiduciary resposnibility

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):yes @robert, after these are selected to insure due dilligence but not to make the choices

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):Yes it has been addressed and is why an independent panel is needed

Zakir Syed (Participant/NCUC):we cant

Hadia Elminiawi (Participant/Individual):yes we can hear you

Zakir Syed (Participant/NCUC):i can, now. thnx
Marika Konings:Please see the detailed BC comment starting on page 7
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):ugh. compensation? please no
Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):@Erika - as suggested by Ching earlier we should leave some of these points for the implementers
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):my strong view is the evaluators WILL come from the community
Zakir Syed (Participant/GNSO NCUC):may be or may be not.
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):that was a commercial example and, given the subject matter, it would have been TERRIBLE for the community to evaluate new gTLD apps. it would have become a beauty contest
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):and understood re: the comment
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):my hand is down
Marika Konings:there is a question about whether ICANN or consistituent parts can apply for funding, not sure if you are referring to that one?
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):my hand is up
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):an old hand!
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):registrar's were most concerned with the items already discussed and agreed to
Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):Regarding Elliot's commen on pet projects. Agree that does not discriminate, but we will need to be careful that one does not only select their pet projects to the disadvantage of other good projects.
Hadia Elminiawi (Participant/Individual):Sorry I need to leave - thank you all - bye
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):registrars DO think it should be community, but that was not the predominate concern @marika. you can group it, but lightly if that makes sense
Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):Bye Hadia
Julf Helsingius (NCSG):Just looking into it
Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@julf can you clarify
Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):The "independent" panel would be multistakeholder, would it not?
Julf Helsingius (NCSG):Just making sure there is diversity in people lookig into it
Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@maureen that is what I thought and related to the next comment by access now and ISPCP
Julf Helsingius (NCSG):So yes, jsut making sure that there is broad (and fair) representation across the community
Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):+1 Julf
Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):I think all these items are related and it is as Julf said we need to make sure there is fair and broad representation on the independent panel
Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):Civil society have had an opportunity to be involved in the design process at least - implementation phase is still to come
elliott noss (Member/GNSO):apologies. I need go now as well. bye all and thanks
Zakir:bye elliot. thank you.
Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):I like this idea as we could make sure the advisory committee is composed of community members who are multi stakeholder and could be a broad representation from the community

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):*Judith.. I like the idea of an advisory committee for monitoring process, advisory

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):yes alan it is not the independent committee doing the selection process but a guiding force to it

Alan Greenberg (Member: ALAC):Actually I would prefer an occasional conf call...

Judith Hellerstein (Member: ALAC):@maureen exactly not choosing the selection or candidates but giving advice to the independent panel

Maureen Hilyard (Member-ALAC):Good with that Erika

Marika Konings:<https://community.icann.org/x/zYMWBg>

Marika Konings:yes, as a reminder, the full comments can be found in the body of each template

Julf Helsingius (NCSG):Thank yoy everybody!

Ching Chiao (ccNSO Appointed Co-Chair/ccNSO):Bye everyone!

Joke Braeken:thank you all. Bye

Stephen Deerhake (Member; ccNSO):bye everyone.

Erika Mann (GNSO Appointed Co-Chair/Individual):Bye, bye