

**Attendance:**

Alexander Schubert	Kavouss Arasteh
Annebeth Lange	Kristine Dorrain (Amazon Registry)
Barrack Otieno	Marita Moll
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co Chair)	Martin Sutton
Christopher Wilkinson	Matt Johnson
David McAuley	Nick Wenban-Smith# Nominet
Dev Anand Teelucksingh	Paul McGrady
Ejikeme Egbuogu	Raymond Mamattah
Greg Shatan	Robin Gross
Griffin Barnett	Sophie Hey
Jaap Akkerhuis	Susan Anthony
Jeff Neuman (Co-Chair)	Susan Payne
Jim Prendergast	Tom Dale
John Rodriguez	Vernatius Ezeama
Justine Chew	Vrikson Acosta
	Yrjo Lansipuro

**Apologies:**

Flip Petillion  
Abdulkarim Oloyede

**Staff:**

Antonietta Mangiacotti  
Emily Barabas  
Julie Hedlund  
Steve Chan  
Andrea Glandon

**Zoom Chat:**

14:52:41 From Arasteh : Hi Andrea  
14:52:52 From Andrea Glandon : Hello Kavouss  
14:53:33 From Arasteh : Hi everyone  
14:53:51 From Annebeth Lange : Someone on the line having a conversation?  
14:54:57 From Andrea Glandon : Thank you everyone, please remember to mute your line.  
15:03:45 From martinsutton : Thanks for the reminder Annebeth  
15:04:19 From Steve Chan : Document can be found here:  
[https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1WKSC\\_pPBviCnbHxW171Zlp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs/edit#gid=843000317](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1WKSC_pPBviCnbHxW171Zlp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs/edit#gid=843000317)  
15:10:52 From Justine Chew : Not really as usual for ALAC  
15:12:09 From Justine Chew : Thanks for the intervention @Martin  
15:18:46 From martinsutton : @Susan - to the last point, should we classify IPC comment just as divergent (not supported)?  
15:19:28 From PMcGrady : I'm having trouble hearing Martin

15:19:44 From Steve Chan : @Susan, we flagged as Agreement (partially - first part) Divergence (with second part)

15:20:13 From Marita Moll : Sorry to be late. Overlapping calls and I'm not very good at doing two at once

15:20:46 From Justine Chew : @Steve field D172 is the agreement and divergence reversed?

15:21:03 From Steve Chan : Yes Justine, I just realized that and switched it

15:21:15 From Justine Chew : @Steve, cheers.

15:24:09 From Justine Chew : @Steve, sorry are D171 and D172 swapped? I'm having trouble reconciling the colours in B171 and B172 and what is "first part" and what is "second part"

15:24:34 From Steve Chan : @Justine, I'll have to look later :)

15:24:40 From Justine Chew : Thanks!

15:26:53 From John Rodriguez : I would just be cautious that when we refer to "governements" we aren't referring to all governments. Thanks!

15:31:55 From Justine Chew : I think so too @Martin

15:32:30 From Steve Chan : @Martin, is the edit on screen what you had in mind?

15:33:10 From Arasteh : IPC ISD VERY PROACTIVE

15:33:26 From Susan Payne : I don't think the blue sentence is a new idea

15:33:28 From Steve Chan : Correct, that's what I was asking about

15:33:28 From Justine Chew : @Steve, I think the last paragraph in B13 too

15:35:34 From Justine Chew : I think we should leave it as black

15:35:36 From PMcGrady : It should be marked down as disagreement + new idea.

15:36:15 From Steve Chan : @All, like so?

15:36:23 From Arasteh : Martin do you have suggestion to change the Language

15:36:41 From Steve Chan : And would def appreciate an assist on the other comment Susan!

15:37:44 From PMcGrady : Is this exact match idea anywhere else in the document? If so, I guess it wouldn't be a new idea, just support of the idea somewhere else (if it is somewhere else).

15:37:45 From christopher wilkinson : @ John Rodriguez - in my experience, most governments just assume that common sense will prevail, and that they can intervene in the interests of their people at a later stage. Just to be cautious. CW

15:38:11 From PMcGrady : +1 Susan and Martin.

15:39:00 From Susan Payne : 28 on the previous tab is the other one

15:39:36 From Steve Chan : @Susan, will take a look afterwards, thanks

15:40:45 From Andrea Glandon : I have muted the line

15:43:06 From Justine Chew : I understand Susan's point. Am trying to see if categorization is correct.

15:44:21 From Greg Shatan : The full comment will hopefully be illuminating....

15:45:28 From martinsutton : thank you Justine

15:45:33 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co Chair) : thx Justine I think there was reserved concerns

15:45:40 From Marita Moll : re: ALAC item -- I think Justine has nailed it

15:47:18 From Susan Payne : thanks Justine, I was misunderstanding your comment, but it turns out that it was wrongly categorised in a different way :)

15:48:19 From Susan Payne : well what would you have then Christopher?

15:48:24 From Robin Gross : We need to remember the principle of predictability and lists help immensely with that.

15:49:16 From Greg Shatan : I guess that means we won't use those ISO lists.....

15:50:07 From christopher wilkinson : @Susan - All Geo-names, world - wide. All languages and scripts.

15:50:58 From Dev Anand Teelucksingh : unfortunately have to leave the call  
15:51:27 From christopher wilkinson : @ Greg - I have pointed out months ago that the ISO Lits do NOT address the situation in many countries.  
15:52:19 From Susan Payne : does the oredr of categorisation matter? both the last 2 appear to be Divergence for reasons specified  
15:52:25 From Susan Payne : order  
15:53:25 From Susan Payne : same comment as above for this Q too  
15:53:30 From Steve Chan : @susan, do you mean because there are concerns and divergence?  
15:53:35 From Susan Payne : yes steve  
15:54:23 From Steve Chan : I think that's up for you all to decide if it matters, whether the distinction matters for your consideration?  
15:56:52 From martinsutton : I think we have muddled the comment/commentor on that item  
Susan  
15:57:01 From martinsutton : Checking now  
15:57:14 From Steve Chan : Having the Concerns does not remove the Divergence?  
15:57:19 From Marita Moll : line 74 -- divergence although there is also an explanation  
15:57:41 From Robin Gross : I would say that NCSG's comment in #72 is closer to a "Qualified Agreement" (rather than simple Agreement) in order to not lose the point made.  
15:57:42 From Greg Shatan : Is there also "carefree" divergence?  
15:58:05 From Greg Shatan : Divergence is always indicative of concerns, is it not/  
15:58:13 From Alexander Schubert : How do you spell "Kafka"?  
15:58:14 From David McAuley : I have to leave for another matter, thanks Annebeth and all  
15:58:15 From Greg Shatan : So we don't need to say it.  
15:58:44 From Greg Shatan : Kafka, Esq.  
15:58:47 From jaap : I have to drop off for an other call.  
15:58:57 From jaap : Bye  
15:59:00 From Alexander Schubert : Esquire?  
15:59:46 From PMcGrady : Is this call 60 minutes or 90? It is in my calendar as 60.  
15:59:47 From christopher wilkinson : Do these subtleties matter? If the staff summary is ambiguous it is enough to click on the original comment. Comments made on the List or in WT5 Calls carry as much wiethg  
15:59:57 From christopher wilkinson : Weight  
16:00:14 From Susan Payne : 90 paul  
16:00:18 From Justine Chew : Looking at it now  
16:00:58 From PMcGrady : Thanks.  
16:01:07 From Robin Gross : If agreement is purely conditional, I think it important to note that.  
16:02:00 From Steve Chan : @Martin, we will go through the document and try to make sure any other BRG/RrSG mis-assignments are fixed  
16:02:24 From martinsutton : Hoorah!  
16:02:33 From martinsutton : Well done everyone  
16:02:52 From PMcGrady : Let's hang up quickly before....  
16:02:56 From christopher wilkinson : Brilliant chairmanship!  
16:03:12 From Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet : well done Annebeth!  
16:03:30 From Arasteh : It is good that people are happy  
16:04:19 From Kristine Dorrain (Amazon Registry) : I agree Susan  
16:04:34 From Marita Moll : We could call the ALAC comment Agreement (qualified)  
16:04:49 From Robin Gross : #73 says "According, the RrSG does not support" so that is just the conclusion, not a separate comment.

16:05:06 From Alexander Schubert : Indeed well done Annabeth!  
16:05:09 From Justine Chew : Sorry, I got kicked out of Zoom  
16:05:36 From christopher wilkinson : PRTICIP  
16:05:39 From Robin Gross : #73 is Only Divergence (not also concerns)  
16:06:02 From christopher wilkinson : Participants do not have scrolling rights. Correct?  
16:06:16 From Arasteh : I DISAGREE  
16:06:29 From Justine Chew : f.2.4 Line 87/8 ALAC comment should be Agreement (Qualified) +  
Concerns  
16:06:33 From Marita Moll : NO scrolling rights -- very frustrating  
16:06:33 From Arasteh : iAM DISCONNECTED  
16:06:48 From Arasteh : Sorry fior CAP  
16:07:16 From Susan Payne : also 50 and 51  
16:07:46 From Robin Gross : #72 from NCSG is a CONDITIONAL Agreement  
16:07:55 From Robin Gross : I'm not on audio  
16:08:01 From Susan Payne : 34 aND 35  
16:08:29 From Robin Gross : Yes, it is conditional agreement.  
16:08:36 From Robin Gross : Thank you.  
16:08:42 From Susan Payne : AND 50 AND 51  
16:08:48 From Susan Payne : sorry for caps  
16:08:53 From Arasteh : am disconnected  
16:08:54 From christopher wilkinson : There is nothing wrong with expanding the scope of  
approval, non-objection.  
16:09:03 From Andrea Glandon : @kavouss, calling you back  
16:12:05 From Susan Payne : Thanks Steve that helps  
16:13:28 From Andrea Glandon : @kavouss, I do show that you line is connected and unmuted  
from my end  
16:13:34 From Raymond Mamattah : No please from me  
16:14:10 From Marita Moll : Leaving now. Bye.  
16:14:25 From Justine Chew : Do we have any more open topics?  
16:14:26 From Greg Shatan : No concerned, divergent ideas please.  
16:14:57 From Robin Gross : Agree that it is good to spend time on the difficult issues in  
Marrakech.  
16:15:34 From Raymond Mamattah : Hope those of us who cant make it to ICANN 65 can join  
virtually  
16:16:17 From martinsutton : Remote access will be available for WT5 meetings at ICANN  
16:16:44 From Raymond Mamattah : okay. no travel opportunities to ICANN 65?  
16:19:10 From Susan Payne : good to know the last 15 minutes are soapbox time  
16:19:26 From Greg Shatan : The TLD space was never intended to be a gazetteer or an atlas.  
16:19:31 From PMcGrady : Silence does not equal assent.  
16:19:45 From Robin Gross : Right, Paul. Same.  
16:19:51 From Susan Payne : Quite Paul  
16:19:51 From Greg Shatan : I am assuming that silence is disagreement in this case.  
16:20:13 From Steve Chan : Next call is currently scheduled for: Wednesday, 22 May 2019 at  
05:00 UTC for 90 minutes  
16:20:33 From PMcGrady : @Steve, please note the next meeting is in the middle of the INTA  
meeting.  
16:20:40 From Robin Gross : Thanks, Annabeth and Martin. Bye!  
16:20:40 From Griffin Barnett : +1 Paul, Susan

16:20:41 From Susan Payne : thanks Annebeth  
16:20:44 From Ejikeme Egbuogu : bye everyone  
16:20:46 From martinsutton : Bye all, thank you  
16:20:46 From Raymond Mamattah : Thank you and greetings from Ghana  
16:20:46 From Steve Chan : Thanks Paul  
16:20:52 From Greg Shatan : Bye  
16:20:54 From Justine Chew : Thanks Annebeth