

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

We will now begin the official recording and interpretation of this call. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening, everyone. Welcome to the AFRALO monthly teleconference call on Wednesday, the 10<sup>th</sup> of April, 2019, at 18:30 UTC.

On the call today on the English channel, we have Mohamad El Bashir, Remmy Nweke, Pastor Peters, Abdulkarim Oloyede, Sarata Omane, Aisha Hamid, Vernatius Okwu Ezeama, Daniel Chimezie, Esther Patricia Akello, [Omar Sheran,] Yaovi Atohoun, Sarah Kiden, Bram Fudzulani, Maureen Hilyard, Nkem Nweke, Yazid Akanho, Fatimata Seye Sylla, [Bam Oshien], Mary Uduma, [Femmy Falovi,] and Ore Lesi.

On the French channel, we have Aïcha Abbad, Montrésor Konan, Ibtissam Kaifouf, Gabdibé Gab-Hingonne, and Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong.

From staff, we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, and myself, Claudia Ruiz, on call management.

Our interpreters for today are Jacques and Arielle.

Before we begin, I would like to remind everyone to please state their name before speaking for transcription purposes and also so the interpreters can identify you on the other language channels. And also a friendly reminder to please mute your lines when not speaking to prevent any background noise.

Thank you, and with this, I turn it over to you, Mohamed.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Claudia and staff. Good evening, everyone. Welcome to the monthly AFRALO call. For some of you, it might be a different time zone, like for Maureen. Thank you, Maureen, for joining us for this call. Please mute your line if you're not speaking so we can have a productive call, or at least also staff could mute the numbers if there's a possibility for that. So we'll start and proceed and try to finish on time.

Going to the agenda items, reviewing our action items from the previous meeting, I'll just paste in Adobe Connect the link to the previous action items. So the leadership had a task to send an e-mail requesting an expression of interest for a new AFRALO representative in our new gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group Five. It has been done. We received expression of interest and we will provide you with the outcome, the selection. Aziz and Tijani had a task to send their prospective reports on actions performed with AFRALO discretionary funds because we supported an event. Sarah and AFRALO leaders had also [met] to present to you from this meeting individual membership details as part of the conference call. The last action on our side was that we need to finalize arrangements for the AFRALO/AfrICANN meeting, which has been done. The meeting successfully was held in Kobe. So that's for the previous action items.

Regarding the open ICANN public comments periods, you can see on Adobe Connect. If you're not on Adobe Connect, I will just list the name of those so you can be aware of that.

---

So there is several open comments periods currently, most of them related to renewals of the registry agreement. For example, there is dot-info registry agreement, dot-org, dot-asia, and dot-biz registry agreement renewals for public comments. There's also, for Hebrew script, root zone label generation rules, and the GNSO EPDP on the temporary specifications recommendation to the board, which is also on the public comment and due to be closed on the 17<sup>th</sup> of April. So that's for the current open public comments periods.

We're going to hear from our representative in ALAC regarding ALAC activities and what has been ratified or approved in terms of statements or comments from ALAC.

So without further ado, we can proceed to Agenda Item #4, which is the reports. We can start with the ALAC [I think is report] by our representatives in ALAC, starting with Tijani, Hadia, and Seun. I hope Seun is with us because I know he's in an AFRINIC meeting.

So, Tijani, if you are available to speak, please, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. Do you hear me?

REMMY NWEKE: This is Remmy Nweke, [inaudible].

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes. Very well. Please proceed.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay. Thank you very much. So ALAC is working very hard on the ATLAS III summit. There is two tracks, but besides the two tracks there is sub-tracks. One track is for the program, for the content, and another track is for the delegates selection. I am part of the second track working group, and we had a very serious discussion about the regional balance or, let's say, the regional representation of this summit. Since we have only 60 slots besides ALAC and the regional leaders, so there will be a selection. All ALSes and all individual members will not be invited; only those who are selected.

And for this selection, there are criteria. We worked on the criteria. We put some, I think, very good criteria. The very important thing is that the African part of this working group [inaudible] very, very strongly on the regional representation. We managed to have a commitment that there will be at least ten from each region, while before there wasn't any commitment like this. Before, the idea was to have those who have the best score in this selection.

We opposed this approach since there are specific circumstances for each region, and you cannot apply the same criteria for all regions because there are several problems. Some of them are related to language. Others are related to connectivity, etc., etc.

So, at the end, we reached consensus that you will have at least ten representatives from Africa and ten from each region. This is the first track. Now, the application form will be released, I think, on the 15<sup>th</sup> of April. So you will receive this application form, and those who

---

are interested in participating have to pass the criteria that are listed in this application form.

The second track is about programs, about substance. They are working on the ...

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Hello? Tijani, did we lose you?

Maybe we lost Tijani's connection. So, Hadia, if you are available to provide your update, please go ahead.

Do we have Hadia on the call?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hi, Mohamed. No, Hadia is not on. I'm going to see if [inaudible] can get a hold of her. Apologies.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure. Thank you. So if ... Let's wait for Hadia/Tijani to reconnect again. If, Seun, you are available ...

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hadia has just joined the AC.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay.

---

CLAUDIA RUIZ: So let's see. Hello, Hadia. Welcome. Can you please test your audio?

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Am I going to give feedback about the EPDP? Or the ALAC activities?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Hadia. This is about ALAC activities.

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Which part are we doing now?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: ALAC activities update.

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Okay. So we've been having an ICANN65 – I'm sorry. I haven't prepared for that, but I'll try to talk about the things I've been attending. So we've been doing an [ALAC 65] planning for it, for Morocco. Also, we've been working on the ATLAS III, which is going to be in Montréal. We've been also talking about the EPDP, the ALAC advice to the board with regard to the EPDP, and an advice has been drafted and is currently on the Wiki page. It basically [inaudible]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: It's Mohamed here. I think we have—

HADIA ELMINIAWI: It talks about three main topics, which are the thin and thick WHOIS. It sort of requests the [inaudible] And the other thing about the differentiation is on the geographic location, and the advice says that we would like to be open.

Finally, the distinction between legal and natural persons, the need to attempt to address this advice, too. And we are going [inaudible].

So those are some of the things that we've been working on.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Hadia, for the update. That's really appreciated. I mean, your line was breaking up. I think you were using the Adobe Connect, but I think we managed to hear some of that.

So we can proceed to the next agenda item, which is the NomCom update by Aziz Hilali, our AFRALO representative in NomCom. I'm not sure if Aziz is online or not.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Mohamed. Apologies. No, Aziz has not joined yet. We're seeing him, but would you like to [go over his presentation?]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes. I will give his update. Can you please put his presentation on the AC?

---

No, it's a Word document shared on an e-mail before the meeting.

Yes, thank you very much. So Aziz is not available, but he sent us an update [inaudible] report regarding the NomCom activities. It's currently being displayed in the Adobe Connect if you can see.

So, this year, NomCom's process is important for Africa because we have two board members currently from Africa, and they're expected to step down. One of them is the Chair of the Board, Cherine Chalaby, and the other one is Khaled Koubaa. He expressed his desire to step down, so that's why the NomCom was active in trying to recruit and try to encourage African applicants to apply.

So according to Aziz's report, after the closure of the application period, the NomCom has received a total of 128 completed applications, and 57 of those were from Africa, which is a good number, frankly. I think the challenge will be to – hopefully they had received good, qualified applicants who could proceed to the next level of the selection and rise to the requirements of the Board.

So Africans had the biggest number of applications received. Asia Pacific, they received 35 from Asia-Pacific, 13 from Europe, 21 from Latin America and the Caribbean, and two from North America. Still, the applications are more leaning to males. They received 85 male applications, while we have 43 female candidates. So, while we still have a kind of gender diversity, there's still some work that needs to be done.

---

So this is, in a quick nutshell, the status of the NomCom. We should appreciate Aziz's work on the NomCom. It is a really good job, and he was trying to reach out to African candidates.

So let's proceed and move to the next agenda item, which is the AFRALO ALS activities. So, please, the floor is yours. Please update us about any activities in your country or that, regionally, you participated in as an ALS.

I can see one raised hand. Tijani, and then Bram. So if we can please proceed.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Mohamed. My ALS – the FMIA – organized the Tunisian SIG (The Tunisian School on Internet Governance) next month. We are working with ISOC Tunisia on that. We prepared the program, and everything is now set for it. It will be done on the 5<sup>th</sup> or 4<sup>th</sup> of next May. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Tijani. Bram, please.

BRAM FUDZULANI:

[inaudible] of World Consumer Day last month. We had a few [outreach] where we focused on the digital aspect [inaudible] fall in line with the theme, which was: build digital world for consumers, where consumers can actually [inaudible]. We also organized on 25<sup>th</sup> of this month. There's commemorations of [inaudible], and we will have an

---

outreach where we will visit a school and commemorate [inaudible]. And I think the results of that I will share with colleagues for the updating of our AFRALO page. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Bram. Michel?

I guess Michel is not ready. We can give the chance now to Mary. Please go ahead, Mary.

MARY UDUMA: Can you hear me?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can hear you. We can hear you very well, Mary. Please.

MARY UDUMA: Okay. Good evening, good afternoon, everyone. This is Mary Uduma from Nigeria. Activities that are happening within my region. We'll be holding the first Nigerian Internet Governance Forum – I mean, the first Nigerian Internet Governance Forum in collaboration with ISOC Nigeria – in July. Also, we're going to hold our second West African School of Internet Governance in July as well. That one will happen in Uganda. So just to notify the group what we are doing [this week] in the sub-region as well as in Nigeria. Thank you.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Mary. I'll try to give another chance to Michel. I'm not sure if you would like to speak, and you are on the French channel. So, please, it's your chance to speak now.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Mohamed. This is Claudia. I asked the interpreters, and it appears that, no, he's not speaking in French, either.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. Thank you very much, Claudia. So we will proceed to the next agenda item, which is the updates or items for discussion, starting with ICANN64, Kobe. You can see that there's a link to At-Large or ICANN workspace where the meeting has been held.

I think, in a nutshell, I can say that At-Large and ALAC [inaudible] caucus mostly on the EPDP and hot topics, but also there was a very interesting ALAC meeting with the Global Commission for Cyberspace Stability. It's a commission that has very well-qualified and diverse Internet experts who are looking at cyberspace and Internet infrastructure stability and resiliency, not just [inaudible] different. They're looking at different types of critical infrastructure like the electrical grid and everything else we're connected by with the Internet. They have published some norms that hopefully could be governing different actors, especially state actors, and preventing countries from attacking critical infrastructure that's [going to be used] on the Internet. So that was an interesting meeting.

---

I would like to give the floor and the chance to our ALAC representatives and also Sarah or Fatimata if they have anything to add regarding ICANN Kobe and an update for us. Please.

Okay. Tijani, I can see a raised hand. Go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Mohamed. I will speak especially about the AFRALO/AfrICANN statement. As you know, as usual, we have this AFRALO/AfrICANN joint meeting, and we address hot topics at ICANN. This time, we addressed the proposals from Neustar about the upcoming rounds of new gTLDs.

We received an acknowledgement from one of the chairs of the SubPro Working Group, and then we received a comment from Donna Austin, who is working with Neustar and who is more or less the origin of this proposal. She tried to discuss our points. She thanked several times AFRALO and AfrICANN for making this statement, but she tried to address all the points we raised.

I received a call from Heidi, asking me if we want to have a session with her or invite her or something like this. I said that the best way, if we want to do so – because we gave our point of view. Of course, she had – we understand. I know exactly what she thinks about the issue, the topic, and what is important now is Heidi proposed that we discuss with her. And I don't see any opportunity for that except if we make a single-purpose call because, in Marrakech, it will be too late and we will address another topic. So we cannot postpone it to Marrakech. We cannot do it during this call because it will eat all the time.

---

So, if we want to discuss with her, if we want to have a dialogue with her, we should make a single-purpose call about this very topic. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. Maureen, please, if you want to give us an update about At-Large or ALAC Kobe meetings. Please.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much, Mohamed. I couldn't sit here and not say something. I wanted to, first of all, thank you for having me here at your meeting. I really do enjoy attending AFRALO meetings.

I just wanted to, when we're talking about what happened, what was happening in ICANN64 – I think that one of the things that was really pleasing for me was the involvement, of course, of Sarah and Daniel in the activities, leading, and the activities that [they] have responsibility for, especially in the outreach and engagement activities, which Daniel leads.

I think, also, one of the really good things was the participation that AFRALO always makes in our ALAC activities, in the face-to-face meetings especially. But I think one of the things that was really interesting for us this year in our ICANN activities was the fact that we changed the way in which we did our working sessions so that the working sessions were more relevant to what it is that is At-Large's role within ICANN.

So we had more policy sessions, and I think that, with the sessions that were run by Jonathan – the policy sessions – he put out a policy talking point sheet before the event so that people had a copy so that, if anyone was discussing a particular issue, the ALAC viewpoints came within the talking points. Of course, the ALAC viewpoint comes through the discussions that happened at the CPWG, and that's quite important.

But I think, too, that another interesting session was the regional partners session, which was where whenever people are having or running activities within their ALSes, within their particular regions – excuse the noise from outside my window here – it's just to make sure that people are using local supporters and particularly the RIRs and any sort of other people who are connected to the Internet community. I think that the things that are happening, just this morning – for me, it's morning – to what people are doing within your region I think is very exciting. I do appreciate that.

But I just wanted to mention, just expand a bit on the ALAC side of things and what we're trying to achieve, for example, in the Marrakech meetings. It's a taster of things that's going to be happening in Marrakech, although, of course, Marrakech is a lot shorter. So we're going to be pretty crammed for space to do all of our workshopping. But I think it will still be just as exciting.

I see I've got a [session – I can do it] – but I'll just add a little bit more to the ATLAS III later if that's what you'd like me to do. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Maureen. Hadia, if you can be short, [that's fine].

---

HADIA ELMINIAWI:

Yes. I'll be really short. I'll just say that NCUC, NPOC and At-Large had outreach sessions during [inaudible] the Kobe meeting. Also, we had At-Large leadership workshop in which the ALAC delegates, we discussed the priorities and the workflow. We had also discussion with the [inaudible]. We had discussions with the ICANN board also, we had an ALAC/GAC statement drafted and posted. The ALAC/GAC statement was about the comment on [trends in relation to the EPDP.] Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Hadia. I think I forgot to thank staff for printing a very beautiful AFRALO hot topics report. I think we are the only RALO that has a printed report, and that was really good to see. We use this material in promoting AFRALO and also providing awareness about the hot topics in AFRALO. Thank you very much, staff.

So, if we proceed, the next agenda item is the feedback on the joint AFRALO-AfrICANN statement from Neustar. Tijani, if you don't mind, I think you mentioned that part in your update. So, basically, Neustar has responded to our statement, and they're almost defending their position and also clarifying their arguments. And as Tijani said, there is a chance that we can invite them in the next meeting, and also, although it might be late, it's good to have a policy discussion with them. So I think it might be useful that we let our drafting team see the response and evaluate. Do we need to have a formal feedback or response from AFRALO/AfrICANN? Or how do we handle this response if needed?

---

So, Tijani, if you don't mind, if we can hear from you and Seun and Sarah with the next steps by mail. I hope that is okay with you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: It's okay with me, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Tijani. For the next agenda items, yes, we have an update from Fatimata on the AFRALO outreach and engagement. As well, this is a chance to thank Daniel for his work in the Outreach and Engagement Working Group.

So, Fatimata, please.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: [inaudible]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sorry. I think before Fatima we have Michel. He wanted earlier to provide an update, and I think he's able to do that now. So, Fatimata, if we can give Michel a chance to speak, then if the interpreter from the French channel to tell Michel that we're waiting for him to speak, that would be great.

MICHEL TCHONANG LINZE: Hello, everyone. First of all, I would like to thank the team that went to Kobe. It was an excellent statement. I followed from afar. I had some

---

issues at the technical level, but I wanted to say and share a few activities that we did in Cameroon. Last week, in Douala, we supported at the technical level a meeting of French-speaking regulators in Douala and the sub-region of central Africa.

In the future, we're going to organize from the 9<sup>th</sup> until the 12<sup>th</sup> of July a symposium about Internet technologies for the digital emergence challenges and perspectives. All the members of AFRALO are invited to come. If other people would like to come, they are quite welcome. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Michel. Fatimata, if you are ready, you can provide your update, please.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Yes. Thank you. [inaudible]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: I'm not sure if Fatimata is online with us or not.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: [inaudible] Hello? Hello? Can you hear me?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. Maybe Fatimata has issues with her connection. So ... now we can hear you, Fatimata. Can you raise your voice?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: [inaudible]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Unfortunately, Fatimata, we cannot hear you. We will reserve your slot until you'll be able to speak. So if we can proceed to the next agenda item and maybe come back to you, we have the selection of our new representative in the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group 5: the geographic and geo-names stream. So Ali Hussain has stepped down as our representative in that working group work and that work stream, and we have submitted an e-mail asking for volunteers. We did receive a couple of expressions of interest, [from] Abdulkarim, from [Ejikeme, from ] and from Bram. And Bram actually sent an expression of interest, a document, to the mailing list. All those expressions were on the mailing list.

Then we did evaluate each applicant, and we also looked at the attendance of the working group activities, which was a good indication for us about if the applicants are actually engaged in the working group activities. So we did end up selecting Bram as our representative in the working group Work Stream 5: the geographic names, and he was the candidate that was most actively attending the calls. He attended almost 17 or 18 calls from 21. All of the working group. So, congratulations, Bram. We're looking forward to your work in the working group and also reporting back to AFRALO about any activities in that working group. Thanks, everyone, for expressing their interest.

---

So then we can – I'm not sure if Fatimata is able to provide her update regarding the AFRALO outreach and engagement.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Can I ask a question, please, Mr. Mohamed?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah. Pastor Peters, please go ahead.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Okay. I just want to be clear on the selections that [you] just announced the results for. When the expression of interest was made – I mean, I think my question should be, who did the selection? Was it based on the support given by members of AFRALO in line with the expression of interest by those who expressed interest and then the [inaudible] was selected? [Or another] group had to the selection? How was selection made?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay, sure. The selection was made by—

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Hello?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Who is that? If I can respond to Pastor Peters, and then I'll give you a chance to speak. So after receiving the expression of interest, the RALO

---

leaders – chair, vice-chair, and secretariat – had a discussion about it. We looked at the expression of interest received. We got feedback from the working group. We looked at the attendance of the applicants all this year, and that was the main criterias. Then that was decided on. I hope that answers your question.

PASTOR PETERS: All right. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you. Was that Fatimata who was trying to speak?

Okay. I guess Fatimata has an issue with her connection. If we can proceed, there's ATLAS III as the next agenda item and the participation criteria. If you'll remember, in our mailing list, Pastor Peters had initiated a thread and a discussion about participation of AFRALO members in ATLAS III and the requirement that we need to have either equal participation by regions or a minimum number of participants by a RALO and then a RALO could apply the criteria to select its participant. I think there was different feedback supporting that approach, and there are people who have concerns about how the criteria will be handled.

I did not provide my feedback in that discussion. I was waiting for this call so we can discuss this and also hear from our representative in that working group.

So I think the best way to do it is to maybe listen to the people who had the issues on the mailing list. And if I can ask Pastor Peter to articulate

---

his position and also ask Tijani, Abdulkarim, if they also could provide feedback. And we have Maureen as well – she’s here with us – if she wants to have any clarification.

So, Pastor Peters, can you start this discussion?

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Okay. Should I speak?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah. Please go ahead. Yes.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: I think, going by the report from Tijani earlier on on the ALAC activities, it appeared to have summed up the outcome of issues I raised in terms of regional balance in the ATLAS III events. If I got his response correctly – because we were part of the committee and there would be this very strong case. I think the final outcome is, if I’m not mistaken, that each RALO should produce ten representatives. But the ten representatives is not going to be based on because they’re from RALOs, but it has to be the best from each RALO. I think that, usually, the criteria has been agreed to by the committee.

So I think, in that light, I will say that our efforts in trying to advance this cause was not [even] because we were able to make our case and do that. Members of the committee looked into what [our points were].

---

I think that is all I can say for now because I also want to believe [inaudible] people [were] following through the mailing list, and those [inaudible] also took part in the conference calls when these issues were being debated and discussed. It was also [in line]. Tijani drew more light on that, but I believe that the issues, as far as I'm concerned, has been settled with the agreement that each region is allowed to produce ten representatives for the ATLAS III, but it has to be the best ten, using the criteria that is agreed upon. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Pastor Peters. Tijani, please?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Mohamed. I'd like to reiterate what was the agreement. The agreement was about – first of all, we will have two kinds of criteria: hard criteria and soft criteria. The hard criteria are mandatory for anyone. Those who don't pass the hard criteria will not be selected. They will be dropped from the selection. The hard criteria are only about your affiliation and also about some courses that you have to take before the summit and about your participation in AFRALO and ALAC. Those are the criterions inside in this pool of criteria, which we call hard criteria. So anyone should pass this hard criteria.

Now, after that, when we will make the selections according to the soft criteria, we will try to have at least ten from each region. "At least," I said. Everything will be according to the scores of the soft criteria, of course. It will not be random or anything. It will be according to the scores that people will have in this selection process.

---

If we have a very poor result from our region, it is a problem. Of course, we can not [inaudible] a position saying that people who never participated or who don't have any involvement should be in the summit. You cannot do that. But we can say that those who pass the hard criteria we have to take at least ten of them. "At least," I said. If the others are not well-scored from the soft criteria, we take at least the ten first-scored people and bring them to Montréal.

The best is to have at least twelve, the balance, but we are not sure we will have it. We don't know which region will have more. I more or less know, but we cannot predict. We have to wait until the EOIs are fulfilled and the selection is done.

So this is where we are now today. The EOIs will be released for people, will be sent to people, or will be published on the 15<sup>th</sup> of April, I think. Maureen can correct me if I'm wrong. Starting the 15<sup>th</sup> of April, we will have, I think, one month to complete it, and also to complete the courses – the mandatory courses that you will have to take on ICANN Learn. Or participate in some webinar that we will organize also.

So this is more or less the way it will be done. I don't want the speaking about ATLAS III be restricted to the selection. There is another part which is very important, which is the program, which is the [inaudible]. I hope that Africans will be involved in this part also. People are preparing the program. They are preparing also the capacity-building programs for our community. So I think this is a part that we have to take care of. Thank you.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. Before taking Seun, Maureen, do you have any updates or any comments on this?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much, Mohamed, and thank you, Tijani, for an excellent overview of the participation criteria. I think that one of the things that I'd really like to stress with regards to this is, as Tijani said, is the hard criteria. It is really important that people understand that, if they are dropped from the selection process early, it will probably be because they don't actually meet that criteria.

I guess the main thing too that I'd really like to impress upon people are the courses because it's a capacity-building course and we have created webinars to help people who would like to learn more and they're French speakers. We're doing the same for the Spanish speakers as well. So the webinars are done in English, but they will have French and Spanish interpretation. If you are only a French speaker, it would be advisable that you attend all those five webinars. If you miss one, the only way you can make it up is to actually do the ICANN Learn course on that particular subject.

So it's really important, and I think they are doing two webinars at different time frames so that, if you can't do a morning one, you might be able to do an evening one, or something like that.

But I did want to mention one other thing, and that is that the selection panel that will actually select the people who are going to be our ATLAS travelers – what we decided on was that the selection panel will consist of one person from every RALO. So there will be five people on the

---

selection panel, and one will come from AFRALO. For the AFRALO person, there are a set of criteria that the person must meet. Your leaders will have had that criteria. They had to have some experience in choosing leaders. But the choice of the person who goes on the panel will be made by AFRALO themselves.

So that is going to be really important because, as Tijani said, the applications will open on the 15<sup>th</sup>, next Monday, and there'll be opportunities for people who are French- and Spanish-speaking people to actually be able to fill in their application form. But also, it doesn't end until the 31<sup>st</sup> of May because you do have to do those courses at the same time.

Another thing that is important is that you must make sure you put in your proper e-mail address on the form as well because when you fill in and submit your form, you get an e-mail to your e-mail address, and that allows you to get back into your form to update it every time you do new a course or something. So that's really important.

But I would really like AFRALO to be looking at who their selection panel person is going to be because I need to know that. I think Tijani covered everything else. The whole basis was that we – I know it must have seemed as though I was against raising the regional balance thing, but that wasn't the point at that particular time. We were looking at the criteria.

The regional balance thing is always going to be happening later on, and after we had decided on the criteria, then we went and looked at the regional balance. 10 out of 12. 10 is not the minimum. For example, if

---

one RALO has 15 people, and 10 people don't meet the hard criteria so that there's only five people from that region left, then the other five spaces will go to the next – because the matrix for scoring is going to be done on a very complicated matrix, which I'm going to be explaining to the leadership, to the ATLAS team. If you're a member of the ATLAS team, you'll get to see that later on.

But it's probably [one of the most] complex things/projects I ever worked on [in this], and I have appreciated everyone's comments and contributions to it. So keep at it and help us select the best people from your region to attend. And hopefully 12. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Maureen. Just being cautious of time, I have Seun, then followed by Sarah. So, please, if you can be brief, Seun and Sarah. Please go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Hello. I think Hadia has been addressing some of my questions, actually. So in the interest of time, I will just continue the question on the chat. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Seun. Sarah, please?

I think Sarah's hand is no longer up.

---

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Sorry. Can you hear me?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can hear you. Please go ahead, Abdulkarim.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. I think, yes, I want to probably just affirm most of the things that were said by the previous speakers regarding ATLAS III. I was to say I was a member of the committee, just like what Tijani mentioned. I was actually supposed to ask a question, because what we had originally was everybody participating the committee, and [inaudible] eight people because [inaudible]. So I think from there [inaudible] didn't have full information into what was going on. But I think I now understand everything that was going on [based on what] Tijani presented.

[inaudible] nothing really for me to add on to what has been said. Just to confirm everything. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Abdulkarim.

DANIEL CHIMEZIE MGBAMS: Mohamed, Daniel here. Can I give a brief update on outreach and engagement?

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure. Please go ahead, Daniel.

DANIEL CHIMEZIE MGBAMS: Okay. Thank you very much for the [inaudible] call. I just wanted to [inaudible] outreach and engagement. I'm very happy to share that AFRALO is going to be having a very strong participation at the Africa Internet Summit, and they're going to be having, I think, over four or five members from AFRALO, including the members who are currently [inaudible] Tijani, Khaled, [just to mention a few.]

Also, one of the possible outcomes [inaudible] for the regional [inaudible] leadership session that we had in Kobe, there is at least a slot for [inaudible] ICANN booth, and then also Africa [inaudible]. Also, the [inaudible] Africa Internet Summit, which would be good.

Also on the way [inaudible] outreach activities in [Marrakech so that there will be a follow-up call together with the leadership, with the AFRALO leadership team [inaudible] whereby we are going to be discussing [inaudible] outreach activities that will be taking place in Marrakech. Also, I'm really happy to share that [inaudible].

The ALS [inaudible] coming up, regarding to outreach and engagement. Also, [inaudible] focusing on ATLAS III selection, at least I just encourage that members of AFRALO should [inaudible] criteria, make sure that [inaudible]. Thank you very much. I'll hand it over back to Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Daniel. Thank you for your good work. It's really great to see that we have many active AFRALO leaders who will be in

---

the African Internet Summit. Good luck there. And also luck to – reiterating what you said, Maureen, we encourage everyone really to take that ICANN Learn courses and participate in the process of the selection of ATLAS III. I think that’s important so we can send our best actors/participants there.

So let’s move to the next agenda item. Here, Sarah is going to be updating us about the new ALSes applications and maybe new individual members applications.

Sarah, please?

SARAH KIDEN:

Hi, everyone. I hope you can hear me. So, from the last meeting, we have received one ALS application from Fondation Femme TIC et Développement Durable. It is based in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, and they focus on women in ICT and sustainable development. Staff has already done due diligence and they seem to have a website and online presence. The website’s in French, but with my minimal French, I was able to see some activities that may be of interest to us. They are also legally registered in Burkina Faso, and the application was made by [Wes Matta] and [Hadia Samon].

So, if you have any comments about this application, please let us know. And then we will be able to confirm to staff so that it can be sent to ALAC for voting.

So in terms of individual members, we have three individual membership applications, one from [Uni Narodeen]. I think it’s showing

---

on the screen. So, yeah, he's not yet completed his form. He sent an e-mail asking that he wanted to become an individual member. We are waiting for his form. So if you know him, please let him know that we reached out to him to ask for his form.

Then we have [Harun Sheriff] who is a networking genius from Chad. Finally, we have [Edgar Hama Ifohey], who is a network and leader support person based in Kenya. So if you also have any comments about these three applications, please let us know and we will, yeah, know to add them or not.

But I definitely would like to mention that, as an action item, we were requested to add names of the people who applies to be individual members. From now henceforth, you will see the names listed on our agenda, as well as our Secretariat report.

Thank you very much. Mohamed, I don't know if there's an AOB. I would like to ask, but maybe we can hear comments about the individual member applications. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Yeah, sure. Thanks, Sarah. So if anyone has any comments about the current list of ALS and the individual members ...

If not, you can share any feedback or any comment you have by e-mail.

So we have, yes, the final agenda items. I usually try to finish it in one hour, and we are just ten minutes past this one hour. So any other business or any other issues you'd like to be addressed on this call?

---

Sarah, you have a raised hand. Do you want to speak?

SARAH KIDEN: Hi again. I think it would be a good time to announce that we have upcoming elections for some positions and let the members know and to look out for that call when it comes out. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, sure. Thank you. Thank you for that. Yes, I can provide an update on that. I think we have Yaovi.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Pastor Peter, please.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. So it's Yaovi, Pastor Peters, and then I will provide my comment. Yaovi, please.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Can you hear me, please?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah. Please go ahead, Yaovi. We can hear you.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Can you hear me, please?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can. Please go ahead.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you very much. Just to inform you that we are planning an [ICANN 64] webinar for April [23rd]. So we'll send the announcement once we have confirmation of [inaudible], just for you to save the date for [April 23<sup>rd</sup>] at 1:00 P.M. UTC for a webinar on ICANN64 results [session]. Thank you so much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Yaovi. Pastor Peters, please.

Pastor Peters, you have the floor.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: In the leadup to ATLAS III conference, as a follow-up to the demand that we have a representative in the leadership committee from AFRALO, I just want to [inaudible] to nominate, even though we don't ask for a nomination. But I don't think we should [inaudible]. We shouldn't waste more time. Tijani has been very active in this process, so I am asking/nominating that Tijani can just go ahead and represent AFRALO in that leadership committee for the [inaudible] ATLAS [leader] summit. So that is just what I want to put on the record. Thank you.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Pastor Peters. Frankly, I can't remember if it's one representative or more.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: One.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: If it's more – one? Okay. If it's one, all I can say is we have a proposal from you, Pastor Peters, that you recommend Tijani to continue the work that he has been doing to represent us. So, if there's people who can second that, I'm fine with that.

Tijani, I think you have a raised hand.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Sorry. Can I also say something probably after Tijani?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Okay.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Tijani and then Abdulkarim.

---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. Thank you very much, and thank you, Peters, for nominating me or for proposing me to be on the selection board. I think that Maureen said that the selection board is five people. No one from the working group on criteria will be inside this group. This is what she said. So perhaps we had better select one of our former NomCom members. We have Fatimata. We have Dev. We have Mohamed. Those people have the knowledge of how to select people. Second, they are not part of the working group on the criteria. So this is only to give information. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani, for the clarification. Abdulkarim?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. I think Tijani has raised exactly what I wanted to raise, that one of the criteria that was used, that was agreed on at the meeting was the [person] should probably have the NomCom experience. So I think Tijani has suggested there were three people. I don't know what we want to do next. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Abdulkarim, also for clarifying this. Okay, so if participation, if I may suggest [inaudible]. I would like to suggest that the NomCom representatives within AFRALO, former or current, get together and maybe just agree among themselves to recommend someone. At least that will be [inaudible]. And if that is accepted by everyone, we can

---

proceed on that, taking into consideration that this is the criteria that's required.

DANIEL CHIMEZIE MGBAMS: Can I add something to [any other] business?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah. Please, Daniel. Go ahead.

DANIEL CHIMEZIE MGBAMS: [inaudible] mention the [inaudible] outreach and engagement. Currently, as you are aware, we are having approximately two months [to the next FY.] Fatimata, I think, will be working on the new strategy [inaudible] we can be able to [inaudible] our prospective plan at least. One thing is that [inaudible] members who are available on the outreach and engagement team of AFRALO. [inaudible] strategy. Also, secondly, regarding some of the other RALOs [work that is] coming from other RALOs, I'm going to ask all the members to give their opinions regarding to [inaudible] newsletters or [inaudible] communications [inaudible] regarding outreach and engagement. Thank you. Back tou, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Daniel. Okay, so back to the points raised by Sarah regarding elections. So I think, just to clarify, there will be elections coming. There will be officers [due to reelection or not.] The election nomination period would start on the 29<sup>th</sup> of April. So that's not

---

the election itself. There's a nomination period, which is an [extensive] period. So I think it's without sending something official. There's a timeline. There are dates for sending the official election, let's say, notification, which we know. I don't think now there's any point of jumping in to details on updates without really sending a formal timeline. So all I can say is that the formal announcement will go out on the 29<sup>th</sup> of April with the details of the standard procedure nomination periods and all of that. I'm not sure if this is what you need to give us an update on, Sarah, or if there's something else you need to say.

Sarah?

SARAH KIDEN:

Hi, everyone. I was just talking about ATLAS III. I think the nomination is also not open. This is different from what you're saying; the selection of the candidate for ATLAS, or the selection team for ATLAS III. That's what I was talking about.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Okay. I thought I heard you say something about selection, and [I foresee that to be] in Any Other Business. For ATLAS III, I think there was a couple of proposals that have been now discussed. I guess listening to the folks about the criteria, we have agreed that the AFRALO NomCom representatives get together and they select among themselves a name and present it to us.

Okay. We are 20 minutes off the hour—

---

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Mohamed, can I say something before we finish on AOB?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, Abdulkarim. Go ahead, please.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Okay, sorry. I don't want to take most of our time, but I need to just express some of the things that I probably noticed. Somebody that does not actually thrive in an environment whereby you could see a lot of people playing politics with issues – as leaders, I think we really need to be very careful on what we do. I'm not trying to ... I want us to be really careful because, especially when you see – I'll give an example which I wasn't really happy about, which is the issue of people picking people outside or picking out people and trying to probably create a division within people. I think leaders need to be really careful regarding this. If we're picking out people to actually recognize them, especially in an environment whereby you have, for example, more than – I don't know how many people were probably in Kobe representing [what] part of AFRALO that was in Kobe. If we have leaders picking out one or two people to thank them especially, I think it's just creating division upon division within the society.

I really want to express myself. I've noticed one or two things which I am not really happy about, which is something I want us to really address, which is the issue of – because while you want to also address this issue, that's the problem I have seen in AFRINIC. And I do not want us to broadly – I a lot of people are not really happy because of certain things, but my own perspective to it is I have to express myself. I do not

---

bottle up emotions or feelings, and I do not really care about a lot of things that do go on outside.

But at the same time, it is something we really need to be careful about. A lot of people are not really happy with some of these things, and we really need to be careful so that we do not get to a situation whereby we're going to create some division. I am talking not just for myself. Before, some people have expressed this to me, and we really need to be careful in doing this. Thank you so much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Abdulkarim. I just wanted to follow up on this because, are you specifically talking about the ATLAS III representative selection we have currently been discussing or the coming election?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE:

No, I'm not specifically talking about ATLAS III. It has nothing to do with ATLAS III. Nothing to do with—

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Upcoming elections?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE:

No, not upcoming elections but general feelings. I'm just expressing this as a general feeling—

---

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Can I speak, please?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure. I have – okay – a queue now being formed.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I am on the queue.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Tijani and Pastor Peters. Tijani, go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. Thank you very much, Mohamed. I fully agree with what Abdulkarim said. Abdulkarim is very right, and we saw in Kobe some of this behavior.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Exactly.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I would like to remind you that AFRINIC is broken because of this kind of behavior, and I am not ready to let people do the same for AFRALO. Thank you, Abdulkarim, for raising that.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Okay. Thank you, Tijani. Pastor Peters, please?

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Well, I'm ignorant of what exactly is the [bit] of contention here. So [inaudible] to Abdulkarim and Tijani. It would be wise if they can just give us a clear picture of what the issues are, because Abdulkarim did not mention any particular issue, apart from the fact that persons were picked and were thanked for whatever – I don't know what that is, but there are other issues we [inaudible]. So it would be [inaudible] if they can both tell us what the issues are [inaudible]. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you. Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you. I just want to wear my AFRINIC hat to say that AFRINIC is not broken. I would really – it's a huge and diverse community. Of course, because of the diversity, there can always be a lot of different views and perspectives. So it's really up to us, all as the community, within AFRINIC as well, to keep it functioning in the way we want it. If there are issues that we have over there within AFRINIC which need attention, it would be good that we also take it to the AFRINIC fora, where it is going to receive the due attention.

So I would really, really encourage us to not have the mindset that AFRINIC is broken. I would also suggest that we endeavor to participate in AFRINIC processes. Perhaps, by doing that, we will be able to fix whatever we see that is missing or whatever we see that is not perfectly done within AFRINIC. The organization is always open for improvement.

---

On the comment that has been made by Abdulkarim and also since it was supported by Tijani as well, I think it should be good if Abdulkarim actually shared his concerns, the actual specificity of it, with the AFRALO leadership. Perhaps this can also be a way to address this from happening and also [inaudible] of course, maybe during the next call, the AFRALO leadership can raise it in a way that would be constructive [and not actually saying] XYZ did whatever, whatever Abdulkarim was trying to say. So if you are not comfortable sharing it personally with AFRALO leadership, I think it's better to do that, and then AFRALO leadership can then follow up on it with the members on the mailing list. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Seun. If might try to summarize things, I think I will reach out to Abdulkarim and talk to him and also get specifics, and then I'll update you on the next call. But I think maybe Abdulkarim was talking about an incident that happened in Kobe in one of the meetings. I think there was interventions made by AFRALO members that were not appreciated by someone from another RALO. But that's what I felt from what he said. I wasn't in that room, but I think I can talk [about that] with Abdulkarim and also come back to you with what the issue is and how we can resolve that, if there is any issue.

Also, I'm pretty frank with everybody. I think it's important that, if there are any issues, we talk about it as the group, as the family.

So being cautious of time, I think I will give the last word to Heidi. She's had her raised hand for a long time. Heidi, please, go ahead.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Thank you. Hi, everyone. I just wanted to clarify some dates. The deadline for the ATLAS III selection committee representative is the 1<sup>st</sup> of May. The start of the nomination period for the general ALAC and regional At-Large organizations leadership positions will be the 29<sup>th</sup> of April. So right around the end of this month, at the beginning of May, there'll be some important deadlines and some starting points for some elections.

Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Heidi. Okay. So I think now we have a couple of items to go through, and I don't want to extend the meeting beyond that. Thank you very much for the call. Looking forward to our next call. Have a good evening, everyone. Thank you very much. Bye-bye.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**