

---

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Okay, we will now begin the official recording and translation of this call. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the LACRALO Special Purpose Call for LACRALO Mailing List on Wednesday, the 30<sup>th</sup> of January, 2019 at 23:00 UTC.

On the call today, on the Spanish channel, we have Sergio Salinas Porto. And on the English channel, we have Dev Anand Teelucksingh. From staff, we have Heidi Ullrich on audio only, Silvia Vivanco, Mark Segall, Laura Bengford; and myself, Claudia Ruiz on call management. Our interpreters for today are Claudia and Paula.

And before we begin, I would like to remind everyone to please state their name before speaking for the transcription purposes and also so the interpreters can identify you on the other language channel. Thank you, and with this, I turn it over to you, Dev.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Actually first ... Thank you very much, Claudia. I just wanted, before turning it over to Dev, welcome everyone. Thanks, Mark and Laura, for joining us. And [inaudible] Mark and Laura, [because] introduction, we have Sergio Salinas Porto. He is the LACRALO Chair and we will have Harold Arcos who is the LACRALO Secretariat. They are leading the LACRALO community and sending a number of important e-mails since the beginning of the year. So they experienced firsthand with all of us, [inaudible], the translation tool which you all are aware of.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

So because they are new leaders, they would like to get more feedback, input on what is going on with the tools and also ideas to how we can work better and try to fix the tool or to at least mitigate some of the problems.

And Dev Anand has been working on this. He has posted the Wiki. He has researched the tools very in detail, so he will give us an update of the [start], especially since January 2019. So if you all agree, I will give the floor to Dev so he can give us a [inaudible] report. Thank you. Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you, and thanks, Silvia, for that. So just to bring everyone up to date, I posted a link to the Wiki page which has the very detailed background about the description of the LACRALO Mailing List issues. Now, the improved translation tool was deployed, well, in late 2017 and since then, we've noticed two key issues. And I guess the more bigger issue at this point is that there seems to be several missing e-mails from one list to another.

Since I stopped being Chair of the Technology Task Force and I was on a sort of hiatus, so to speak, in 2018, I did start to notice that many e-mails were being silently dropped from one list, and mainly e-mails from the LACRALO ES list, which is the Spanish list, not being sent to the LACRALO EN list. And the way to do this, I looked at the archives and I noticed that in some months, there were even up to 50 messages in May 2018 alone.

---

But as of January 2019, as of when I checked earlier this morning, the number of missing e-mails is 29 e-mails, so the number of the LACRALO on the LACRALO ES e-mail list is 90, but on the LACRALO EN, the English one, it's 61 meaning that ... They should both be equal because what's supposed to happen is that whenever the e-mail is sent to the LACRALO EN list, it is translated and posted to the Spanish list. And vice versa. That is whenever an e-mail goes to the Spanish list, it is translated and the translated e-mail goes to the English list. So it should have been equal, but this is not happening.

And well, I think that's really the biggest issue. So I think, perhaps, we should probably just focus on that one as a separate issue but I think the lack of missing e-mails is the biggest problem right now.

So I'll stop there. This was raised on a Special Purpose Technology Task Force Call with Mark last week, Monday I think it was, on the 21<sup>st</sup>, and this was brought to the attention of Mark. And I don't know if Mark has had an opportunity to review the situation and either he or Laura could give an update on this. So I'll stop there.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. Thank you, Dev, for that. Perhaps if Mark would like to address some of the concerns raised, or Laura. Hello, is Mark muted, perhaps?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Yes. Mark, we're not hearing you.

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes. We cannot hear you, Mark. Yes. Okay. Please, yes, Mark. Now if you can speak louder.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Mark? It appears you were on mute. Can you try again, please? He disconnected. Yes, he's redialing again. One moment.

MARK SEGALL: Hello, it's Mark Segall. Are you able to hear me now?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: We certainly do.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Mark.

MARK SEGALL: Yes. Great. Sorry about that. I was talking to myself apparently. So what I've been ... The big challenge I've been trying to work through is that we've had a resource shake-up within engineering that basically happened. Its first iteration was as we shifted into FY19 and we had a reduction in staff. And then again just as we got to the holiday break, the lone [Pearl] developer we had rolled off. And we do have another one, but it's one [Pearl] developer so our main challenge is that the tool is built upon an unsupported development stacked for ICANN where we want to go, I should say.

---

So my challenge has been trying to work with my counterparts in engineering to see if we can get this resource peeled off of the other activity that they have to ramp up on the code and to be able to start looking into the issue. So that's the short-term dilemma I'm working on.

Also, we're trying to look to the future, because like I said, [Pearl] is not the direction for this that we want to go strategically and then there's also the question of this tool ... The problem we're trying to solve, is it because Mailman is not a sufficient mailing system or is it because we need to design a whole new tool from scratch? Do we need to look at some off-the-shelf options? But we do want to start looking at the future so that this isn't a recurring problem.

That said, I have an e-mail thread right now I'm working through with some of the other engineering leaders to see if we can peel off that resource as I said and then, in parallel, the team is trying to look at how do we address this problem going forward and also looking at it, from a larger perspective because we don't want LACRALO to be the only ones to take advantage of this capability.

There's been a desire brought forward by many of the community to have multiple languages and also expanding to more distribution lists. So I think that's the long and short of it. I wish I could give you a better answer. I'm trying to get timelines as we speak on when I can get this resource, but I can tell you it's probably going to take a little bit of time so even when we do get them, just to get familiar with the code and to be able to investigate the issue at hand.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I see Sergio has his hand raised. Am I chairing the call or is it Silvia?  
Sorry.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes. Sorry. Please, Sergio. Sergio Salinas.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, we'll let Sergio go ahead and I have some ideas.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes. Okay, Sergio, please.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much. First of all, I would like to thank for this call because I think it's really very important. I'm really concerned. I'm worried. I'm not going to explain what has happened in LACRALO recently but I want everyone to understand our contest, our challenging environment.

We have had conflicts in our region because of misunderstanding. We have reached that agreement. That's really our base on trust. The inadequate functioning of this tool – and I think it's not a problem of Mailman because I think two or three people may understand the [Python] language and may improve this, so I think it may be done other ways, but let's say we have an analytical problem and not a technical problem.

---

And certainly, I am really concerned because those of us who speak Spanish cannot communicate with those who speak English and in-between, there is a big mess and there is a lack of transparency.

I don't know if we are the only region using this translation tool for the mailing list, but I do not remember [having] a serious problem like this one that some people are not receiving e-mails, so we have a group that the observers aren't – you send an e-mail, saying that the e-mail was not received from the [deliverer with] your reply. On another mail, it says that the mail is too long so there is no capacity. I think that certainly, this generates [noise] in communication and so our communication is not being fluent.

My proposal is that why don't we see what we may do and in-between, before everything comes to an end, we have to go back to a single mailing list, a mailing list in which we know that every time that we receive an e-mail in English, we have to go to Google Translate or I don't know, if we scroll, we may use another translation tool until we have it solved. But at least we have to have a mailing list that each receives a [inaudible] answer. Otherwise, we are having a big problem. Thank you.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay. Okay, thank you very much for that, Sergio. And Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks, Sergio. And thanks, Silvia. Just to support, to emphasize that this is very important to solve. We've been through a lot lately in terms of politics and there's still been lots of misunderstanding and

---

when the tools do not work, and especially when there is miscommunication, it just leads to problems. So I would say that what Mark was saying is that, yes, e-mails are important because I think even if we were to use a different tool, and I just want to note that we are looking at Slack as a communication tool for group chat. Having said that, even if all of our messaging was to go this, a lot of messaging would go to the group chat and there would be a reduction in the e-mails. The e-mail server is the official notification for the At-Large members in Latin America and Caribbean region, so we do still need the e-mails.

I know that Mailman is working on version two. Even though I would say Mailman version three is now stable, appears to be stable. Of course, I will heed your advice from Mark and Laura on that.

So I mean, perhaps Mark, perhaps you could just start looking at the various options of what we can do to tweak the tool to see if these issues can resolve. So my first thought – and I hope somebody is going to start taking notes here. So first thought is, well, ideally, get some information on exactly why the e-mails are not being transferred from one list to the next. And as the maintainers of the tool, you should have access to the log to exactly see why it's not. What's the error message? Why is it happening? And I think that will give us a better idea of how we could fix, perhaps rectify the issue. Because without that, we're kind of not sure what the real issue is.

It may be a simple fix. It may be not. But we don't really know and we could speculate as to what it is, but we need to at least understand why



---

there are some messages not being sent to the list. Is the tool not ... We just need to understand why it's happening.

The second thing, we need to look at ways of which to minimize the load of the [inaudible]. Okay? And by that, I mean, okay, right now, currently, the tool looks at the entire e-mail and then tries to send all of that e-mail to be translated by the Google Translate API. Maybe we should look at implementing a special code word, phrase – in other words, something like ... I'll just post it in the chat. Like something with dashes or two dashes and the word "end". And what you can then, something like that. In other words, a special delimiter phrase so that when somebody replies and they use that special phrase, the tool knows it doesn't need to translate the whole message after that.

So in that way, it does not need to make numerous calls to the Google Translate API. And maybe by doing that, we don't have to worry about... Well, it will reduce the cost of the translation tool in addition to, and perhaps, well, make the tool more efficient. Okay? So that's the other thing.

Third, looking at in terms of trying to move away from [Pearl] and trying to move away from maintaining the [Pearl], there's this [inaudible] which I've been looking at and I [inaudible] mailparser.io. And what it does, it's serviced by you could forward e-mails to this service, mailparser.io and you can get your information handled. It costs – and this seems to, might be an easier way if you could retool the tool to use this mailparser, extract the information and then come up with a way to translate the body of the e-mail and then resend it out. Okay?

---

So there's a 14-day trial, but the cost of it is \$29 U.S. a month and that's up to 500 e-mails a month, which might work well, might be good enough to start testing, and if so, go upgrade to a business package when you want to deploy which will cost \$79 U.S. a month. Okay? So, has Sergio dropped?

SILVIA VIVANCO: It looks like Sergio dropped.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Shall I continue? Okay. Shall I continue or...

CLAUDIA RUIZ: He has just rejoined. Sorry for interrupting. He has just rejoined. You can continue, Dev. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thank you. So maybe we can look at using this mailparser.io service where, essentially, you just add the mailparser.io e-mail address to the list and that will then take the e-mails, post it to the list. We can pass the information in that, using that tool, and therefore, work up a way of translating the e-mail and sending it back to the other list and vice versa.

Okay, so that's one, two, three. The fourth approach is – and this actually ties in with the mailparser.io because I did propose an alternative approach for scaling up the number of languages for

---

translation for the mailing list because right now it's very hard to do with the tool as it is right now, it's very hard. Well, it's a challenge just to do the two mailings, the two languages. If we were to do three languages or four languages, I suggested an alternative on the last TTF call and Mark, I don't know if you're aware of it, and of course, I could try to find the link to that image again.

But essentially, the e-mails would... Basically, you have one discussion list which everyone posts to in their native language. Okay. The translation bot that is subscribed to that one discussion list will then take the e-mails from that discussion list and post translated e-mails to both the English and the Spanish lists. So it would work in a way that, okay, if their language was already in English, then it just forwards it automatically to our English lists. If it needs to be translated, it will be translated and then posted to Spanish lists. And conversely, if the e-mail is Spanish, it just forwards that e-mail to the Spanish and it would then translate and post it to the English list.

And in that way... So what would happen is that the person can subscribe to the translation e-mails and those types of list e-mails will act like an ALAC announce list, sorry, ALAC Announce, which is a read-only list. So people cannot post to the translated e-mail list. They could only post to the one discussion list. And in that way, you could add multiple languages because you could just pick one for Portuguese, you could pick one for French. You can scale it up and it's really just having the different mailing lists for the different languages.

Shall I post it again, Mark? Actually, let me just... I can reshare it again. Just bear with me one second.

MARK SEGALL: Dev, while you bring that up, I do recall and you and I have actually discussed in private as well, very familiar with if we do a custom approach, that that's a very viable architecture to have it send to one mailing list and then that mailing list would parse out to the various so that you would only have one transactional mailing list and the others are just for posting.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. So here it is. I think this is it. I hope this is it. I don't want to make myself look like an idiot. Yes, this is the one. Yeah, so this is the concept. I just posted the link to the image. Sorry.

So what could happen then, Mark, is that if we have the one discussion list, then we could have the mailparser tool take that, subscribe to that discussion list, and then take the e-mail and then process it and then forward, either translate the text or the original text to the other language list. So that's my idea.

And what we can do, we can do a trial, obviously, by putting this on the... I would say that we could set up a new mailing list just to try it out and just see if we could work to fix it and then deploy it. If it does work, then deploy it for the main list, if it does work. All right, so those are the options.

Tweaking the... Finding out exactly what is the issue regarding why are some e-mails being dropped because, Mark, you should have access to the logs so you should know why it's happening. Is it the e-mails are too

---

big? [When] formatting, does the tool [disguise]? What is it? We don't know. I don't know so it's hard to suggest fixes when we don't know. So that's... We need to at least... I think that still needs to be fully investigated as to why it's happening just so we understand why it's happening.

The second thing, again – I'm sorry, I'm summarizing again just in case Sergio got cut off before – the second thing, we could look at using a special phrase to say stop translation so it will be like an instruction to the translation tool to say, "Okay, just translate my three words that I said and no more." And that way, the tool doesn't have to process the entire e-mail and so forth, so it would cut down considerably on the server load of the translation tool and also cut down on the cost of the translation tool because yeah, so that's...

And then thirdly, we could look at a different approach whereby we could look at a third-party parsing tool such as mailparser.io and it looks very interesting, mailparser.io because it's like you can... Actually, I will say ICANN should consider it for other things. But one of the things is that you can extract the information, put it in a different format. It could even be like a spreadsheet or even another outbound e-mail and go out on another list. Okay. And using such a third-party parsing tool could [inaudible] to new concepts for the LACRALO list.

Okay, so I think I will stop there right now. So I don't know if Mark or anybody else wants to raise any questions.

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Thank you very much. I don't know if Mark has some comments from these proposed solutions.

MARK SEGALL: Can you still hear me okay?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, we can hear you.

MARK SEGALL: I wasn't sure. I got dropped off once. Now my confidence is gone. So yeah, the solution of having a simplified list that can expand to the picture that's being shown there, you could even add another arrow and have French or you could have some other language. It's all basically whatever Google Translate can have thrown at it. That part is definitely where we would want to go if we were going forward with a custom solution.

I think our main concern we have right now is resourcing and making sure that even if we wanted to go Java and start developing in Java, we would still need to prioritize. It would have to be balanced against everything else that our Java developers have to do and I know that's a constant challenge that the organization is trying to grapple with. Where do we put our resources?

So I think what we're trying to also do is wherever possible, we're seeing is there an opportunity for something that's off-the-shelf so that we have a vendor that we can rely upon and it's part of the annual

---

maintenance agreement at a cheaper rate than it would be to have somebody regularly maintaining something that's been custom developed.

I do know that... A shared frustration for me – I could really hear it in Sergio's voice. I share the frustration because we were just looking at the ticket when this was first reported was July and we're just in a bind with our resources and I am taking what we're talking about here to see. Laura and I both are trying to see if we can get management to free up resources to investigate that top issue because I think that's our main item of the moment. If you're not able to have consistent communication between Spanish and English I can feel the frustration there.

If we can get that solved, then we have more time to look into the long-term solution and figure out where we go from there but our main problem isn't necessarily how we approach things as much as we need the resources to just jump in and start doing things. So I did have, since the TTF call – I think it was a couple of weeks ago – I've had a couple of conversations. The main issue we're trying to get through is that this new [Pearl] resource is very new and they're just trying to get to learn ICANN, let alone all the services that they're going to have to be responsible for.

So I think the one thing I need to do is provide an action or a timeline for when we can say that we're going to start looking into it and then once they get under the hood, so to speak, I can get a sense of how much time they're going to need to get familiar with the code and then ultimately investigate the issue itself.

---

What I can do is at least promise... I can give a timeline by end of this week on when we'll have that resource available and then I can give more granular updates once they've had a chance to look inside if that works for everybody on this call.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Thank you, Mark.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Well, I see Sergio has a hand up.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So I will... Go ahead. Let Sergio go ahead and I will...

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, so first Sergio and then Dev. Sergio, please.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Silvia. As far as I understand, due to what you're saying is that the thing is that [begin] to share from [inaudible] Mailman to some other off-the-shelf product. So I think that if you may work on open source with a team that knows [Python], instead of working on Java, we may work on [Python]] to improve and [inaudible] the community with an application like Mailman. Mailman has not been working okay in



---

terms of translation. So Mailman is working okay, but the translation is not working okay. I don't know if it's because of the volume that goes through Mailman and perhaps it is the volume [inaudible] inconvenient.

I think that instead of going to an off-the-shelf product, I think we should explore open source a bit more. And I have a doubt, the cost of [inaudible] region a couple of weeks ago, I think. Did you investigate what happened or are you starting to investigate that? Because we have to keep on working and I don't know how we are going to do it within our region if we don't have a solution.

So if we decide that we are going to use just one single e-mail address so that the whole of the community may communicate until the problem is solved, we may do that but we need a solution right now. Otherwise, we won't have any communication and then the people from the Caribbean and the members, the Spanish-speaking members, I don't know if I may have an answer right now. Thank you.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, thank you very much, Sergio. Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. All right, thanks. Okay, well, let me respond to Mark and then Mark can respond to Sergio.

So what is it Mark, that by Friday, that you guys will be able to look at, will be semi up to speed or partially read to look at the tool? Is it that you will be in a position to understand why the missing e-mails are happening? Because that's a reason [inaudible]. Because I think, again,

---

if we really understand why it's happening, then we could mitigate or figure out what the issue is. Is it happening with one particular user? Again, I could speculate and go through hundreds of different causes here but until I have the information, we can't do anything.

The second thing – and I guess this is actually our third option, another option here. What is the cost for submitting e-mails to a translation service? And by that, because I know that there are some services – and I'll find the link – where if I understand what they do, they would literally take an e-mail, translate it and send it back to you.

Now it does not have to be language services if language services feels that this is not an adequate use of resources. But if it could be outsourced to such a translation service, so whatever tool, most of these translation services, they do a machine translation and then a human, typically sometimes a human operator looks at them and makes corrections. And so that is, perhaps, another option to consider.

And then that way, you don't have to worry about, well, trying to reprogram anything. I don't know what Mark or what staff thinks about that. So the idea would be that we would outsource the translation instead of using a custom tool, instead of doing any programming whatsoever, we outsource it completely by a translation service, that we just simply send the e-mail so that when they translate it themselves and they forward it to the other e-mail list and vice versa. That is the other option and I suppose...

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Under that approach, also [inaudible] the beauty of the translation tool is that it's immediate. It's right away so this would add two hours, probably, to the translation.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Well, I would say, Silvia, that yes, there was that [problem] but usually these types of services would be a faster... I would say the beginning e-mail, which is probably the largest e-mail would require the longest time, but even then, we're talking literally an hour. We're not talking days or weeks or anything like that because, like I said, what they do, they do a machine translation first and then a human operator may look at it and depending on if we spend more, to have more human operators look at it to finesse it or if we just go with the machine translation. So it would not be that long. And remember we could also insist on using that special phrase. Just translate my response. Don't re-translate the entire thread.

So in that way, even if it becomes a long thread, if the e-mails that are being translated are up to three or four lines that the response is about. Do you understand what I'm saying, Silvia?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes. I do understand. I don't know if that is feasible, but perhaps Mark or Laura would like to reply to that suggestion or any other comments, please.

---

MARK SEGALL: I'm sorry, Dev. I wasn't quite capturing what the suggestion was that you were making.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, so the suggestion I'm saying is that we outsource the translation. Instead of trying to work on a programming mechanism, we outsource the translation to basically forward the e-mail to a translation service and they translate it and send it back to the other list.

MARK SEGALL: All right, Dev. Sorry. I understand now.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. So in other words, you don't have to worry about the programming aspect of things because, essentially, you are literally outsourcing the entire thing. So typically, those translations, that third-party service would do a machine translation and it would probably be the cheapest option. And of course, you could go to an even higher, a human person translating it. And I'm saying that the turnaround time would usually be about an hour which I think would be sufficient for the full LACRALO. We're not doing nuclear launch codes here. It's not that time sensitive. A turnaround time of an hour to get back should be okay. And again, we could our phrase to say, "When you see that special phrase, just translate the above line. Don't translate the rest." Do you follow, Mark?

---

MARK SEGALL: Hi, Dev. Yes, I do. And that was actually an option that we were... Before the end of the year, I was looking into... That was one concern you seem to be saying is not really a concern. There's just a time. And the other concern was money because I do believe a lot of them charge by the word, so the costs can get up there pretty quick.

But I'm definitely not opposed to that if provided the budget and if everyone's okay with the budget and they're okay with that time lapse.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. Would that solve the issue of who's maintaining the tool, etc.?

MARK SEGALL: Absolutely. There would be a cost savings from a development point of view.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yeah, so you need to look at that as well. Yeah, so that's the other option.

Honestly, I thought our language services could undertake that role, but I don't know what the costs are for that. But again, you could evaluate the options. But I know that, I'm sure there are various third-party tools, third party translation services, that will accept text, translate it and send it back to you. So yeah. Okay, well, I don't know. Anybody have any other options or ideas?

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Laura? Laura, please. Laura

LAURA BENGFORDE: I just have a question and maybe this is something you can help us out with, Sergio or I think Harold just joined as well. On the e-mails that are not going across – in other words, they're failing because they're either too long or they have some grammar issue or we don't know. We need to look at the logs. Are you getting the e-mail in return saying that it is failed? That is my question, my first question just to start out, and then I like to comment some further.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Laura, if I may answer from my perspective, I see a lot of e-mails that say it was unable to be translated and then I look and it was translate. And some other e-mails, I get the message and it wasn't translated so I don't know. I don't know. It doesn't point out to the e-mail. If I send an e-mail, what I get in return is I get a message. It doesn't highlight or point out my mistakes, whatever I did wrong. I have tried to use short sentences with periods, tried to follow the guidelines.

But when the tool was improved, they sent us some guidelines and I did try to follow them strictly. And now almost every e-mail we send from staff is not translated and the same is happening. Many e-mails are not translated and some others are so I think they've made it [inaudible] that we got if one set of the e-mails are not being translated, but we cannot identify in the [inaudible] where the [inaudible].

---

LAURA BENGFORD: Okay, thank you for that. I guess my follow-on, because mark and I were talking offline about looking at the log and really making sure that we're understanding what issues if we do get the budget and the resource we do need to fix on the existing mailing list. And I just wanted to make sure because one of the fixes was to better explain in that e-mail failure to you, what exactly was the failure or the grammar issue and so I wanted to just confirm that we are getting those e-mails, because if not, we might have another issue where we're not tracking the failures. So that was the reason for my question. Thank you.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, thank you very much. I have Sergio next and then Dev. Please, Sergio.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: I just wanted to repeat what Silvia was saying. I was going to put my hand down. We receive those e-mails, but at the same time, when you [inaudible] whether they are reading your e-mails, actually the e-mails get there. So there seems that here is some notification, some message from the Board that tells us that there was something wrong, something failed, but the e-mails are getting into the list. But what I don't know is whether they are also being translated or if they are just put into the list, in my case, in Spanish. So all the e-mails that I sent, if they are written in Spanish, they will never get translated.

So the problem is that an e-mail is being sent, a message is being sent but that message also lets the e-mail go into the list. That is what I wanted to say.

---

LAURA BENGFORD: Thank you.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes, okay. Dev first.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sure, thank you. Yes, to answer that question, exactly what Silvia and Sergio said. So what happens is that the e-mails go out and you see it on your list, list meaning the English list or the Spanish list, as to the list that you're posting to, and you're thinking, "Well, it's set." And one of the things we said for when deploying the new tool was to ensure that persons could only be subscribed to one list so they don't cross-post to both lists at the same time because that would [inaudible] testing. That created a difficulty for the tool.

So what we did before, we had a survey to say which of the one lists you wanted to be on. Okay, now having said that, I am on both lists because I am looking at the tool and I could tell. So that's when I noticed on mobile last year, that I'm seeing something in Spanish but I'm not seeing it in the English.

And the thing is when I post... Sometimes I don't... I could tell that sometimes... It's exactly what Silvia and Sergio said. We get the message saying that the e-mail can be translated but it went through anyway and sometimes you just won't see anything.



---

And like I said, it's rare from the English to the Spanish. It's more happening from the Spanish to the English because as you can see from the discrepancy in the quantity of e-mails on the list. Again, if you look at that same Wiki page, you will see a breakdown in months, the number of different e-mails. And also, the second issue which I didn't bring up, which talks to what Silvia is saying, is that the error message doesn't identify where in the e-mail message the error occurs. So you just... You only get the subject of the e-mail message.

So where exactly the error occurs, that's [inaudible] punctuation likely followed by a space. You're just left trying to figure out where it is and where the problem is. And, of course, 90 error messages don't help you to change our behavior. So the error messages become more of a hindrance rather than a help. But I guess that part is secondary right now because the missing e-mails are probably more critical to solve. Okay, well, I'll stop there.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. I think Harold would like to speak. Please, Harold.

HAROLD ARCOS:

Thank you, Silvia. Thank you, Mark and Laura. I just wanted to say that in the past, in the Technology Task Force, we run some tests for both lists and several volunteers wrote down our names in order to be tested for both lists, and our e-mail addresses we are put in separate lists in order to work on those tests in Spanish and in English.

---

So I would like to know if some of the addresses that where those list is are still active in a tester mode, so that we can try to find out that error, or perhaps that is something that we can identify through the testing email addresses that we used before.

I apologize for joining this call late. I don't know if you have touched upon this. About the translation tool, what are the technical aspects that may put some restrictions? Or perhaps we have a boat that indicates in the whole body of the e-mail can be translated and we should, perhaps, not necessarily have any grammatically restrictions so that the boat can understand that everything is HTML, plain text, and everything can be translatable without a restriction causing that problem. That was my question.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I see Silvia has dropped, so perhaps Mark or Heidi? Great.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah. Dev, thank you. I'm sorry I'm not in the... Well, I am in the AC but I'm not able to raise my hand. So Harold, you raise a really important topic and I'm wondering if it would be useful as a start to just design or develop some best practice guidelines for all users on how to avoid these problems that we're seeing in terms of their writing style. What are some of the best practice ways that we could write notes, messages, to lessen the chance of it not being translated properly. And that might be done with a webinar. That might be done on the monthly LARALO call. That might be done developing a Wiki page that people can look at,

---

etc. So just an option as in one step towards trying to decrease the problems we're having on the list. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSIGN: Okay. I can respond to that, Heidi. So we do have a Wiki page on this. And we've made various recommendations. In fact, one of the LACRALO internal working groups that even came up with the wording of the message, of the error message before this.

And I've got to find the Wiki page. It's somewhere on the LACRALO Wiki. But the idea was, it was general guidelines to say use short words, avoid colloquialisms and show proper punctuation. And this was the critical one, the punctuation. And the reason why the punctuation issue is more critical is because when you're sending the phrase to be translated, if there is no punctuation, then the tool has no idea where to cut the phrase. So you might be sending something mid-sentence, and therefore, the quality of translation suffers.

So that's why the emphasis was on the sentence punctuation and that's why that's the most common error message that everybody gets. Actually, I don't recall ever seeing any other message. The most other message I see is that the e-mail was too long and there's a limit of something like 5,000 characters I think it was. I think. Maybe Mark can answer that one part. But that's the other big issue.

But it's already there and the problem I think is that because the error message just says the message has failed to translate and you just get this sentence punctuation which we follow by a space, you have no idea where in the e-mail, where it happens. And that was my

---

recommendation. You need to fix that to say where in the e-mail it happens, because otherwise, you're just looking at this e-mail and thinking, "Well, I think it's okay," and then you start. It becomes a [inaudible] message and it's not helpful.

And asking people to really change their ways, it's kind of yes. Yes, having webinars and all that will be good, but it's kind of like eating healthy and exercising and so on. It's easy to say but it's harder to do.

Well, this is just on the Technology Task Force call. Sorry. Just to say – sorry, one more final thing – what I did suggest on the Technology Task Force call and I will repeat again was that what Mark and Laura could do is present, because they should be able to figure out why. It is ICANN's tool. They should know why this tool failed at precisely what point. They could do a slide deck, and sure, okay. These were sample e-mails that were sent. And here is where the translation tool had a problem because the lack of a full stop there or it was too long, whatever.

So what I'm doing for four or five e-mails, we could re-emphasize to people what to do so... And maybe that's the only way we could really do it. But yeah. There has been a Wiki page. There were some guidelines [to give] and so forth. It's just that I think the problem is that the error message is hard for us to even try to know how to correct ourselves even when we want to. So that's it.

---

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you, Dev. Just a quick comment on that point about the best practice information. The good news is that it's there. The bad news, like you said, it's somewhere on the LACRALO Wiki page and probably nobody knows where it is and many people have not looked at it in recent years. So I think maybe if we could just keep stressing that on the webinar, on the monthly meetings, just raise that point of what we need to do to get the help with the translation of the LACRALO mailing list. And we need to put it in a prominent place on the Wiki page, on the portal, on the webpage for LACRALO, anywhere people go and can easily find it. But I'll let Mark answer the other question. Thank you.

Mark, the question was could Laura and you develop, have some information on what makes the e-mail not translate correctly and show some slides on that? Dev, I think that was your point.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yeah.

MARK SEGALL: So just to make sure I'm understanding correctly, you're asking if it's possible to capture the reasons why, categorized why translations are failing?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. And I guess it comes back to also why they're missing e-mails in the first place.

---

MARK SEGALL: Yeah. Missing e-mails, that's definitely something that needs to be investigated. But why they're not being translated, I'm not sure if there's a lot of that being captured because this tool didn't start off with that kind of log in. I think it was just getting things in real time from Google Translate. I can't answer that one definitively. I'd have to get back to you on it, for sure.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, I see Laura. Laura, you would like to reply as well.

LAURA BENGFORD: Sorry. I was just going to echo what Mark already explained and I just put in the chat that the blocker we have on that is we do need that resource that Mark was talking to in order to get us the logs in order for us to do the analysis and prepare a best practice.

But I agree that would be very helpful. I think that's a good idea. Mark and I are just escalating and trying to see if we can get a resource sooner rather than later to help us do that first.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay. Okay, thank you. Okay, so we have Harold and then Dev and I think kind of have pushed far, finalizing.

MARK SEGALL: Wrapping up, yes.

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yeah, wrapping up, please. Okay, Harold, please.

HAROLD ARCOS: I would like to thank you for this space and for focusing your attention on this. I understand that we still don't know why this is happening. I don't want to be repetitive but I just want to say that by following all the best practices that we have on our Wiki page, we still have failures with a tool, and within LACRALO, Dev has helped us and he has made presentations on different occasions, in different meetings on different calls and he has spoken about this and he has conveyed these best practices. But anyway, we're still have problems with punctuation and with the length of the e-mail, so I think that the problem is still there and it goes beyond that.

So we have to revisit this idea and think if we can go back to the testing mode with a tester and I would like to be on the English list. I will have to write e-mails in English and in Spanish to both lists separately to make sure that all the e-mails that I post, that I send, can reach all the community members so they will be the recipient for these e-mails under the understanding that we still have some failure with this all, so perhaps, this is a solution to be registered in both lists because we need a solution as soon as possible because every day, we need to communicate something.

So it is important to make sure that we can still communicate with the rest of the people. So perhaps to avoid these problems, we will need to let the community know about this, and once again, we can run the test. And it is important to bear this in mind. We need to make sure that

---

the tool is working perfectly in all cases, not just in a few of them. Thank you, Silvia.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay. Thank you, Harold. And I just want to move straight here. I just want to clarify that there are some bilingual members, LACRALO members, who are subscribed to both lists so they can post in English and in the Spanish one as well as the Chair and the Secretariat. They're Joe and Carlos, and they have to work. So there are some members, maybe it's the same members, who bought lists but when they flew as a group, we ask people to subscribe even to one or to other, so I have one cross-[post] team and Dev, please.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:

Okay. So well, Harold pointed it out. I'm willing to also be a guinea pig for if you want to set up the new translation tool, this time the existing tool, to the same testing translation lists which was [neutrons] [inaudible] and [neutrons] [inaudible]. And if you want to [inaudible] there and just let us start posting and see what happens. We could do that as well. So I don't think... But I do want to get some clarity on the next steps here because by Friday, I think by Friday, we're going to get some better understanding of what is causing the problem. What's our timeline here in terms of this? Because I guess I'm not 100% sure. We have a lot of options to consider, but what's our next course of action? And I guess I'll leave it to Mark so we have time for that. That's it.



---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes, thank you. Mark, you can slide by with your time now and the next steps [inaudible].

MARK SEGALL: Yes. As we were in the middle of this call, I actually sent an e-mail over reminding the team that I really need to get a candidate, a resource, for looking into these issues, and particularly number one, on that list. That one, I set a mandate that we at least need to get an understanding, find out when that resource can be freed up by Friday. Hopefully, sooner, and then I think the best I can offer in terms of next steps after that is that I can provide periodic updates because there's going to be a little bit of murkiness on when things can be done until developers actually looking at the code, getting familiar with it, looking at the logs and trying to understand the issue at hand.

So that's the best I can do for the next step is just providing a periodic update. I can provide updates on a weekly basis if that works for the team until we have more firmed up on understanding of when the developer's going to be able to get the issue openly resolved.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay. We could [inaudible] agrees. I think that would be useful, [inaudible], Mark, to see because we see a lot... During the day, you get a lot of notifications and when there is a lot of traffic, I see e-mails, "It's not translated," "It's not translated" many times. So one has to physically open the site, go through, check where [inaudible] are. That's [inaudible] you have a log daily maybe that tell us exactly which ones actually did not make it to [inaudible] because out of the ten

---

[applications], maybe five are real and five others actually did make it to the [inaudible]. So would that be possible to have a real log of actual e-mails that were not translated?

MARK SEGALL: That's a good request. It's the same problem I'm facing with everything else though. As a resource, who would be the one to maintain such a log and keep that updated? Because to my knowledge, that would be a manual process to go through and look for where things failed and then try and keep that log up to date.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, I understand.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Silvia?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Just as a next step, I still would like to have some sort of retraining. I think it would not hurt to have a little bit of just an awareness [inaudible] of best practice, so if we could maybe just get a webinar or just have a reminder on the next LACRALO, monthly calls. I really do think that would be helpful if we could also just get that in a more

---

prominent, that page in a more prominent position on the Wiki and the webpage of the LACRALO. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: We can certainly look at this because when the tool was deployed in 2017, there was a special. We had a presentation on the LACRALO call where [inaudible] was happening and what you have to do and so forth. We could go back in the archives and dig out that presentation again and see.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Perfect.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So I'm going to issue that as a reminder on the LACRALO monthly call. Certainly we can do that.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay, because there have been new people. We have new members that may not be familiar with that. And again, as people, as time goes by, people just tend to get that best practice. So I think a friendly reminder would be useful.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: True. But the biggest question, the critical issue though is that there are missing e-mails and even when they were perfectly formatted. It could have been perfectly formatted. For some reason, they were stopped for

---

some reason and we still don't know. So I think [inaudible], Mark [inaudible] priority to figure out what happened.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah, definitely and I also think that Harold's offer of being on the English list as well as the Spanish list and sort of monitoring, at least with the really important messages. That would be absolutely welcome to do that and that would be great, and given his role as Secretariat, he could lunge or that. So thank you, Harold, if you could do that.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So should we have our next call next week? Are you going to follow-up with e-mails, Mark, on this or... Do you want to create a Skype chat for these things? I'm on Skype. I'm on slack. So if you wanted to discuss this offline, what I did, feel free. You don't need to wait until next week. That is what I'm saying because this is a [inaudible].

MARK SEGALL: I'm open to any communication medium. If the team feels a Skype channel is the way to go, I'm open to that versus the e-mail. Either way, I'll be happy to go whichever direction.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Skype will be fine for me as well.

---

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, I see Sergio says, "Yes, we have one call next week." But I [inaudible] to have a call next week. I could touch base and see where we are. Of course, we do it through a Skype chat [inaudible] tool, troubleshoot or something like that to have more communication. But I think our call will be [inaudible] and see if there are still some ready for progress and what are the next steps? So maybe a week from now, but it's okay with you?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sure.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Okay, Greg. Okay, and then thank you so much, Harold. Harold Arcos and Sergio both are on both lists so they can monitor very nicely. Thank you very much, Harold, to monitor and they can post in each language so important messages from the dealership which are being [inaudible] in this space are not missed. And I will work with you, Harold, if something is, a [inaudible] translation, I will be there for a translation, a quick translation or [inaudible].

Okay, I guess we are 20 minutes over the time and thank you so much, the interpreters. Thank you, everyone. I guess since nobody else has anything else to say, [inaudible], [guests] you can [inaudible] and then we can [inaudible] for next week and a week from now, in the next week.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**