

**Attendance: (33 Members)**

Alberto Soto	John Rodriguez
Alicia Paz	Juan Manuel Rojas
Ann-Cathrin Marcussen	Justine Chew
Bram Fudzulani	Kristine Dorrain
Bruna Santos	Marit Moll
Cheryl Langdon-Orr	Martin Sutton
Chris Casavale	Matthew Johnson
Christopher Wilkinson	Nick Wenban-Smith
Colin O'Brien	Olga Cavalli
David McAuley	Olga Kyrlyiuk
Greg Shatan	Paul McGrady
Jaap Akkerhuis	Sophie Hey
Javier Rua-Jovet	Susan Anthony
Jeff Neuman	Timothy Asiedu
Jessica Hooper	Tom Dale
Jim Prendergast	Vernatius Okwu

**Audio only:**

Kavouss Arasteh

**Apologies:**

Annebeth Lange

Flip Petillion

Dev Anand Teelucksingh

**Staff:**

Steve Chan

Julie Hedlund

Michelle DeSmyter

**AC chat:**

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear all, welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level call on Wednesday, 20 February 2019 at 20:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/oJUWBg>

Olga Cavalli:hello!

Olga Cavalli:was in a different room :(

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):INdeed @Olga bit of a snafu

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:Hello to all. Bienvenidos. Will try to get voice if possible, but in traffic.

Juan Manuel Rojas:Hi everyone!

Christopher Wilkinson:Where are the public comments posted?

David McAuley:Christopher, you can see them

here: <https://mm.icann.org/pipermail/comments-geo-names-wt5-initial-05dec18/>

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Yes excellent response

David McAuley:what?

Olga Cavalli:we are loosing you Martin

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):This is ALSO an opportunity to ask any clarifications questions of the COmmenters

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):It can be useful to have the Spreadsheet open as a seperate document if you can

Steve Chan:The particular tab we are reviewing is available in the AC room of course. However, if you'd like to review in the Google sheet, please find the link

here: <https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https->

[3A\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d\\_1WKSC-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-)

[5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs\\_edit-3Fusp-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-)

[3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWI](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI)

[PqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=i3qYum3IBl](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI)

[w9Do8hJDcd6dUqXzmRz5yPzkk\\_9XDyu\\_E&s=rPDJqZLsfs\\_IvvYJzAFmFqO7OdwfV6KncZX6](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI)

[g3QtdGg&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI)

Steve Chan:Which is also shared in the agenda pod

Steve Chan:We are on the second tab, General Comments

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):we will try to keep you updated on what line in the Google Doc (which IS a Synthesis Tool) and also always links to the full PC received...

here and you can all scroll through the shared screen in AC

Steve Chan:@Christopher, I'm not sure about your question, although that is probably something specific to your computer environment?

Kristine Dorrain:Apologies for being late, but I just logged on and heard that Amazon Registry doesn't exist. I assure you, we do. Kristine Dorrain -- Sr. Corp. Counsel, Amazon Registry Services, Inc.

Julie Hedlund:"scrubbed" appears for attachments to comments when they are posted. But I wonder if Jaap will be able to address it :-)

jaap akkerhuis:Yes, I was going to say that.

jaap akkerhuis:They are turned into an clickable attachment for security reasons

Steve Chan:Oh, apologies, misunderstood the question...thanks Jaap and Julie.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Tab 2 'General Comments' is where we will start IN this Synthesis tool \*thanks again staff\* and links in each cell is found to full PC received

David McAuley:Thanks CLO, helpful

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Perhaps that is a point you might want to raise with to the attention of the ATRT3 Christopher (regarding the usefulness and any weighting/management of Public Comments in ICANN Policy Processes...

Paul McGrady:I'm not sure I understand the last comment. We aren't weighing the relative weight of in-person WG contributions v. public comments. We are just going through public comments, right?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Yes Paul a triage

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):OF COmments received (at this stage)

Paul McGrady:Thanks Cheryl!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):PLEASE do move on Yes @Martin

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):The Lines in General Comments runs in the Google Doc runsa from line 4 -> 46 we will briefly review in order now (noting any trends

Paul McGrady:Even opened in a separare document, that lime green font is really hard to read. :)

Olga Cavalli:Argentina Colombia Chile submitted together

Steve Chan:Yeah, sorry Paul - we've come too far in using it in our various documents for public comment review in SubPro. It was felt that consistency across documents is important, although we'll definitely consider something more legible in the future.

David McAuley:Steve - maybe will help if you have to keep the color to use bold

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):It probably would @David ;-)

Steve Chan:@David, I'm not sure staff can go through all of these comments again without impairing our sanity :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):So P 5 in the AC Rm Cell line 10 = Line 13 (sorry) in the G Doc for thise scrolling Martin is noting the line numbers for you in AC

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):P 6 in AC

David McAuley:not to go back, but maybe in future, not a big deal to me but the lime is a tad hard to read

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):the color pallet is a tad limiting but Bold may assist as you say

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):P7 in AC = Line 15 in GDoc

Steve Chan:The GAC comment is actually highlighted green. Still hard to read I'm guessing. I think a new color choice is likely warranted.

Steve Chan:Highlighted BOLD i should say

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):P 8 / Line 18 in GDoc

Justine Chew:@Steve, yes please! This is what I have been saying also.

Paul McGrady:Just a reminder that we are only walking through this document today, so silence doesn't equal assent.

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):you are doing great Martin! Its not easy doing what you are doing

Paul McGrady:+! Jeff. Martin is doing great.

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:hand up by @christopher

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Indeed just ensure we are seeing any errors omissions, trends or need for clarifications from the Commenter

Steve Chan:If you click on View in the Google doc, you might find it helpful to increase the Zoom to a reasonable size.

David McAuley:That is helpful, thanks Steve

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:There is no position. There are proposals and points of view in the worktrack.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Not got to any PC reactions to tha matter as yet CW

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Exactly @Javier

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):and NOT in any General COmment received (that I read at least)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Your point is Noted and please DO make it again if you feel the need \*when\* we get to that question

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:+1 Martin.

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:I think your ok @martin

Steve Chan:No high-lighting - mostly background

Steve Chan:And there is a part 2 to the Marques comment

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:you're (excuse typo)

Steve Chan:Quite a few more actually Martin - not quite halfway through the General Comments.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):P 12 in AC Line 22 GDoc

Christopher Wilkinson:Martin: I would have hoped that as co-lead, you could have explained to Marqus that their position is politically non viablke unacceptable. CW

Steve Chan:It's a separate element of the comment, but same sentiment.

Steve Chan: P 13 in AC Line 24 GDoc

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Thx for tracking this now @Steve I am now in 2 calls at once

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Christopher this is not the time for such an intervention and I beleive that all parties have fully engaged and understood the processes quite well

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):making an argument does NOT always equate to Winning a point or debate

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):CONsensus is a deffinition

Kristine Dorrain:We're paying attention. We disagree,

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Indeed @Martin your processes are sound and So DO please continue with due process

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:+1 @Martin

Marita Moll:Sorry, leaving for another call.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Noted @ Kristine and apologies for any slight taken by any party in this process... Consensus Builing is a dynamic ansd sometimes tricky thing (especially where views and positions are deeply held)

Kristine Dorrain:@CLO, not at you. Sorry. I was responding to CW who said the registries weren't paying attention because we disagreed with his points.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):I understood that @Kristine NP at all

Steve Chan:@Martin, that should say if WT5 does NOT extend geo names protections...then further community deliberations might be needed. Typo in the summary statement that was just amended.

Steve Chan:P 19 in AC Line 37 GDoc

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:@All: let us all remeber that this is not a deliberative call.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair):Great Progress @Martin a LOT to have got through... THANKS everyone!!!

Justine Chew:AC line 33 - ALAC's comment, I am uncomfortable with the remark "Suggests that if WT5 does extend geo names protections, further community deliberations may be needed" because it is a little misleading, since in general the ALAC's statement is supportive of protection of geo names. I would request that the remark be amended to "Suggests that if WT5 does extend expansion of geoname availability, further community deliberations may be needed." .

Nick Wenban-Smith:all comments seem very predictable and in line with statements made over the course of the past 2 years

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:Noted @Justine

Kristine Dorrain:@Nick, agree.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Thanks for that @Justine seems clear

Justine Chew:@Martin, I am the ALAC/At-Large liaison for SubPro :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):@Justine IS the point person on this

Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):Thanks Justine - appreciate that

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:Thanks @Justine

Paul McGrady:Christopher sounds really distorted. I'm not sure if there is anything we can do to sharpen the audio quality.

Paul McGrady:This is document is a Herculean effort by staff. Thank Staff!

David McAuley:+1 @Paul

Michelle DeSmyter:February 27, 2019 at 05:00 UTC

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 PDP Co-Chair)):Bye for now everyone until we meet up next call do take time to review the next Tab of materials from PC's received

Steve Chan:Thanks Paul, we do not disagree. Haha :) We look forward to doing some other streams of work.

David McAuley:ThanksMartin, good bye all

Kristine Dorrain:Well done Martin!

Javier Rua-Jovet ALAC co-Lead:Thanks @Martin

Kristine Dorrain:This is tough work.

Vernatius Okwu EZEAMA:Audio is too poor.

Olga Cavalli:Well done Martin!!

Olga Cavalli:bye all

Justine Chew:@Kristine, indeed!

Justine Chew:Thanks all

jaap akkerhuis:bye all