Andrea Glandon: (9/25/2018 09:39) Welcome to day 2 of the EPDP Face to Face meeting, held on Tuesday, 25 September 2018.

Andrea Glandon: (09:39) Wiki Agenda Page: https://community.icann.org/x/rQarBQ

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:30) Hi Julf

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:31) dEAR jULF, in addition being one of the SIX member of the NCSG, DO YOU HAVE OTHER TASKS TO PERFORM AT THIS MEETING

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:32) Hi, Kavouss, and no, representing NCSG is my only task at this meeting.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:32) tKS THEN LET US WORK TOGETHER

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:33) Absolutely!

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:34) Tks , merci, vielen Danke, Gracias, Arigatio gozaimasta ,tashakor

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:34) Mamnoun in Persian

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:34) Tack, dank u and kiitos!

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:35) Entonces, bamous a escouchar

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:36) you win :)

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:36) Is your name a greek one

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:37) First name is swedish/finnish nickname, gamily name is "from Helsinki" in latin, back from the days when latin was the langiage at universities

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:38) oh yes, I got it ,

Kristina Rosette (RySG): (10:38) Happy Tuesday!

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:38) Yes Kristina, Happy Tuesday, happy people , happy LA

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:39) It is California after all. Everybody is happy and beautiful.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:40) Yes and Swedish are amomng the most peaceful nations I have evr seen

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:40) Except at an ice hockey match

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:42) I learned a lot from my swedish colleagues. I had a swedish boss for 12 years ,a real friendly democrat and open minded person

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:42) Good to hear

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:43) OK, let's get down to work and get some consensus going

Thomas Rickert (ISPCP): (10:51) Kavouss, the work sheet is not a US work product. It is the product of a iranian-german collaboration.

Marika Konings 2: (10:54) Note that all the work sheets are now posted on the wiki: https://community.icann.org/x/rQarBQ

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:57) Thomas ,I raised my hand pls respect that

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:58) Thomas, I did say American style working methods for any meeting of this type

Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (10:58) Kavouss: your hand is noted

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (10:59) POINT OF ORDER

Julf Helsingius: (11:02) kavouss, we can't hear you

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (11:06) Hi Kavouss... the word "purpose" in this sense is a specific reference in the GDPR.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (11:11) Please replace the term " PURPOSE" by other terms which reflect what we expecting that ICANN , Registry, or Registrar should do.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (11:12) As for third party there is not relevance of what they may expect the their purpose. I do not understand the meaning of " Third Party Purpose"

Thomas Rickert (ISPCP): (11:12) Kavouss, we have been working on the purpose matrix for hours and hours, so I am surprised you are concerned about the use of the word. We have to specify who is pursuing what purposes, so ICANN purposes are the ones pursued by ICANN. This is part of the legal tests we conduct. Please, let us agree to use the words as in the law.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (11:13) I have no problem twith the works you have done as I fully appreciate that but pls do not label them as " pURPOSE"

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (11:15) i STRONGLY sUPPORT THE USE OF OR REFERENCE TO ACCURACY

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (11:16) pLS KINDLY INDICATE WHY WE CAN NOT ADDRESS THE QUESTION OF ACCURACY OR ADDITIONAL ACCURACY

Milton Mueller (NCSG): (11:21) Accuracy under GDPR means a data subject's ability to correct inaccurate data. It does not mean "verification"

Milton Mueller (NCSG): (11:22) So if people are going to use this "accuracy" question to try to write new policies regarding verification I will oppose any addition of this question

Thomas Rickert (ISPCP): (11:28) We have agreed on a compromise yesterday contaning three points: 1. Amend language of the purose (we did that). 2. Add a disclaimer that none of ICANN's accuracy requirments will be impaired and 3. that this does not preclude any further debate on accuracy. Can we stick to this agreement? We can discuss the wish for additional accuracy requirements, but let us PLEASE work on the purposes on the list. We will get nowhere if we get distracted now.

Georgios Tselentis (GAC): (11:30) I do not break the agreement Thomas. I out the debate on the spreadshit under discussion. I canoot understand why we discuss 5 1 c regarding retention in the data analysis of the GDPR and not 5 1 d

Milton Mueller (NCSG): (11:36) Georgios: you're getting pushback because you're not interested in mapping purposes to data elements and legal bases but are pushing a policy agenda, or so it seems to us.

Thomas Rickert (ISPCP): (11:36) Georgios, I think that 5 I d as a general principle is not related to a specific purpose, but - as data security and other GDPR requirments - relevant to all purposes. Data retention, however, might differ from data element to data element. Hence the distinction.

Terri Agnew: (12:10) We are currently in break out sessions and will return in approx 20 minutes

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:14) tERRI

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:14) I had to drop off

Andrea Glandon: (12:15) We will call you back, Kavouss.

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:15) Pls kindly advise the operator to dial me up for the rest of the morning and so on after the lunch

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:17) To My Friend Thomas, Pls kindly replace the term " Purpose " in all four sections

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:18) Pls kindly note that as far as the third party is concerned the use of thwe term " PURPOSE OF THIRD PARTY" IS TOTALLY MISLEADING AS IT MIGHT JHAVE NEGATIVE CONSEQUENCES OR INAPPROPRIATE IMPLICATION

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:18) sORRY FOR cap

Terri Agnew: (12:31) break out sessions have been extended - they will run for another 15 minutes

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:45) Thomas; you may use the following title:

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:47) Purpose of data processing with respect to a) fICANN the organization, b) Registry and c) Registrar as well as regarding the third party

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC) 2: (12:48) I repeat;Purpose of data processing with respect to a) ICANN the organization, b) Registry and c) Registrar as well as regarding the third party

Terri Agnew: (13:11) Ayden is speaking

Terri Agnew: (13:17) Benedict is speaking

Terri Agnew: (13:17) back to Ayden

Terri Agnew: (13:19) Kristina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (13:20) question queu: Kristaina and Marc

Terri Agnew: (13:21) que: Marc and Lindsay

Terri Agnew: (13:22) Benedcit is speaking

Terri Agnew: (13:23) Gina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:26) speaking Lindsay
Marc Anderson (RySG): (13:26) Can we have scroll capibilities please.
Terri Agnew: (13:26) it was adjusted for the screens behind you
Marika Konings: (13:27) Note that these have now also been distributed to the mailing list so you can download it on your own computer
Terri Agnew: (13:27) Thomas is speaking
Marc Anderson (RySG): (13:27) we are talking about hte purpose... please scroll up.
Terri Agnew: (13:28) que: Julf
Terri Agnew: (13:28) Thomas is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:30) que: Kavouss and Benedict
Terri Agnew: (13:31) queu: Benedict and Milton
Terri Agnew: (13:33) que: Milton and Stephanie
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (13:34) sTEPHANIE +1
Terri Agnew: (13:34) Reminder to mute when not speaking
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (13:35) tERRI, BY ALL MEANS i have always always done that
Terri Agnew: (13:36) Thanks Kavouss, we were getting some feedback from your line
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (13:37) BEnedict, could you pls explore what do you mean by future possibility
Terri Agnew: (13:39) que: Marc and Stephanie
Terri Agnew: (13:40) @Kavouss, we will pass this along to Benedict.
Terri Agnew: (13:41) Farzaneh is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:42) @Kavouss, we confirm Benedict has been given your question
Terri Agnew: (13:43) David is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:44) Gina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:45) que: Kavouss, Stehanie and Thomas
Caitlin Tubergen: (13:47) Kavouss, is that an old hand?
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (13:49) I tend to agree, to some extent ,with Stehanie
Terri Agnew: (13:50) Margie is speaking
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (13:50) What is core engineering data
Caitlin Tubergen: (13:50) Kavouss, is your hand raised?
Terri Agnew: (13:51) Farzaneh is speaking
Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (13:52) Kavouss: the stuff at the top until and including registry registrant ID
Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (13:52) plus the name server data
Terri Agnew: (13:52) Thomas is speaking
Georgios Tselentis (GAC): (13:52) so state and postl can be optional instead of deleting
Julf Helsingius (NCSG): (13:53) They should be replaced by "address information"
Terri Agnew: (13:54) Lindsay is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:56) Marc is speaking
Georgios Tselentis (GAC): (13:56) Data retention should be related to the purpose: how the registrants rights are served during the retention period
Farzaneh Badii (NCSG): (13:56) so address is really to receive letters about their domain name. so it can be a P.O box too?
Kristina Rosette (RySG): (13:57) Don't want to join the queue, but perhaps we could identify different data retention periods for difference objectives/reasons.
Terri Agnew: (13:57) Kurt is speaking
Terri Agnew: (13:59) Stephanie is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:00) Benedict is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:02) que: Margie, Georgios and Thomas

Terri Agnew: (14:04) Thomas is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:05) que: Ashley
Terri Agnew: (14:06) Ben is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:06) Benedict is speaking
Thomas Rickert (ISPCP): (14:06) It is 2.2 Statute of LimitationsA dispute must be filed no later than twelve (12) months after the alleged violation of the Transfer Policy.
Terri Agnew: (14:07) Alex is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:08) Gina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:10) queue: Dan and Kristina
Terri Agnew: (14:12) Kristina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:12) Gina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (14:13) lunch break
Terri Agnew: (14:50) we will begin shortly
Terri Agnew: (14:50) we have begun
Terri Agnew: (14:51) Kristina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:04) Alan asked the question
Terri Agnew: (15:05) David is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:05) Kristtina is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:05) David is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:06) Diane is speaking
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:06) Dvid, pls speak slowly, no hurry , no exciting
Terri Agnew: (15:06) @Kavouss, we will pass along this note
Terri Agnew: (15:07) Berry is speaking
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:07) who is berry?
Terri Agnew: (15:07) Berry Cobb
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:08) what affiliation pls
Terri Agnew: (15:08) ICANN Org Policy Consultant
Terri Agnew: (15:08) Farzaneh is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:08) Diane is speaking
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:09) WHO IS DIANE AND WHAT AFFILIATION AND WHY SHE IS NOT IN THE LIST
Terri Agnew: (15:10) Alan W is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:10) members are listed here: https://community.icann.org/x/4IpHBQ
Caitlin Tubergen: (15:11) Diane Plaut is with the IPC, and is a member of the EPDP Team.
Terri Agnew: (15:11) Berry is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:11) Alan W is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:11) David is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:14) Diane is speaking
Terri Agnew: (15:14) queue: Kristina and Benedict
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:15) tERRI, PLS COMPLETE THE LIST WITH THOSE SPEAKERS THAT THEIR NAMES ARE MISING
Terri Agnew: (15:16) @Kavouss, the particpants pod to the left are those who logged into adobe connect
Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:16) we have 17 in the list and more than that speaking , why
Terri Agnew: (15:16) full member list is located here: https://community.icann.org/x/4IpHBQ
Ashley Heineman (GAC): (15:16) Just to add to Terri's comment, the adobe connect is being projected on a screen here, so there isn't the need for everyone to be logged in (thus not everyone is listed).
Terri Agnew: (15:16) Not all have logged into Adobe Connect as we have screens in the room

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:17) BUT they should aopear in the list on the left hand side of AC PAGE

Terri Agnew: (15:17) Matt is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:17) Diane is speaking

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:18) tHEY MUST LOGGED TO BE SEEN BY OTHERS . PLS FORMALLYK THEM TO DO SO. i can not follow the speakers

Terri Agnew: (15:18) Thomas is speaking

Milton Mueller (NCSG): (15:18) Curb your caps, Kavouss

Kavouss Arasteh (GAC): (15:19) Sorry do not need any advice

Terri Agnew: (15:20) Benedict is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:21) Diane Plaut is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:22) Alan Woods is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:23) Diane Plaut is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:24) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:24) queue: Margie, Stephanie, Kristina

Terri Agnew: (15:26) @Kavouss, I added an additional pod to the right. You can scroll and see names and affliations of the members

Terri Agnew: (15:27) queue: Berry and Margie

Terri Agnew: (15:28) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:29) Diane is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:30) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:30) Kristina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:31) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:31) Margie is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:32) Kristina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:32) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:33) Alex is speaking

kAVOUSS aRASTEH: (15:33) dAVID IS RESPECTFULLY AND KINDLY REQUESTED not TO INTERVENE ON EVERY COMMENT . hIS ROLE IS NOT GIVING DIRECTION TO THE DISCUSSION BUT LOOK FOR POSSIBLE NORROWING DOWN THE DIVERGENCE

Terri Agnew: (15:34) Farzaneh is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:34) Marika is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:35) Farzaneh is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:35) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:36) Kristina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:37) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:37) @Kavouss, we have passed along your comment above

Terri Agnew: (15:37) Alans G is speaking

kAVOUSS aRASTEH: (15:38) dAVID, PLS KINDLY NOTE THAT YOU AS CONVENER SHOULD REFRAIN TAKING A POSITION , IN FAVOUR OR AGAINST ANY MEMBER PLS KINDLY AND RESPECTFULLY OBSERVE THAT. YOU DO NOT NEED NECESSIRILY TO RESPONDE TO ANY INTERVWENTION. AS YOU ARE NOT A JUDGE

Terri Agnew: (15:39) @Kavouss, we have passed along your comment

Terri Agnew: (15:39) Hadia is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:41) @Kavouss: from Kurt: David is rephrasing questions to ensure that the group properly understands the questions. The group members here have expressed an appreciation for that. Nonetheless, I will speak to David at the next break

Terri Agnew: (15:41) Margie is speaking

kAVOUSS aRASTEH: (15:42) thERE IS NOT NEED THAT HE REPHRASE AS HE MAY CHANGE THE ESENSE OF THE QUESTION

Terri Agnew: (15:42) Benedcit is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:43) Hadia is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:43) Margie is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:44) Hadia is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:45) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:45) Alan G is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:45) Daine is speaking

Kristina Rosette (RySG): (15:46) When we get to Registry and Registrar purposes for item M, there will likely be different legal bases for some of the policies.

Terri Agnew: (15:46) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:47) Farzaneh is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:48) Thomas is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:49) David is speaking

Kristina Rosette (RySG): (15:50) Folks, I have to step out for another obligation. I expect to be back by 3:10. While I'm out, Beth Bacon will be acting as an RySG Member.

Terri Agnew: (15:51) Gina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:52) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:53) Thomas is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:54) Gina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:54) Thomas is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:55) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:55) reminder, all documents are located on the wiki agenda page: https://community.icann.org/x/rQarBQ

Terri Agnew: (15:56) Marika is speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:56) Benedcit and Thomas are speaking

Stephanie Perrin: (15:57) Everybody, remember to state your name so poor Terri doesn't have to type it in ....

Terri Agnew: (15:58) Georgios, Thomas and David are speaking

Terri Agnew: (15:59) Hadia is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:00) queue: Alex and Marc

kAVOUSS aRASTEH (GAC): (16:01) Everyone Shall Use AC and speaks through AC then Terri needs not to type and the queue could be properly established

kAVOUSS aRASTEH (GAC): (16:02) Kurt ,pls intervene asv David does not take care

Terri Agnew: (16:02) Gina is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:03) @Kavouss, your audio is not good.

Terri Agnew: (16:04) Marika is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:13) David is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:14) back to Marika

Terri Agnew: (16:15) Stephanie is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:16) back to Marika

Terri Agnew: (16:16) Farzaneh is speaking

Terri Agnew: (16:19) break for 15 minutes

Terri Agnew: (16:42) we are starting back

Collin Kurre (NCSG): (16:50) I might clarify that we specified that requiring any additional data collection for the purpose of escrow is beyond the remit of this PDP, but may be touched upon in the report as a suggested topic for future work

Collin Kurre (NCSG): (16:50) re Reseller, Phone, and Email fields

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (16:52) Not sure I understand why name server and nameserver address aren't elements included in E.

Collin Kurre (NCSG): (16:52) I defer to a registrar, but believe it's because those fields were deemed unnecessary for the contact and establishment of a business relationship between the registrant and receiving registrar

Matt Serlin (RrSG): (16:53) yes and the nameserver information is authoritative at the registry

Alex Deacon - IPC: (16:53) @ahsley - because chances are the new registrar will set the values for these fields to their own name servers

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (16:53) Ah... forgot that this applied only to the registrar.   Coffee... more coffee.

Stephanie Perrin: (16:54) except for exercise of registrant rights to access

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (16:55) Back to my original question.. this section does apply to registries as well., so my original question stands. Happy to have an offline converation with experts to expalin this to me.

Marika Konings: (16:56) @Ashley - this is only for registrars, the registry escrow worksheet has not been completed yet as the group ran out of time.

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (16:57) Ah... so I'm (once again) not paying proper attention. Thanks!

Collin Kurre (NCSG): (17:06) Somewhat related to what Thomas is saying, we also discussed the possibility of having some sort of authentication system (token, etc) for use between the registrant and gaining registrar. Could go toward privacy by design (though, again, outside the purview of this group)

Farzaneh Badii (NCSG): (17:21) here is the language: coordinate the development and implementation of policies for resolution of disputes regarding the registration of domain names (as opposed to the use of such domain names). (ICANN bylaws Annex G and 1(1) sectionI(a)

Farzaneh Badii (NCSG): (17:22) above is my recommendation for M!

Collin Kurre (NCSG): (17:22) !!

Terri Agnew: (18:05) 25 minutes left of the break out sessions

Terri Agnew: (18:34) we have started back up

Ashley Heineman (GAC): (19:08) Can we go to folks in the que who have not yet spoken?

Kristina Rosette (RySG): (19:36) @Staff: Where can we find the comments that have been submitted on the UAM? I haven't been able to find them. Thanks!

Marika Konings: (19:40) checking

Kristina Rosette (RySG): (19:51) thank you!