

At-Large Workspace: Proposed Procedure for Selecting a Top-Level Domain String for Private Use

Public Comment Close	Statement Name	Status	Assigned Working Group	Assignee (s)	Call for Comments Open	Call for Comments Close	Vote Open	Vote Close	Date of Submission	Staff Contact and Email
28 February 2023	Proposed Procedure for Selecting a Top-Level Domain String for Private Use	NO STATEMENT	CPWG							

Hide the information below, please click [here](#) >>

What We Need Your Input On

ICANN org has published an initial version of the procedure for how it will choose a string, and we need your input on whether that procedure fulfills the recommendation and the criteria given in SAC113. Note that the input we need is on the procedure itself, but not on the criteria from SAC113. That is, ICANN org will use the criteria as published and not change them. ICANN org is explicitly not seeking input on possible strings that meet the criteria in SAC113.

Proposals For Your Input

[Procedure for Selecting a Top-Level Domain String for Private Use \(PDF, 43.32 KB\)](#)

FINAL VERSION SUBMITTED (IF RATIFIED)

The final version to be submitted, if the draft is ratified, will be placed here by upon completion of the vote.

FINAL DRAFT VERSION TO BE VOTED UPON BY THE ALAC

The final draft version to be voted upon by the ALAC will be placed here before the vote is to begin.

DRAFT SUBMITTED FOR DISCUSSION

The first draft submitted will be placed here before the call for comments begins. The Draft should be preceded by the name of the person submitting the draft and the date/time. If, during the discussion, the draft is revised, the older version(S) should be left in place and the new version along with a header line identifying the drafter and date/time should be placed above the older version(s), separated by a Horizontal Rule (available + Insert More Content control).

Hadia Elminiawi

22 feb. 11:46

The ALAC appreciates the opportunity to comment on the proposed procedure for selecting a Top-level Domain string for Private Use.

The selection criteria provided in the SAC113 "SSAC Advisory on Private Use TLDs" to guide the decision on which string to choose and assist the ICANN Board in making its determination, includes four criteria

1. It is a valid DNS label
2. It is not already delegated in the root zone
3. It is not confusingly similar to another TLD in existence
4. It is relatively short, memorable, and meaningful.

However, other considerations could be considered such as internationalized versions of the string and strings that are already in use for this purpose. Also, considering that it is not possible to choose a string that will accommodate the preference of all DNS users, as well as criteria three and four are subjective and cannot be easily verified through factual tests. The ALAC does not agree that the public comment proceeding for the string only asks the community to verify that IANA followed the process given, without having the opportunity to comment on the string itself.

The ALAC is of the view that allowing the public to comment on the selected string and not only the followed procedure will enable useful input that could support selection criteria three and four and consider all pros and cons associated with the string selected for private use. Therefore, assisting in people actually using the string and not continuing to use other ad-hoc strings for private use.