

---

ANDREA GLANDON: Okay, Eduardo, I'm going to go ahead and start the recordings and do the introduction. I'll turn it over to you. Give me just a moment. We will now officially start the recommendation of this conference call.

Good morning, good afternoon and good evening, welcome to the NARALO monthly teleconference held on Monday the 12th of November, 2018 at 20:00 UTC.

On today's call, we have Eduardo Diaz, Alfredo Calderon, George Kirikos, Gordon Chillcott, Marita Moll, Bill Jouris, John Laprise, Susannah Gray, Leah Symekher, Evan Leibovitch, and on audio only, we have Robert Jacobi.

From staff, we have Silvia Vivanco, Heidi Ullrich, and myself, Andrea Glandon on call management. I would like to remind everyone to please state your name before speaking for transcription purposes and to please mute your phones and microphones when not speaking to avoid any background noise. Thank you, and over to you, Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you so much, Andrea. Good morning, good afternoon, and I don't know if we have people in good night, but in any case, welcome to the call, today is 12th of November.

Today, we have quite a packed agenda, and I just want to start by asking anyone if they have any questions to the agenda or if we accept the agenda the way it is. [Please say so now.]

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

ANDREA GLANDON: Eduardo, if you can wait for just one moment, our AC connection disconnected so I'm reconnecting that now.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. Just let me know when I start.

ANDREA GLANDON: Yes. Absolutely, I will. Thank you so much. Okay, Eduardo, you can go forward. It's reconnected now, thank you so much.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. Thank you so much. Should I start again, or can I go ahead and continue?

ANDREA GLANDON: You can continue. Yeah, you can continue.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. So if I don't hear anything from anyone, then the agenda is accepted as it is. So I just wanted to give [introductory] remarks about today's meeting, and one of the first things that I want to talk about is about ICANN 63, Barcelona. Even though Chris is going to give us a little brief readout of what is happening – what happened, sorry, in Barcelona, I just wanted to give you my impressions of what happened there, and I will say that most of what I heard happened, maybe

---

because I was very interested in the topic, was the expedited PDP process for this group from the Generic Name Service Organization, the GNSO, which [inaudible] Barcelona, they're supposed to have an initial report, and they were not able to get consensus on getting one. So it was as very interesting thing to hear about through the whole Barcelona meeting.

Also, I want to tell you that the place [where this was] ran, it was as very good place. Rooms were very close to each other, so it was easy to move from one room to the next. [inaudible] and I think it was well-run, [the breaks] were very good, and it was close to all kinds of shopping malls and metro stations and things like that. So I think that this was a very successful meeting, and we will hear more about it a little bit later.

And also, I just want to mention that ISOC New York is having a readout on ICANN 63. The readout is basically a read of what happened in Barcelona, which we want to hear during this meeting today, but very briefly. But if you want to participate in that readout, please, the ISOC New York structure is going to have one today in about two hours and a half from now.

So if [any of you,] Greg, if you're around, please. If you have the link, if this is going to be online, if you can put the link in the Adobe, it will be appreciated so [people] can pick it up from there.

Marita Moll is having one readout in Canada, the 28th of November at 19:30 UTC, and she doesn't have the link for that one yet, so she will be sending that to the list. So if you cannot catch today's readout, you can

---

try to [get in] the 28 of November. Any questions? Susannah, please.  
You have the floor, Susannah.

SUSANNAH GRAY: Hi, Eduardo. The San Francisco Bay Area ISOC chapter is also having a readout on November the 29th. That would be around [12:00] PST. So I'll send out a link to that as well, and everybody's welcome to join. We don't have a link yet.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm sorry, I didn't get the UTC. What time?

SUSANNAH GRAY: 12:00. No, sorry, not UTC, PST. 12:00 PST.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm sorry. It's 12:00 UTC, or something else? I don't get that.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: 12:00 PST. West coast time, 12:00.

EDUARDO DIAZ: That's [17:00].

---

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes, so it's like – yeah, I'll send out the dates and the times to everybody, and yeah, so everybody will get that on e-mail.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. So there you have – you have three opportunities to hear what happened in Barcelona in depth, opportunities to hear if you were not able to participate. So a little bit an update on the ATLAS III. For those of you that do not know what an ATLAS is, it's an At-Large summit that is going to happen in Montreal next year in 2019, and there will be about 60 At-Large structures and individuals that will be selected to go there. That means it will be funded to go there. And the total amount of people that will be participating will be about 80 to 90, because there are about 25-30 that are funded to go there right now, so 30+60 is about 90.

We had a meeting during Barcelona about the ATLAS III, and basically, the timeline is going to run that [inaudible] November, there's going to be a call to volunteers to help in the coordination of putting together this meeting. Working in these groups that we have been setting. That doesn't mean that you're going to be funded to go there, but your time and knowledge will be appreciated in this coordination. So anyone that has the time to help, please do so when the call comes out.

The room logistics for Montreal, I believe, are very well set, even though we don't have the [inaudible] yet, but the rooms are there. And there will be some guidelines of how the people will be able to apply for the ATLAS III, and there will be quite specific requirements that you have to meet in order to go there. The final list of people will need to be ready

---

by June of 2019, so all the appropriate travel coordinations and hotels have to be done by the time we get to Montreal in October I believe this is going to be.

So today, we have an individual member from the U.S., he's called Robert Jacobi, and he's going to be introducing himself with Joey Doyle. I don't see him here, but anyhow, we will hear about him later on. So [inaudible] if they have a question, you can [inaudible] who Robert is. And we welcome him into our membership.

And also, I have included a new discussion [from] the American graduate student ALS that is managed by David Morar and Anna Loup. Last time, they mentioned they were doing some outreach towards university students, and I just want to follow up on that discussion to see what things they are doing and what we can learn from that. So other than that, that's only my introductory remarks for today's meetings, so does anyone have a question or comments about this?

Okay, so the next item in the agenda is one that has been around for a while, and this is a report that we're waiting for William Cunningham to report on his ARIN 41 application as part of the FY18 trips. I don't see William around, so we're going to the next item.

So Joey, I don't see Joey Doyle today. I want him to introduce last time, he said he's going to be here in this call. So in any case, I know Robert joined the telephone, so the floor is you. Please introduce yourself to the community.

---

ROBERT JACOBI: Thank you so much, Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

ROBERT JACOBI: This is Robert Jacobi. I was at ICANN 53 in Barcelona on behalf of a private company, Perfect Dashboard, but my open source and sort of evangelizing and Internet history goes much further back. I am the former president of Open Source Matters which is the holding company for Joomla, the second largest open source content management system out there. I also sit as the chair for the Internet Infrastructure Coalition for Technical Outreach and continue to contribute to Joomla and I2 Coalition, and was looking to expand opportunities to evangelize and help understand and get the word out about what ICANN does with people all around [inaudible] North America group and help bring that information back to ICANN as [inaudible] works.

Excuse me. I'm based out of Chicago and it's gotten very cold in the last few days, so we're all trying to recover from the temperature change. Additionally on the career side, I'm the executive vice president for a company called Perfect Dashboard, and I think I'll keep it nice and short and sweet unless anyone has any questions.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Robert, we were in Barcelona too, I didn't know that you became a member of NARALO [up to -] after Barcelona. So I missed the chance to meet you personally. Are you planning on being in Kobe?

---

ROBERT JACOBI: Not sure yet. That's still a year away, but – no, not a year. Kobe's in three months, correct? Or four months?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes. Yes, that's going to be in June, July. I don't know exactly the –

ROBERT JACOBI: Yeah, I don't remember the date off the top of my head either.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Eduardo –

ROBERT JACOBI: At the latest, in Montreal –

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Sorry to interrupt. Yeah, Kobe is going to be March 9 through 14th while Marrakech will be the end of June, just so you know.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm sorry, I always mix them up. Yes. It's in March of 2019, Robert.



---

ROBERT JACOBI: Yes. I'm not sure about that yet. I'll certainly get the latest at Montreal for the next AGM.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

ROBERT JACOBI: And – I had a train of thought and I did lose it. I did speak to Alfredo Calderon at ICANN 63. I attended, I think, the first session of the ALS – I'm getting all my acronyms – not yet fully – At-Large committees I think, I was in the first session on Saturday.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

ROBERT JACOBI: [That's how I started out.]

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yeah, Alfredo is a very good friend of mine. Anyhow, if you plan to participate in one of the second meeting, let us know so we can have a chance to talk.

ROBERT JACOBI: Absolutely.

EDUARDO DIAZ: So welcome to the community.

ROBERT JACOBI: Thank you very much. I'm very excited to be part of it.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. So, anybody have a question for Robert? No? Okay, if not, then let's move to the next item in the agenda. By the way, Andrea, Glenn sent an apology. He's actually now in the IGF happening in Paris which has started yesterday, and he said he wasn't going to be able to be in this call. So please make sure his apology is recorded. So I'm trying to do the best with the outreach groups [which still report. This is a report] that is done by Glenn.

Basically, I don't know if all of you know that there is – the big IGF is happening in Paris, happening now, just started yesterday, and ALAC and ICANN has a booth there in place to do some outreach, and I believe Glenn had been very active in getting people to work in the booth. So on our next call, let's see how effective that booth was and what kind of results we got from that. So there are a few people from ALAC and NARALO and other RALOs in the IGF. So I think it ends sometime this week.

So just to remind everyone, we have three events or three trips that have been approved for CROP. These are trips that we go to these events, we identify them as being part of what we want to do in our strategic plan for outreach, and we have found that these events are

---

effective in outreaching to people in North America that are more willing to participate in the ICANN work.

So we have three trips now, on the NTC19 which is going to happen in Oregon, 13-15 of March. I have put the deadlines in the agenda, December the 20th is the deadline to apply for the NTC19. And we missed one event at the beginning of this year with ARIN 42 in Vancouver, and we just [felt] the deadline was too close and we couldn't – you know, the paperwork was put in too late so we couldn't get there. So be sure that if you're interested in participating in these events, please apply for it at the dates that I've shown here.

There is a Digital Inclusion that is going to happen in Charlotte, North Carolina, April 1 through 3, and the deadline for that one is January 10, 2019. And ARIN 43 which is going to happen in Bridgetown, Barbados from 7 to 10 April, 2019. Again, the deadline for those two are in January 10. So anybody interested in participating and helping doing some outreach at this event, please do it. Thank you. Oops, my computer just went back. [Hold on a sec.] Any questions about this?

Okay, so the next item in the agenda is academic credits. This is a work that Chris from the Global Engagement in North America is doing, and basically, what the efforts being done here is to see if we can get some university students to participate in the policy development process in ICANN and get credits for it. I don't see Joe or Chris in the call, so – or Yubelkys, so if they get in the call, then we'll be able to get an update on this. So moving on to the next one –

---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Eduardo –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [Both are present.]

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Eduardo, this is [inaudible], Chris and Joe are both on the call. They're both on the call.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Oh, I'm sorry, just I'm looking at the Adobe list right there, [and the phone call.] I'm sorry.

CHRIS MONDINI: Hi.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Chris, [inaudible]

CHRIS MONDINI: Do you want me to chime in?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, please. I was looking at the wrong place in the list. I didn't see you or Joe. So please, if you can tell something about the academic credits, that would be great. I'm sorry, it was my [inaudible].

---

CHRIS MONDINI: No worries.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

CHRIS MONDINI: In fact, there has not been much progress since the last call. As you recall from Joe's update on the last call, we believe we have tapped into academic institutions who are willing to lend us students that could earn credits for participation in ICANN, and then internally, our next step is that we're talking with our policy development support team, and also people that run reviews, and we're asking them if we get these students for a six-month period or a nine-month period or a 12-month period, what is the way that we could deploy them to further ICANN's work? And that also involves some complication with the various people who run working groups and so forth.

So we're on the agenda for the policy team to hear that part of the puzzle, and when we come back, we'll have much more to report in terms of how we can try to structure programs, hopefully in time for the next academic year that starts after next summer. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Chris. Any questions, John, Chris? You have the floor.

---

JOHN LAPRISE:

Thank you. Chris, one question. Is this geared more towards undergrads or grad students? Because I'm thinking about this in an academic sense, I'm putting on my professor hat, but I'm looking at how credit is actually granted. In some senses, I can see an internship, but the people that were actually – if they're undergrads, it's unlikely that they're actually going to stick around with ICANN, knowing what I know about internships.

At the grad level, it's a different question, that they're probably already either doing research or deeply involved in Internet governance or policy on some level. So, could you speak a little bit about how the targeting is and what is the idea here? How does experience at ICANN map to academic credit? Thank you.

CHRIS MONDINI:

Thank you, John. We are targeting both undergraduates and graduates and looking at, for example, seniors who might have an independent course of study or have more freedom in determining how they spend the semester academic year on projects. And as you say, graduate students who might be able to use the experience to directly inform the research that they're doing.

We're looking at everything from computer science departments to governance and global international relations departments, and we're actually officially focused on [inaudible] that offer joint technology and policy programs. So I think the sweet spot, in answer to your question, is grad students who are doing technology and global policy courses, but we will take whoever we can get if they're qualified. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ: John, do you want to reply to that, or you have any other follow-up question? [You okay?]

JOHN LAPRISE: Yes. So, I guess what I would comment on is that with respect to recruiting grad students, the issue at the graduate level often is not organizing schools by program but by sponsoring [faculty,] the people [who they're] studying with. So rather than looking at graduate programs, it might be more advantageous to actually look at, well, faculty, because they're much more likely to be both interested and willing to plug and help make the connections to get graduate students involved in those programs, in research, and perhaps in areas that we're not even looking at. So looking at faculty that are involved in research related to ICANN or in international organizational governance is probably a stronger way to go than by searching [inaudible] programs. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, John. David, you have the floor. David, you may be muted, because we cannot hear you.

DAVID MORAR: Can you hear me?

---

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, now we can hear you.

DAVID MORAR: Yes, thank you so much. What I would say to John's comment is that while that makes sense to get more people involved, the issue, I think, that Chris pointed out is that if there is a technology policy program or at least a technology policy track, it's easier to talk to the administration for credits [inaudible]

EDUARDO DIAZ: We lost you, David. Oops. Cannot – David?

DAVID MORAR: Sorry.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay, go ahead. Yes, we can hear you now.

DAVID MORAR: My phone just decided to exit out.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

DAVID MORAR: Tell me now if you can hear me. Hello?



---

EDUARDO DIAZ: We can hear you. Yes, we can hear you.

DAVID MORAR: Hello?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Hello. We can hear you. I don't know if you can.

DAVID MORAR: Okay, perfect. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: David –

DAVID MORAR: So basically, if there is a

ANDREA GLANDON: Hi, David. Yeah, we lost you again, David.

DAVID MORAR: So basically, if there's a professor that has some students, that'd be great for us to grab them, but if we're still looking for credits, I think it'd be important to go through the administration and to do it in a way that

---

pushes for a program or track to have as part of its official thing the credits. That's what I would say.

I mean, I think it'd be great to find professors and get new students through that, but if we're looking for credits, then maybe that would be a good option. Sorry about the disconnect, my phone just decides to sort of exit out of applications from time to time.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you –

HEIDI ULLRICH: Eduardo, if I may.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, go ahead.

HEIDI ULLRICH: So putting on my academic hat, one possibility, and particularly in the U.S., which is [inaudible], would be to have the professor have a case study on an ICANN policy issue –

DAVID MORAR: Hello? Yeah, I see John has commented saying that at the grad level, credits are irrelevant. Yes, the issue is that [inaudible] there wouldn't be something at the institutional level, it would just be like MoUs with the professors, and that's not much there. I think that the conversation was

---

around doing something institutionally between the schools and sort of NARALO or the schools and ICANN, because if not, then we don't have to look for credit in that way, we can just sort of do ad hoc conversations, ad hoc relationships with professors. But that's just me. Sorry, I don't want to take over the whole meeting.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. Thank you. Heidi, [do you want to finish?]

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah. So Eduardo, yeah, so one possibility would be to have a case study in a course, and then a grad student, who's often the teacher's assistant [to lead the classes,] so the undergrad, could then work with on the case study with these undergrads. And that might be a significant part of their grade. So just a possibility there that you can combine grad and undergrad students here. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Heidi. George, please.

---

GEORGE KIRIKOS: Yeah, I just want to echo that there are independent study programs for undergraduate students as well as graduate students, so doesn't necessarily have to be graduate students only. And also, ICANN did announce their open data initiative several months ago, so perhaps the credit could be kind of tied into that program, because that would obviously allow for various research or studies from students, either analyzing that data, or perhaps even better, creating some of that open data for other researchers. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, George. Chris, you want to follow up on this [inaudible]?

CHRIS MONDINI: Those are all good and helpful suggestions and we will follow up on all of them.

EDUARDO DIAZ: So thank you so much for everybody's input. The next item is, David, I hope we can hear you now. Last time, you mentioned that your ALS is planning to do some outreach to university students, so I just open the discussion to follow up on that and so you're able to report your efforts that way. Do you want to mention something about it as of today? David, we see that you're connected but we cannot hear you.

DAVID MORAR: Hello, can you hear me?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, now we can hear you.

DAVID MORAR: You can hear me? Hello?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes.

DAVID MORAR: You can hear me? Thank you. Sorry about that. Sorry about the technical difficulties. So just to quickly wrap up, I don't know what you heard from my last thing, it's just that what I wanted to say is that I think if we're trying to do something institutionally, I think it's important to connect to the admin. If we're just doing sort of professor by professor in like an ad hoc fashion, then that's great, but I think that's not necessarily – I don't know if that's like a long-term sort of play.

But – so for our ALS, I know that my colleague, Anna Loup, has had a successful outreach meeting at USC. Unfortunately, I haven't been able to connect with her to give me the details. All I know is that it was successful. I'm not sure what the metrics for that are, but we're definitely doing that. I have been in contact with the Goldman School, with the careers person at eh Goldman School at Princeton to see if we can sort of have an informal conversation there with some of the students that are on the unofficial technology policy track, because Goldman, I've been told, doesn't have any official tracks.

---

And I've been talking with my alma mater, George Mason, from which I've just graduated, to see if there's any way that we could have sort of a pipeline into our ALS and then into NARALO and broader ICANN space, because I've gotten at least two or three questions about what ICANN is after people that have come to my dissertation defense and said that they were interested in participating, they were surprised by the fact that it's open and that it's a process that isn't sort of tied to just companies and big names.

So that's the update. As soon as I get more information from Anna, I will send it in an e-mail to the group. And hopefully by December, we'll have at least a few more members if not actually people involved in NARALO, and hopefully, people that will want to be part, remotely, of the next ICANN. So that's my little update. So thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, David. Do you want [inaudible]?

DAVID MORAR: Any questions?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Any questions for David? David, do you want to keep the discussion open so you can have a slot in the agenda to report on your results? Want to keep this going forward?

---

DAVID MORAR:

Yes, that would be perfect. Thank you very much.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Okay. Thank you so much. So, I guess Chris, if you can give us a brief readout of the highlights of ICANN 63. I'm pretty sure you're going to be very [busy] today because you're going to be doing this, I guess, during the New York ALS readout. But this is just a brief thing. So, you have the floor.

CHRIS MONDINI:

Yeah, hi. If you can hear me. And I just wanted to say thank you for the opportunity to be with you today. All of you on the call really are qualified to produce the readout. I wanted to [inaudible] many partners we have on the call having done a number of readouts for example in in New York with Greg and also in Canada and on the west coast, and in each of those cases, the objective was to try to create a sense or feeling of local community among ICANN followers or people who would be interested in [following] the many ICANN issues that are covered at the meeting without seeming like they have tremendous pressure to try to attend an ICANN public meeting. So really, before diving into the topic, I really wanted to encourage anyone here on call and across the North America community that if you can gather a group [and certainly if that's a group you gather in a room] or if you're the North American graduate students At-Large structure, you can gather them remotely and virtually, remember the ICANN Org team, if you want our help, we'd be delighted to help with such things as setting up an Adobe room or

---

helping compile slides, helping you structure how you invite and register the guests and so forth.

In most of the cases, the At-Large structures seem to have a pretty good infrastructure and really have their own ongoing programming already, but that's not to say that you can't give it a try and start by trying to gather interested parties in your local community, and we'd even be delighted to speak with you about how you target who you'd like to invite.

The other thing is I've noted – and certainly, if Marita or Susannah or Greg want to chime in, as you do a few of these, if you [inaudible] last four ICANN meetings, you begin to actually get a sense that there's at least a handful, if not a dozen or so, regular followers of the ICANN issues that welcome the opportunity in a small group setting, in an unstructured setting, in a not recorded without every word you say going up on a screen as you talk setting, to learn [of the] issues and the ask clarifying questions in a small group setting.

And we found some that have said, "Oh, yes, I should become more involved." Which is great, and we welcome that, but the value of the readouts [is to even] stop short of that, it's really to build followers, [to] listen to community and to bring engagement to people where they sit. So, appropriating the topics is really one thing that we didn't do for this particular call, but I will dive right in. But let me just pause there just to see if anybody has any comment or questions before I spend about ten minutes on the slides.



I don't see any hands in the room. We will put the slides [inaudible] on the Wiki, and this is an abridged version of the New York show that we're putting on in a couple of hours. So we're going to start out by explaining that ICANN 63 in Barcelona, which was held last month, was the annual general meeting.

As you all know, we have these public meetings in a different part of the world every year. Some of them are called community forums which are policy [workshops] and outreach, some of them are policy forums which are really focused purely on the policy work, and this one's the annual general meeting where the board of directors and the leadership of the supporting organizations and advisory committees and all of the annual governance activities take place. It's a pretty long meeting.

So when we do the readout, we pick some headline developments. We can't be exhaustive, although for those of you in At-Large, I would encourage you to think with an open ear towards what is most interesting towards the users, the user community, and I'll talk about some of the things that I think might be interesting to users later in the presentation.

One very interesting and enjoyable factor of the ICANN 63 meeting in Barcelona was that ICANN celebrated its 20th anniversary. There was an external blogger circle ID, which many of you follow, which curated and hosted blogs from your community, but [inaudible] many others that were there at the beginning of the founding days of ICANN.

And for those of you that are newer to ICANN and would be very interested to hear or read about some of the origins of the organization

---

---

that explains really kind of the culture and practices, there is an ICANN history project, and there are these blogs which I would encourage you to peruse.

That was also very nice too, because ICANN doesn't often pause to reflect in that manner. I find that ICANN is usually very much buried under voluminous work or reacting to some issue or topic or [inaudible], so [it's good] to take a break and recognize some of the pioneers and learn about how far we've come.

The meeting itself was one of our largest. It didn't break our records for the largest. The initial registrations looked like they would be well north of 3000 people. At the end of the day, 2360 people approximately did show up at the venue. There were over 300 sessions. The ICANN [app,] we're always curious to get feedback from the ICANN [app.] We had 23,000 users visiting the ICANN [app.] We had a robust fellows and NextGen class, and since it's the annual general meeting, we did recognize our community leaders.

So, dividing into broad categories on the domain name front, we spend a lot of time looking at subsequent procedures. Now, subsequent procedures, as I explain in the readout for those that are newer to ICANN, refers to the issue of how to continue extending the general top-level domain space and under what circumstances additional generic top-level domains should be made available.

And one of the most interesting topics, again even for the layperson that hasn't spent much time at ICANN, relates to geographic names. Many people have heard about the various disputes and contention sets

that arose. We learned that some geographic names are also proper nouns and vice versa, and we are familiar with the discussion and difficulties over Amazon as a domain name.

So the working group that's working on how to revisit how gTLDs can continue to be expanded has focused very closely on geographic names, and they worked very hard to keep governments and all the stakeholders updated on this.

And they have come up with [initial] report and a supplemental [official] report and open for public comment. If it's a topic that you're particularly interested in, [these are] links on the slides [inaudible] where you can find the transcripts and start to become involved in the issue.

Auction proceeds. I think a number of your community have been involved in auction proceeds, and I think I'm [inaudible] I apologize. Again, this relates to the expansion of the generic top-level domains, and as many of you are aware, more than one applicant applied towards the same name in a number of cases. And those cases have worked through steps to take to resolve the contention.

There are many structured steps that were outlined by the community when they formulated the generic top-level domain name program, but some disputes, contention sets don't become resolved and must go to an auction. And so the auction proceeds that have resulted from some of this head to head competition totaled 233 million U.S. dollars. A big chunk of that was from the auction for dot-web, but also dot-app and [dot-shop] were all in the tens of millions of dollars.

---

And according to the community and what they outlined in the generic top-level domain program applicant guidebook, those funds are held in a bank in escrow until the community can decide both the mechanism by which they can deploy them for the benefit of the internet and the internet community, but in accordance with ICANN's remit and mission.

So this has been going on for about, I believe, 18 months now that the working group has been working to find out what the various mechanisms could be used, ranging from the formation of foundations or new mechanisms by which to somehow preserve the stewardship and the independence, [separateness] of the funds [inaudible] have them benefit the Internet in the way that they were envisioned to benefit and to update the community all along the way.

The [inaudible] recommendations published in the initial report and there's a public comment forum. And again, I think this is one where members of the community are actively involved in updating you on a regular basis. So it would be interesting to consider how your input [inaudible] need to go forward. There's still a lot of work to go forward and a lot of work to be done, and there's the links here to the transcripts if you want to feel like you were there.

The board, there was often an issue that arose, which is that the board's review of stewardship of the fiduciary review of ICANN financial health and reserve fund, and there was a discussion over using a portion of these auction proceeds to replenish those reserve funds, which was the topic of a discussion in Barcelona.

---

The other topic that's been really the focus of – for the last few ICANN meetings and has been taking up a tremendous amount of time among [inaudible] the ICANN community relates to the European Union General Data Protection Regulation, the GDPR. And I think most of you are familiar with this room, [inaudible] European data subjects and seeks to give them more control, more rights, more insights into how their data is handled. And it's really written in such a way with [prescriptions] that influence how organizations can [achieve correct] process and [inform the consent] for European data subjects.

If you're familiar with the system [inaudible] known as WHOIS where domain name registrars maintain and make available contact information [to] people who register domain names, you will recognize that the GDPR [inaudible] conflicts with the European GDPR, and the ICANN board adopted what's called a temporary specification for the contracts by which they ask registrars to maintain this data, and that was really done as an urgent measure so that these companies, registrars and registries, could remain in compliance with the European law.

Now, a temporary specification in the ICANN bylaws requires that the community – because these things are meant to come from the community, and in this case it came from the board of directors, and it's [inaudible] only if the community, within one year, can reach consensus on whether to approve and accept and ratify this specification. And there's an expedited policy development process known as the EPD, and this team met repeatedly throughout ICANN 63. [inaudible] there was a high interest topic, and they're really wrestling with, at a very high level, how to deal with the processing of data, for example of natural persons

or legal persons, how to have geographic harmony of the policy, and really also around an envisioned future access model because they collected all of the various use cases, the data is used by a very wide variety of communities and interests. These are all under discussion.

They had hoped to have initial [report ready] [inaudible] but it's not coming up very shortly, someone, Greg or others on the call will know that they did make some progress in Barcelona and they are going to come out with their initial report, which will be open for public comment shortly.

One other topic of note which I think is of interest to people attending Barcelona from the point of view of the multi-stakeholder model and ICANN legitimacy is that a high-level government meeting was held. This is only an intermittent event where the Government Advisory Committee at ICANN is really invited to raise the level of their delegation to the ministerial level, so the highest lever or the highest level that has interest in Internet and ICANN infrastructure and DNS topics.

The kingdom of Spain was the host for this. [In fact,] they issued the invitation and they were the ones who turned into a high-level government meeting, and the meeting really surpassed the expectations of [the governments] who were working to organize, because we went from thinking of 80 delegations attend to having over 120 delegations attending.

We had [a number at the ministerial,] secretary level, and they were really put through a series of presentations and panels but also very

---

constructive discussions that sensitized them to the ICANN issues and their role in really helping to review them in light of their public policy implications and interest.

So they looked at how governments operate within ICANN, they looked at things like cybercrime and domain name abuse and data protection and privacy laws, and they really have a case study on things like how WHOIS works and how laws can affect that, and really just the global digital agenda, how Internet policies that [inaudible] ICANN [inaudible] relate to their digital economies and their success and their digital strategies.

And the governments are able to express their hopes, interests, and in some cases frustrations [in] how to navigate ICANN, the lack of similar fora for other issues that are outside of ICANN's remit, and they're really looking for answers on behalf of [inaudible] that have concerns about digital, social, political development.

Let's see what we have. I think the missing slide here might be about the Kobe meeting, but before I get to that, I just also wanted to talk about a few of the to her really domain name-related activities in Barcelona. I apologize, I don't have a slide for this. But some of them really relate to the user community and the user community around the world [inaudible] North America.

Work on internationalized domain names really took a leap forward. These are the domain names in different alphabets and scripts, so Chinese, Korean, Latin, Myanmar, Brahmi, Sinhala and others were presenting their work in Barcelona, and they also worked on the vexing

---

---

issue of IDN variants, which means when you have more than one way to write a domain name.

And there are really dedicated people working on this very crucial aspect of how to connect and expand the Internet, and they did a lot in Barcelona. And I know it's a topic of passion to a number of you in the At-Large community.

Also, the universal acceptance steering group which [takes some of these] domain names and also the longer domain names to make sure that apps and software and others continue to accept them, and this is something – they met with a number of stakeholder in Barcelona, and we're all helping them to get the word out about universal access. I think there's a role also for the At-Large community.

And then other things related to the evolution and future of WHOIS. Also, it might have [inaudible] policy development, EPDP, but the registration data access protocol, which is meant to be the successor for WHOIS, is moving closer to completion. And privacy and proxy services where people are able to remain private and register domain names is in an implementation stage, and that's also affected.

And then finally, I'll just end, I don't know the [inaudible] it but there was a session called what issues and challenges are registrants having managing their domain names, and they really learned a lot about what users and people who registered domain names are facing in terms of understanding [how to manage them,] resolve issues and work on ICANN, navigate ICANN, navigate relationships with registrars and registries.



---

And I also think that that's an area that's [inaudible] champion, and perhaps some of you or even some of your newer members would like to take a listen to the transcript of that session and see the synergies between the At-Large community and registrant concerns, because I think you would get a lot of mileage on helping to promote some of that.

So I'm going to conclude. As you can see, it's sort of an ad hoc selection of issues. I tried to cover them in a very sort of cocktail party level of detail, so apologies for those of you that follow them very intensively in a detailed way, but again, the idea is to keep it high level and maintain the interest of the people that are participating in the readout. So I see Marita's note about the registrant issue session, and I will pass that along. But if there are other questions, I think we have five minutes unless Eduardo had other business that he wanted to turn to.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you. Eduardo, are you muted?

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I'm sorry. Yes, I was talking to myself. Thank you, Chris. Are there any questions for Chris? If something comes to your mind, there is always e-mail, and you can contact Chris and ask the question offline. So just remember that. And Chris, thank you so much for your time. And if any of you want to see more details of what will happen in ICANN 63, I invite you to participate in about an hour and a half on the readout that New York ISOC is doing.

---

So, we have about four minutes to end the call, but one thing I want to do is I want to hear from Alan to give us a very brief update on what is happening in the [inaudible] since Barcelona. And if he can give us a perspective [of what these things going to happen and] going forward. You know, in two, three minutes. Alan, can you do that?

ALAN GREENBERG: I can try.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: What's happening is we are preparing a draft report. It should be out imminently. There has been much discussion on – we're looking at very technical things, of exactly what are the legal rationales under the GDPR, the Global Data Protection Regulations, that data can be collected ,can be used, can be processed. So it requires not so much a look at how the data was used before but under what conditions can it be used now, can it be collected, and the legal rationale.

And there's a lot of intricacies which make it rather difficult. On top of that, there are very strong emotions and business reasons why people would like to see one result or another. For instance, the contracted parties obviously have a very strong incentive to reduce their liability and therefore not do anything, which might cause them to be fined or otherwise penalized. They also have to implement anything that we

---

decide, and therefore, there are costs to do that, and they for – again – obviously reasons have an interest in minimizing those costs.

The Noncommercial Stakeholder Group has a very strong interest in ensuring and maximizing privacy. Governments, and to a large extent At-Large, although we vary a little bit, have a very strong interest in trying to protect users. And right now, although users do not use WHOIS directly very much, certainly not on a global scale, they rely very heavily on the services that create reputations that we browsers use to determine whether a site is safe to limit the amount of spam you see, and those various activities require the use of WHOIS or at least use WHOIS.

So minimizing malware, minimizing phishing are all activities that benefit from the availability of WHOIS. So we have a strong interest in trying to make sure that the people who are working to protect users are not going to be severely inhibited or severely impacted by the lack of WHOIS, and there's strong evidence that the current temporary specification, which is severely limited access to WHOIS, is having an effect.

Now, we obviously cannot change GDPR, we have to be compliant with it, and the question is how, to what extent, can we do that and make sure that those who need access to data can get it. So there are a lot of competing interests, there's not a lot of interest in compromise, and yet we have a looming deadline ahead of us that most of us feel is important to meet. So we are flogging away at it. it's difficult, and I'm not making predictions right now about how successful we're going to be.

---

The world, if we are not successful, doesn't fall apart immediately, but what it does mean is post-May 2019, there will be no more requirement that registrars and registries do that we have told them to do for this last – for the year from May '18 to May '19, and therefore some of them may choose to do something different, and that puts us in a very awkward position because we have no uniform policy governing WHOIS.

So that's where we sit right now. There is a lot of work going on. It's about the most intensive activity I've ever participated in within ICANN. And it's unfolding and we'll see where it goes. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Okay. Thank you, Alan, for the update, and we just passed one minute from the meeting. Javier, you have your hand up. You have like a minute to ask or [inaudible].

JAVIER RUA-JOVET:

Yes, just quickly [inaudible] I've just put in the chat to inform Work Track 5 members that we're slated for publishing our initial report by November 20th. We have our last call before publishing that on November 14th [inaudible]. So be aware to – I mean there's going to be an e-mail by staff reminding everybody, but just be aware of this, and so let's [have you] on our last call before we put the initial report out. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Javier, how many pages is the report?

JAVIER RUA-JOVET: 1.3 million.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. Well, with that in mind, I want to thank everyone for participating in today's meeting. Chris, thank you so much for your time and providing us with a very brief readout. Very well done, thank you so much. And with this in mind, we are adjourning our meeting today. Thank you so much.

ANDREA GLANDON: Thank you. This concludes [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you. Bye, everyone.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you.

ANDREA GLANDON: Please remember to disconnect all lines and have a wonderful rest of your day.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**

---