

---

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Go ahead, please.

SUSIE JOHNSON: Good afternoon, all. Welcome to the LACRALO ccTLD Working Group call this Tuesday, April 15 at 22:00 UTC.

In attendance are Sergio Salinas Porto, Aida Noblia, Aislan Basilio, Johnny Laureano. For staff are Silvia Vivanco, Gisella Gruber, and Susie Johnson. We have apologies Dev Anand Teelucksingh. And the interpreters are Veronica and Sabrina.

Please, state your name before speaking, not only for transcript purposes but also to allow the interpreters to identify you on the other language channel. Also, please speak at a reasonable speed to allow for accurate interpretation.

Thank you. Over to you, Sergio.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Susie. As I said before, this is the LACRALO ccTLD Working Group meeting. I am honored to be here with you. We have some topics to deal with today and some issues that we need to solve according to the decisions made in our last meeting.

Particularly, I would like to start this call with the agenda. We have already done the roll call. Now we have the action items. The action items are the ones that we had from our previous meeting.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

We do not have here today with us Dev Anand Teelucksingh for him to accept the position of vice president for the ccTLD Working Group. Let's hope that in next meeting he will be with us because this was the third topic on our agenda.

On the other hand, we had defined in our previous meeting the objective of this working group. Within that framework, we have already decided to have, if you remember, certain action items. Within those action items, we have two different set of actions or two subgroups. Today, we should have the first result of the first work of that subgroup, so we will see if we can have a report from them.

There was an inconvenience due to a misunderstanding in the previous meeting regarding the topic that some of the members were focusing on. I say this because I don't see Jacqueline Morris. I think she's not on the call today. But if Jacqueline is with us, it would be good for her to let me know. Jacqueline, are you on the call? Silvia, I don't know if Jacqueline is on our call.

SILVIA VIVANCO: No, she's not on the call, Sergio. Unfortunately, she's not on the call.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. Thank you very much, Silvia. Jacqueline sent an e-mail after the two subgroups were formed. In that e-mail, she said that she didn't want to participate, and we understood that she did want to participate.

---

So there is a proposal to review this item again to start again from scratch. That is to say, to see if we need to open two sub working groups or only one. And if we're going to create one, we can have a second option. The second option should be creating a second sub working group to make the follow up of the different activities.

Based on that, I'm going to open the floor for you to tell me what you think about this. So I open the floor, as I said, for you to provide input and feedback on this regard. You are free to speak. Aida, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

AIDA NOBLIA: Can you hear me?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, we hear you, Aida.

AIDA NOBLIA: Well, I was trying to communicate to Jacqueline, but she had some working problem, so she didn't have any communication or any connection. So she sent an e-mail to me, and I was surprised at the topic we had been assigned because in the meeting I thought we had limited ourselves only to the ccNSO. And there was a kind of confusion among ourselves regarding the topic to deal with.

And then we had Jacqueline's point of view where she said that she wanted to work in the other group. I think it is a very good idea by Sergio since we are few people to create only one group and define

---

exactly the objective of the group that we had with Jacqueline. Because I believe that there are certain topics, for example the topic or the issue related to documentation, well, that goes further beyond just having only one source of information, so we need different sources of information.

For example, in the Singapore meeting, we dealt with some of this information, but many meetings were closed meetings. There was only one open meeting, in fact, if I'm not wrong, and that was our starting point.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Aida. Aislan, would you like to make any comment? Is Aislan connected to the call?

SILVIA VIVANCO: I see him on the AC room, and he's typing.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Oh, he has no audio. Okay. Is there any other one who would like to make a comment? So the proposal is I think that we all agree in having a map or in mapping ccTLDs in the region. I think as a first step we should have a clear understanding of our region. This map means to...

Sorry, could you please dial out to Aislan because he has dropped.

Having a map does not mean to include or to write the ccTLD or the name of the ccTLD on the map for each country. This should be a

---

situational map according or regarding each ccTLD. That is to say, we need to see some status or the state in which these ccTLDs are.

For example, I remember that I was in Puerto Rico, and I remember being in that country and many citizens in Puerto Rico decided to write [almachin.pr.com] because the ccTLD was very expensive.

So along these lines, I think we should have a situational map to see the situation of the ccTLDs in our region. This would be the first step to take. That is to say, first of all, we need to know the subject matter of our activities. And that map could be very valuable for our region because we can also have a manual maintenance work so that we can keep on developing these type of topics.

So this would be the first step. And based on that, we can keep on working. I don't know if you have any other different point of view, but I believe this could be the first topic to discuss.

And the other thing that I would like to tell you is that the other step that we can take is to start reading and bringing information to debate, different issues being discussed on the ccNSO. As you know, the ccNSO has a website. I will post that information.

We can access that Web page and see the different activities and the different topics they're discussing. It would be very healthy for us to start dialing into this website to have a deep understanding of the different topics being discussed within ICANN. I have posted the link on the chat. This is part of our future work.

---

Do you have any comment up to now? Is there any comment that you would like to make?

Aislan, are you on the call already? He has dropped. Aida, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

AIDA NOBLIA:

Well, Sergio, I think that the two options are really interesting. This is what we have said before, this is a very important topic. What we did in our previous call was to concentrate this information, but sometimes we have the feeling that things are not defined. I understand that these two options are important.

I was reading some information, and I could see that there is plenty of material on that Web page. I saw a survey regarding conflicts with the ccTLDs. I think this is something interesting to mention. We have a long way to go in terms of documentation. We need to review all the documents and see the usefulness that they may have for ccTLDs as a whole and for Internet governance and also in relation to Internet security.

I think these are relevant issues, and I think it would be good to review it and to perhaps make a summary of the documents at least that we can find in relation to these topics, of course, taking into account the ICANN Web page because we know that there is plenty of information about this. I was reading some material, but I should make a summary.

This is my comment, Sergio.

---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Aida. I'm not used to, I mean, I don't know what is happening to me, but I forget to say my name whenever I start speaking.

Johnny, would you like to make any comment? I open the floor for questions and comments.

JOHNNY LAUREANO: I would like to fully agree with what Aida has said. It is important to have an assessment or make an evaluation regarding the evolution of the ccTLDs in last years. They're relevant in the development of Internet governance.

Even though it's true that we have two options, one is Internet governance and the other point would be security, it is important to start developing activities so that we can have a relationship with ccTLDs.

First of all, we need to map the different situations of ccTLDs in our region. And I think that I could volunteer to work on that topic. I am interested in that topic, as this is something fundamental for Internet governance. I would like to be included and to volunteer for that work.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Johnny. First of all, I would like to welcome you to the call because I was not able to connect at the very beginning. So welcome to the group, and welcome to our call. Thank you for your participation because this contributes to LACRALO's activities and work.

---

Actually, any support and input from Peru is more than welcome, and I know that you are very well able to lead these activities together with the rest of the group. This is something very good, and this will bring very good results for our region.

I will post a link where you can find the different activities for March 2014 for the ccNSO for us to start reading about these activities. These activities have to do with the work being carried out by this organization within ICANN.

But beyond this, I also propose to start working regarding the map. That is to say, to start creating a scheme or a schedule regarding our region and the ccTLDs.

For example, of the ccTLDs in each of the countries, the situation that the ccTLDs have in the different countries. For example, in Argentina, for many years/decades our domain names were free of charge. But since last month, they started to charge for that. So today our domain names should be paid, and not long ago they were free of charge.

This was part of a policy not only for .ar, but this has to do with digital inclusion for different social layers. But now, this has changed, and this is a new source for economic resources. This also changes the map, and this affects the country growth.

We have almost 4.5 million domain names in our country and, of course, this number will decrease in the next month because there was a lot of cyber-occupation by many companies who had domain names and then they sell these domain names because now the new domain names will be acquired with some other criteria.



---

We are paying about \$18 for a domain name, around \$20 approximately per domain name, and in the past there was no cost for that. So our map has changed, and we need to pay attention to this.

Johnny, I ask you this because you have mentioned that before. Would you like to be in charge? I mean, together with us, someone has to lead this activity. Would you like to lead this mapping activity, or would you like to be just a member?

JOHNNY LAUREANO: Yes, of course. I am willing to help. So I am willing to be part of the team and to start working or to make any assessment or survey. So I can be part of the team, if you will. And I can also contribute with some other information. Anyway, Sergio, whatever you like.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. We all need to start working on that. We should all be working on that. I see Humberto here on the call, so I would like to thank Humberto for his participation. And we have our new LACRALO secretary, and I would like to welcome him to the call.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: So I suggest that we take as a concrete action item the fact that we should all start working with a map. Aislan, do you agree with that? If

---

you cannot speak, please, just type your comment on the AC room so that it would be easier for us to see if you agree or not with us. And on the other hand, Aida, do you agree with this that we should start working on the map first?

AIDA NOBLIA:

Well, Sergio, I am willing to work in anything that is required. However, I don't have very clear on my mind which could be my input or what my contribution to this. That's why I was volunteering to work on the documentation side on the survey side because this is what I have been done.

I don't have the summary of the documentation that I have read but, of course, if we decide that we have to start with a map, the only thing I can say that I am willing to work but I don't have very clear on my mind what my contribution could be in this regard. But, of course, if you assign tasks to me, I will be willing and ready to do them.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Aida, the map is, in fact, first of all, we need to document the situation of each country regarding their ccTLDs. So this is a research work first. We'll have to speak with the different stakeholders of the ccTLDs, we need to collect information from the Web pages, and to have a first outlook and overview of the ccTLDs in our region.

That's what I mean by a map. I mean, we don't need a concrete or a real map. This is a document, in fact, where we are going to include in that document valuable information to know where we are.

---

For example, if .uy that was given to Uruguay, we need to see if this is handled or managed by the state, by a private institution, by a university, if the domain name is being charged, the amount of domain names for this ccTLD.

JOHNNY LAUREANO:

Sergio, I suggest this, for example, how they define policies regarding domain name management, for example. If the civil society participates in the policymaking process, for example, the relationship that they have with the state and the government and the civil society. I mean, I think that we can somehow determine the level of governance that they have on these Internet resources.

We know that domain names are a very important part of many countries. What I have seen at least from my country, for example, policies are being defined by only one person. So perhaps if we can take that into account, this may contribute to our map. We can also collect some suggestions and some other information, for example.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Aislan Vargas Basilio requesting the floor so, Aislan, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO:

Can you hear me?

---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, Aislan. Go ahead, please.

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO: First of all, I would like to greet you. And to greet Sergio because not long ago it was his birthday, so I would like to congratulate him on that personally because I was not able to speak to him again.

First of all, I would like to say regarding the topics we have been discussing, for example, first point or the first item which is related to the map. Well, the map for me is something very important. It is of vital importance.

Why? Because with a map, we could learn about the status of each of the ccTLDs in our region. And surely, we can have a document, and this document will be used as a source of [inaudible] and information for our region as well as for ICANN.

And we can also develop this map, but in order to develop this map, I believe that we need to establish other topics which are also important to take into account. For example, which type of information should we include? Names? These are some examples, Sergio, but we should include domain names, for example, how many domain names, who manages domain names.

So it would be very important to take that into account. That is to say, to take into account the most relevant information in this regard, especially regarding the content.

We also need to analyze the way in which we should divide our activities among the group. For example, who is going to be in charge of

---

surveying or collecting information? Who is going to participate in certain activities? If we are going to divide ourselves by region so that we can make the most of the time that we have and to avoid duplication of tasks.

Just to sum up, I believe that this map is very important, and this will be the base for many other activities that will be developing throughout the [inaudible] working group.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Aislan. Is that the end of your comment?

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO: Yes, that's all. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you for your participation. I fully agree with you. I believe that the working group is a reduced working group. So we need to take into account Dev and Jacqueline. Dev is not here with us, and he was not able to participate in our previous meeting. So in this case, his contribution would be required. And of course, Jacqueline was not able to attend this call, but I hope next time she will make it.

But for the time being, these are the people participating in the working group, so we are few people. We are four, and with Jacqueline, five. So we need to divide the activities among ourselves.

Now, I am speaking....

INTERPRETER: Interpreters apologize, but we are receiving audio and voices are overlapping.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: We're in the middle of a strange conversation. So please, I ask you to take this into account. We have some countries in our region that are within LACTLD. I know that there are some countries in our region related to other regions, for example, to the North American region. So we need to see if we are going to cover all the regions within our region, that is to say within LACRALO.

For example, Jamaica is one of the cases. We need to analyze this very deeply because I don't have very clear that on my mind, for example. Jamaica is the most clear case because I think it belongs to some other geographical region. So I think we need to analyze this deeply, and we will have to start working. The four of us, we need to start working together.

Aislan, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO: Sergio, an idea came to my mind. For us to make the most of our time and to save time as well and to start working at once, we need to focus on our [inaudible], and I think that we could develop and work in a collaborative way, for example, by contributing ideas regarding the region.

---

And at the same time, having a document posted on the Internet, for example, on the wiki page or Dropbox or Google Drive where we can use. Because we know that we will be updating this information, so we can have that information and that document where we can upload all the information and data relevant to us to start working on this map.

Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: So this would be created on the wiki. We would open a wiki page where we could start uploading information. The question is: are we going to upload information, any type of information, and then we will summarize or analyze that information? Or do you think that we should first create a roadmap to know what we are looking for?

I would name this document "ccTLD Map for LACRALO," for example. So we can create a research line. This would take us some time, but it would be more useful for us. So I think we should create a roadmap where we establish the items that we're going to research country-by-country, taking into account the countries that we have in the region.

I see two people wanting to take the floor, so Aislan you have the floor and then Aida.

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO: Sorry. I forgot to put my hand down, but I think we need to have a roadmap with our two ways or avenues to follow. Then we can start working on the map. But as you said before, we should work in a collaborative way because we know our countries very well.

---

But if we're going to find out or make a research in some other countries, we do not have that much information about those countries. So we need to focus on the topics that we will develop. So just to avoid wasting time, I think we need to establish the guidelines for our work as you suggested, Sergio.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Aislan. Aida, you have the floor.

AIDA NOBLIA: I agree with that. That's why I put my hand up. I think it is very important to define the guidelines to see what we are looking for or to have a kind of questionnaire, for example, on one hand to be able to work in a better way and on the other hand to be able to organize our work. I mean, to have very clear in our minds the objective and to organize the information that we will be collecting because this will be much clearer if we have some questionnaires or questions.

We also need to take into account the amount of countries. As Aislan said before, we ourselves in our countries, we have the knowledge of our countries. But, for example, I can't speak about Uruguay. For example, .uy belongs to Informatica Universitaria. They have some [contract] with the government, and I should investigate or research about this. But if we have certain questions, our work would be much easier.

Then we need to take into account how we're going to distribute the countries because we are a very small group. What are we're going to



---

do? Where are we're going to start? We need to get organized first in terms of the countries. That is to say, which is going to be the first country, for example? We need to start. But since our group is so small, we need to have a questionnaire, and that questionnaire would be the basis to start working.

This is my point of view. That's all. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Aida. I agree with you. In this wiki page that we will open, I can have a first approach and add information, and you will be adding some other information so that we can define the guidelines for our activity.

Perhaps, Aida, I may upload certain information and you, Aida, may believe that there is some other information that is important. For example, to know who the director or .uy is. I mean, we're not repeating the countries. We are not going to repeat that country, so at the very beginning, we will start with four or five countries. Then we will need to move forward.

I will try to speed up by requesting information to Eduardo Santoyo – I believe that he's still the chair of LACTLD – to see what kind of information they could send us, for example, statistics. This is something that would contribute to our work in the region.

Johnny has dropped. But I propose this: let's define the guidelines. Let's define a roadmap. Let's start adding information. I would like to ask

---

Silvia Vivanco whether we have our mailing list created, if we have our ccTLD Working Group mailing list ready.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Sergio, I cannot confirm that information right now. I think it is already created. I have requested that, so it should be created right now. But let's put this as an action item. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you, Silvia. Thank you very much. It is really important to have our mailing list so that we can set priorities, especially those things coming from LACRALO because we can classify the information. I suggest that we should have our mailing list as soon as possible so that we can start discussing and not using the LACRALO mailing list.

Aislan is typing a contribution. He says that we could start with the following questions: which is the managing body? How many domain names are registered? How many categories of domain names they have? What are the costs of the registration for the domain names? I would also add to this list of questions, for example, the date of creation, the background of the managing body.

This should be very deep research to see the evolution of that certain ccTLD in a certain country. If we have very clear in our minds the way – if we have clear in our minds how the different layers work, the deeper layers of the ccTLDs work, I think we will have a better and clearer understanding of the position and situations of domain names in each of the countries and also in terms of ICANN global policy.

---

Johnny, I don't see you on the AC room, but I know that you are connected to the call. Would you like to make any other comments?

JOHNNY LAUREANO: I would like to repeat what Aislan and Aida said before. We need to take into account the methodology first. We also need to deal with perhaps certain research methods so as to give our work a scientific value so we can make a research, create a document with a map of the ccTLDs in our region.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay.

JOHNNY LAUREANO: We need to collect information and, secondly, we need to create the questionnaire. Both activities could be started now so that people may contribute from their point of view. Or we could also ask which questions should be included in the questionnaire and which methodology we should follow so that people can make their contributions.

That's all, Sergio.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Johnny. I would like to call your attention on something. Can you hear me?

---

AIDA NOBLIA: Yes, Sergio. Go ahead, please.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: I would like to tell you that some hours ago – and even though this is not specifically related to the ccTLD, it is related to the policies in our region – some hours ago, Humberto Carrasco sent to the list certain considerations about .amazon.

There is a definition provided by ICANN, and I think that Humberto explains that definition very well. There is a point where he says that there is no international regulation applicable to the geographical regions [applying] by ICANN to reject these requests or this application.

The other comment has to do with the intellectual property. In case you have not read that information, I will post that information. I will post a link for you to read the letter by Stephen Crocker.

But even though .amazon is not related to the ccTLDs, it is related in terms of ICANN and the current issues being dealt by ICANN. I think we need to have our point of view about this for the future. I mean, I'm not saying that we should discuss this point here today, but I suggest that we should read this type of issues because we will probably have issues like this.

For example, not long ago, we dealt with the .patagonia, .cba. These were certain issues affecting territorial aspects. I'm not going to speak about .fk because this is something completely different. Of course, all these topics or all these issues have to do with our activities. Even

---

though they are not ccTLDs but they are gTLDs, we need to take into account ICANN's point of view in this regard.

Then we will discuss or debate if we agree or not with that position, but I think it is very important and interesting to understand the process to understand ICANN's mechanisms to analyze this type of geographical regions and this type of geographical issues. We need to understand how these things are solved.

Aida, I see your hand up. You have the floor. We are running out of time. We are getting the top of the hour.

AIDA NOBLIA:

Sergio, what you are saying, this topic's related to regional level. We know that ccTLDs have to do with regional aspects. This is something important from the Internet governance point of view because there is a conception of this global world beyond Internet.

I mean, we're talking about worldwide globalization and the importance that local issues have within global aspects. That's why we speak about "glocalization" because the "local" concept can affect or impact on "global" aspects. We're also discussing how local aspects may influence or may impact on Internet governance.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

That's a very good contribution, Aida. We're getting the top of the hour, but I would like to review the action items so that we agree on them.

---

Just to avoid to have the same problems that we had in our last call, please read the action items. Those who are connected to the AC room, please read the action items. I would like to ask Silvia to read them aloud for Johnny who is not connected to the AC room and for us to agree on them.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Action Item 1: To draft a ccTLD map for the region. Research work is required to determine the level of domain name governance.

Action Item 2: To open a Web page to upload information with a roadmap for research.

Action Item 3: Gisella Gruber will create a mailing list for the ccTLD Working Group.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you very much, Silvia. Is there anything which is missing? Anything that you would like to add to these action items?

AISLAN VARGAS BASILIO:

No.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

I see silence, so I will take that as that we agree on this action item. I would like to thank Susie Johnson and Silvia Vivanco and Gisella – I don't know if Gisella is in the call. But I would like to thank them for their work because they are always supporting us with our interpreters

---

because they always work. Today, they didn't have to interpret from our English-speaking participants.

Again, I thank you for your participation, and talk within a month. In May, I will send staff a request for a Doodle pool with different possible dates and times for our next call. Thank you very much, again.

JOHNNY LAUREANO:

Sergio, regardless our next meeting, we need to move forward with the map. So we might perhaps start reviewing information and the different contributions in the region.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Yes, that's right. We will start working on the wiki page. In fact, once we have the wiki page open, we will start uploading information. After that, in our next meeting within a month, we will meet again to analyze this information and to agree on our future actions.

Once again, thank you very much for your participation.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**